

THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT / THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK / ALBANY, NY 12234

TO:	Audits/Budget and Finance Committee
FROM:	Valerie Grey
SUBJECT:	Board of Regents Oversight – Financial Accountability
DATE:	February 24, 2011
STRATEGIC GOAL:	Goal 5

#### AUTHORIZATION(S):

#### SUMMARY

#### **Issues for Discussion**

The following topics will be discussed with the Members of the Committee on Audits/Budget and Finance:

- 1. Review of the Monthly Fiscal Report
- 2. Completed Audits (Attachment I)

#### Reason(s) for Consideration

Update on Activities

Proposed Handling

Discussion and Guidance

#### Procedural History

The information is provided to assist the Committee in carrying out its oversight responsibilities.

#### Background Information

1. <u>Review of the Monthly Fiscal Report</u> The Committee will be updated on the Department State Operations expenditure and revenue projections. 2. <u>Completed Audits</u>

The Committee is being presented with 20 audits this month. One of the audits examined the payment of health insurance at 20 school districts. A summary of the audits is attached. (Attachment I)

Audits are provided as follows:

Office of Audit Services

Developmental Disabilities Institute, Inc. Fredonia Central School District ARRA Audit Niagara Falls City School District ARRA Audit

Office of the State Comptroller

Beekmantown Central School District Clarkstown Central School District

Florida Union Free School District

Galway Central School District

Geneva City School District

Health Insurance for Retirees (Central Islip UFSD, Huntington UFSD, Ithaca CSD, Kenmore-Tonawanda UFSD, Lakeland CSD, Lindenhurst UFSD, Long Beach CSD, Mamaroneck UFSD, Massapequa UFSD, Port Washington UFSD, Ramapo CSD, Rochester CSD, Sachem CSD, Saratoga Springs CSD, Smithtown CSD, Somers CSD, South Country CSD, Washingtonville CSD, Westbury UFSD, Yonkers CSD)

Homer Central School District

Hoosic Valley Central School District

New York City Education Department: Non-Competitively Awarded Contracts Follow-up Report

Oriskany Central School District

**Riverhead Central School District** 

St. Francis De Sales School for the Deaf Follow-up Report

Solvay Union Free School District

Taconic Hills Central School District

Wyandanch Union Free School District

#### U.S. Department of Education

Kiryas Joel Village Union Free School District

#### New York City Office of the Comptroller

Monitoring of the School Food Safety Program by the Department of Education

#### Recommendation

For items one (Review of the Monthly Fiscal Report), and two (Completed Audits) no further action is recommended.

#### Timetable for Implementation

N/A

The following materials are attached:

• Summary of Audit Findings Including Audit Abstracts (Attachment I)

Audit	Procurement	Claims Processing	Cash	Financial Reporting	Information Technology	Budgeting	Conflict of Interest	Medicaid Revenue Enhancements	Post Employment Benefits	Other
Office of Audit Convises										
Office of Audit Services										
Developmental Disabilities Institute				N						1
* Fredonia Central School District (footnote 2)										N
* Niagara Falls City School District (footnote 2)										$\checkmark$
Office of the State Comptroller	-									
Beekmantown Central School District	$\checkmark$					$\checkmark$				
Central Islip Union Free School District									$\checkmark$	
Clarkstown Central School District	$\checkmark$									
Florida Union Free School District	$\checkmark$									
Galway Central School District	$\checkmark$									
Geneva City School District								$\checkmark$		
** Homer Central School District										
Hoosic Valley Central School District					$\checkmark$					
Huntington Union Free School District									$\checkmark$	
Ithaca City School District									$\checkmark$	
Kenmore-Tonawanda Union Free School District									$\checkmark$	
Lakeland Central School District									$\checkmark$	
Lindenhurst Union Free School District									$\checkmark$	
Long Beach City School District									$\checkmark$	

Audit	Procurement	Claims Processing	Cash	Financial Reporting	Information Technology	Budgeting	Conflict of Interest	Medicaid Revenue Enhancements	Post Employment Benefits	Other
Mamaroneck Union Free School District									$\checkmark$	
Massapequa Union Free School District										
New York City Department of Education: Non-Competitively Awarded Contracts Follow-up Report	$\checkmark$									
Oriskany Central School District										
Port Washington Union Free School District									$\checkmark$	
Ramapo Central School District									$\checkmark$	
** Riverhead Central School District										
Rochester City School District									$\checkmark$	
Sachem Central School District									$\checkmark$	
St. Francis De Sales School for the Deaf	$\checkmark$									
Saratoga Springs City School District									$\checkmark$	
Smithtown Central School District									$\checkmark$	
Solvay Union Free School District		$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$					
** Somers Central School District										
South Country Central School District									$\checkmark$	
Taconic Hills Central School District					$\checkmark$					
Washingtonville Central School District									$\checkmark$	
Westbury Union Free School District										
Wyandanch Union Free School District				$\checkmark$						
** Yonkers City School District										
New York City Office of the Comptroller										

Audit	Procurement	Claims Processing	Cash	Financial Reporting	Information Technology	Budgeting	Conflict of Interest	Medicaid Revenue Enhancements	Post Employment Benefits	Other
* New York City Department of Education – Monitoring of the School Food Safety Program (footnote 1)										$\checkmark$
U.S. Department of Education * Kiryas Joel Village Union Free School District (footnote 3)							$\checkmark$			
March 2011	6	2	1	2	3	1	1	1	18	4

1	Staff Training, Sanitation	

- my, 2. ARRA Funds
- 3. Title I Funds

\*\* No recommendations

The Department's Internal Audit Workgroup met to review each of the audits being presented this month. Letters will be sent to all of the auditees reminding them of the requirement to submit a corrective action plan.

	Office of Audit Services							
Audit	Major Finding(s)	Recommendation/Response						
Developmental Disabilities Institute Audit Approved Persuant to Education Law Section 4410 CA-0305-01 10th Judicial District	It was determined that the School's net reimbursable expenses for the 4410 Preschool Program for the year ended June 30, 2002 were overstated by \$1,523,041 on the Consolidated Fiscal Report (CFR). The overstated expenses were primarily due to erroneously allocated salary expenses that are not supported by services provided to the preschool program, expenses that are not sufficiently evidenced by supporting documentation, and administrative expenses that are not considered reimbursable by the Department.	<b>18 recommendations</b> The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding compliance with laws, regulations, contracts and CFR reporting provisions, as well as internal controls over purchasing and						
	The School also did not always provide all required therapies to students, progress reports were not always contained in the students' files, and the School therapist's files did not always contain required certification. Further, the School does not maintain proper controls over purchasing, accounts payable, petty cash, and accounts receivable functions. Payroll duties are not properly segregated and outstanding payroll checks are not properly investigated.	payroll. The School disagreed with the majority of the recommendations because they felt that the auditors' calculations and methodology were inaccurate and an unreasonable basis for distributing staff. The School also feels that the time in which the County chose to conduct the audit was representative of the operations of the programs because they were going through reorganization under bankruptcy protection.						
		The Rate Setting Unit will use the results of the audit to establish						

		audited tuition rates.
Fredonia Central School District Use of American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) Funds ARRA-0710-19 8th Judicial District	The District did not separately account for Education Stabilization Fund (ESF) expenditures in its accounting system, nor did they establish separate ESF expenditure codes in the General Fund. Personal service costs incurred were also not tracked separately in the accounting system. Personnel activity reports were also not prepared for four employees whose salaries were being partially paid for with ARRA Title I funding.	<b>4 recommendations</b> The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding ESF expenditure codes, personnel activity reports, procedures for federal requirements, and accurately reporting positions saved or created.
	The District did not have a process in place for ensuring compliance with federal requirements pertaining to minimizing time elapsing between receipt and disbursement of funds, and remitting interest earned on federal funds in excess of \$100 annually.	The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
	Finally, the District's ESF Program Narrative and Summary Report for June 30, 2010 showed that 20 positions were saved or created; however, District records and their Supplemental Application indicated that 26 positions were saved or created. In addition, the ARRA-Title I Program Narrative and Summary Report for June 30, 2010 reported that 4 positions were saved or created, but District records show .75 of a position was saved or created.	
Niagara Falls City	The District did not prepare semi-annual payroll certifications	4 recommendations
School District Use of American	for four employees whose salaries were being paid for with ARRA-IDEA 611. In addition, personnel activity reports were	The report's recommendations
Recovery and	not prepared for three employees; one was partially paid from	focused on strengthening the

ments, and supporting ate. <i>with the</i> ted that they e action.
esponse
s focused
nening the
s regarding
ire policies,
lance, using
e to benefit
employee
reserve.
with the
and has I implement

	rather than the reserve fund for that purpose, which means this money was not spent to benefit taxpayers. Finally, one employee was directly responsible for all phases of the transportation State aid process with no oversight. As a	
	result, two buses that were purchased during the 2007-08 fiscal year were not properly reported to the Department for approval.	
Clarkstown Central School District Legal Service Costs 2010M-168 9th Judicial District	The District has contracts with two separate legal firms, one as general counsel and one as counsel for labor relations, thus there is the potential for duplication of services in the terms and conditions stated in the two contracts. Neither contract was specific as to which type of labor relations each counsel would handle.	<b>3 recommendations</b> The recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding legal service providers, analyzing counsel needs to determine what legal services are needed, and obtaining proposals for legal services. <i>The District agreed with the</i> <i>recommendations and has</i> <i>indicated that they will implement</i> <i>corrective action.</i>
Florida Union Free School District	The board of education appointed a claims auditor to audit and approve claims prior to payment. However, the claims	4 recommendations
Internal Controls Over	auditor did not always perform an adequate review, and she	The report's recommendations
Claims Auditing and Contractual	did not always compare invoices to contracts or bid documents.	focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding
Expenditures		the claims auditor, competitive
2010M-226	Seven out of ten vendors who received payments totaling	bidding, and sufficient
9th Judicial District	\$22,471 were reviewed to determine if the District sought	documentation for invoices.

	competition when purchasing from these vendors. The District did not seek competition for two of the seven vendors who received payments totaling \$81,828. Further, the District does not have sufficient information to determine whether the invoices for one of the remaining five vendors, who received \$23,310 in payments, matched the bid prices because the invoices were not sufficiently itemized.	The District has agreed with the recommendations and is in the process of implementing corrective action.
Galway Central School District Internal Controls Over Purchasing 2010M-171 4th Judicial District	The board of education adopted written purchasing policies and procedures outlining the purchasing process, including the procurement of goods and services. However, the policy did not require bid and quote documentation to be attached to the purchase orders for purchases under the bid threshold. District officials also did not always follow the board-adopted policies. As a result, over \$383,000 in purchases were either not properly reviewed, did not contain sufficient documentation, or were not properly audited.	<b>5 recommendations</b> The recommendations focused primarily on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding purchasing policies and procedures, and bid and quote documentation. The District agreed with the recommendations and has agreed to implement corrective action.
Geneva City School District Internal Controls Over Medicaid Reimbursement 2010M-152 7th Judicial District	The District is not properly processing its claims for Medicaid reimbursement. In the 2008-09 fiscal year, the District did not claim an estimated \$175,064 in potential Medicaid reimbursements for IEP-related services, Targeted Case Management (TCM), and TCM ongoing service coordination.	4 recommendations

		Medicaid reimbursement.
		The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Homer Central School District Software Cost Savings and the Composting Programs' Environmental Impact 2010M-190 6th Judicial District	The District realized cost savings of \$47,000 by using their free e-mail application instead of upgrading their old e-mail system. Further, District officials implemented a composting program at their intermediate school with grades three through six in the fall of 2009. As a result, the District now saves about \$1,500 annually through a reduction in tipping fees and the purchase of garbage bags.	There were no recommendations.
Hoosic Valley Central School District Internal Controls Over Information Technology 2010M-160 3rd Judicial District	There was an inadequate segregation of duties within the business office because the purchasing agent served as the system administrator for the automated financial accounting software. Additionally, the treasurer, senior account clerk, and business administrator, had full access rights to the computer system. The District's audit logs also contained insufficient information and they were not reviewed by District officials.	<b>6 recommendations</b> The recommendations focused on strengthening policies and procedures regarding the segregation of duties in the business office, and IT security.
	Further, District officials have not performed a risk assessment to determine where IT risks exist. They also have not developed and implemented security awareness training to inform employees about District policies and standards. There were also areas concerning access controls in need of improvement.	The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they plan to implement corrective action.

New York City	An initial report was conducted in May 2009 to determine	The recommendation that has only
Department of	whether the NYCDOE complied with applicable procurement	been partially implemented
Education (NYCDOE)	requirements when awarding non-competitively bid contracts.	pertained to the maintenance of
Non-Competitively	The NYCDOE was revisited in September 2010 to assess the	meeting minutes.
Awarded Contracts	extent of implementation of the recommendations from the	meeting minutes.
	initial report.	The remainder of the
Follow-Up Report 2010-F-26		recommendations have been fully
	It was determined that the NVCDOE has made significant	5
1st, 2nd, 11th, 12th, 12th, Judicial District	It was determined that the NYCDOE has made significant	implemented.
13th Judicial District	progress in correcting the problems identified in the initial	
	report. Of the six prior recommendations, five have been fully	
	implemented, and one has been partially implemented.	
Health Insurance for	Description the supplumentation and limitations in the districts?	2 recommendations
Retirees - Limiting the	Based on the weaknesses and limitations in the districts'	(00 magazing dations for 00
Costs of Providing	monitoring of the continuing eligibility retirees and their	(22 recommendations for 20
Benefits	dependent spouses, computer-assisted techniques were used	districts)
2010-MS-10	to compare the names of 22,422 retirees and dependents	
	whose health insurance benefits were paid by the 20 districts	It was recommended that the
Central Islip Union Free	to the records in the Death Master File (DMF), which is	Districts effectively monitor the
School District (S9-10-	maintained by the Social Security Administration (SSA). The	status of all retirees who receive
40), Huntington Union	tests showed that 10 districts had paid health insurance	health coverage, as well as
Free School District	premiums for only 27 ineligible individuals, including 18	adequately maintain their
(S9-10-29), Ithaca City	retirees, eight dependents, and one surviving spouse. These	information (such as social security
School District (S9-10-	10 school districts paid a total of \$238,795 for deceased	numbers, etc), which can be used
24), Kenmore-	retirees' and dependents' insurance coverage, or less than	to ensure eligibility for coverage.
Tonawanda Union Free	four hundredths of a percent of the \$693 million paid to health	_
School District (S9-10-	insurance providers for their current and retired employees.	Sixteen responses were received
43), Lakeland Central		back from the 20 Districts, and they
School District (S9-10-	The ten districts were provided with a list of all individuals who	were all in agreement with the
28), Lindenhurst Union	were deceased and still receiving insurance coverage. Each	recommendations and have
Free School District	of these districts took steps to recoup the payments made.	indicated that they will implement

(S9-10-30), Long Beach	Nine of the ten districts have been subsequently reimbursed	corrective action.
City School District (S9-	by the insurance providers for a portion or all of the payments	
10-36), Mamaroneck	made on behalf of these individuals. Of the \$238,795 paid on	
Union Free School	behalf of deceased retirees and/or their ineligible dependents,	
District (S9-10-33),	the nine districts have recouped a total of \$117,556.	
Massapequa Union Free		
School District (S9-10-		
35), Port Washington		
Union Free School		
District (S9-10-38),		
Ramapo Central School		
District (S9-10-39),		
<b>Rochester City School</b>		
District (S9-10-26),		
Sachem Central School		
District (S9-10-34),		
Saratoga Springs City		
School District (S9-10-		
25), Smithtown Central		
School District (S9-10-		
37), Somers Central		
School District (S9-10-		
41) South Country		
Central School District		
(S9-10-42),		
Washingtonville Central		
School District (S9-10-		
27), Westbury Union		
Free School District		
(S9-10-31), Yonkers City		

School District (S9-10-32)		
4th,6th, 7th, 8th, 9th, and 10th Judicial Districts		
Oriskany Central School District Internal Controls Over Cash Disbursements 2010M-211 5th Judicial District	There were weaknesses in internal controls over cash disbursements which increase the risk of errors and improper payments. The treasurer does not supervise the check- signing process and does not perform a thorough review of bank statements. District officials also do not receive and review change reports, which would provide a compensating control.	<b>5 recommendations</b> The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding the cash disbursement process, the treasurer's duties, and the verification of cancelled checks and bank statements. The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they plan to
Riverhead Central School District Internal Controls Over Payroll 2010M-179 10th Judicial District	District controls over payroll are appropriately designed and operating effectively to adequately safeguard District assets.	implement corrective action. There were no recommendations.

St. Francis De Sales School for the Deaf Selected Financial Management Practices Follow-Up Report 2010-F-40 2nd Judicial District	An initial report of the School was conducted in September 2009, which examined the system of controls over procurement, cash disbursements, and payroll. The School was revisited in September 2010 to assess the extent of implementation of the 13 recommendations included in the initial report. It was determined that the School has made significant progress in correcting the issues that were identified in the initial report. Of the 13 prior recommendations, 10 were fully implemented, two were partially implemented, and one has not been implemented.	The recommendation that has not been implemented regarded Department guidance for competitive procurements for goods and services. The recommendations that have only been partially implemented were those concerning the revision of board of education by-laws, and monitoring the School's compliance with Department guidance.
		The remainder of the recommendations have been fully implemented.
Solvay Union Free School District Internal Controls Over the Claims Audit Function and Information Technology 2010M-198 5th Judicial District	The board of education did not appoint a claims auditor in accordance with Department regulations. Instead, the board appointed the Onondaga-Cortland-Madison (OCM) BOCES Central Business Office to serve as the District's claims auditor for the 2008-09 and 2009-10 fiscal years. This arrangement is specifically prohibited by the Department. The board also appointed a District employee as deputy claims auditor to audit District claims payable to OCM BOCES.	<b>6 recommendations</b> The recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding the appointment of a claims auditor according to Department regulations, and access to the District's financial software.
	Further, the board has not adopted comprehensive policies and procedures to ensure that access to the District's financial software is restricted to only those functions required by individual employees' job duties.	The District agreed with the recommendations and agreed to implement corrective action.

Taconic Hills Central School District Internal Controls Over Information Technology 2010M-202 3rd Judicial District	District officials have not established adequate internal controls to effectively safeguard the District's computer system and data. The District has not established breach notification or disaster recovery policies. It also does not have effective policies and procedures in place regarding remote access, and there is inadequate security for its server and wiring closets.	<b>5 recommendations</b> The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding the District's computer system and data, including a disaster recovery plan, access to IT equipment and financial computer data.
		The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Wyandanch Union Free	District officials inaccurately calculated and reported the	3 recommendations
School District	District's liability for compensated absences, which resulted in	
Financial Condition	overstated general fund deficits.	The recommendations focused
2010M-197		primarily on strengthening the
10th Judicial District	Further, the District's 2007-08 and 2008-09 budgets knowingly did not include accurate State aid revenue estimates. The District also did not prepare a budget of revenues anticipated for the school lunch fund, and as a result, the District has an ongoing deficit in its school lunch	policies and procedures regarding compensated absences liability reporting, budgets, and the school lunch fund deficit.
	fund.	The District agreed with the
		recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.

U.S. Department of Education		
Audit	Major Finding(s)	Recommendation/Response
Kiryas Joel Village	\$276,443 adjustment	5 recommendations
Union Free School		
District	Generally, the District's Title I and IDEA expenditures were	It is recommended that the
Title I, Part A of the	allowable and allocable in accordance with applicable	Department instruct the District to
Elementary and	regulations. However, Kiryas Joel did use Title I funds to	return the \$276,443 in unallowable
Secondary Education	supplant non-federal funds for lease payments related to its	Title I funds to the U.S. Department
Act, as amended and	public school building. In addition, Kiryas Joel could not	
Individuals with	provide adequate documentation to support \$191,124 in Title	use of Title I funds for the UTA of
Disabilities Education	I payroll charges.	KJSC, Inc., and that federal
Act Part B Expenditures		requirements related to conflicts of
ED-OIG/A02K0003		interest are adhered to.
9th Judicial District		It is also recommended that the District provide support for the Title I salary expenditures or return funds to the U.S. Department of Education, as well as establish a time and effort policy to require that overtime hours for federal programs are properly documented.
		The Department generally agreed with the findings and stated that they will implement corrective action.

New York City Office of the Comptroller		
Audit	Major Finding(s)	Recommendation/Response
New York City	Overall, with some exceptions, the NYCDOE's monitoring of	11 recommendations
Department of	the food safety practices at schools is adequate. With the	
Education (NYCDOE)	exception of one school that did not receive a Quality	The recommendations focused on
Audit Report on the	Assurance Specialist (QAS) inspection, all applicable schools	strengthening the policies and
Monitoring of the	received the required Hazard Analysis and Critical Control	procedures regarding mandatory
School Food Safety	Points (HACCP) and Quality Assurance Specialist (QAS)	training for kitchen personnel,
Program by the	inspections.	reporting conditions needing
Department of		correction, placement of first-aid
Education	The NYCDOE does not ensure that all of its School Food	posters, the uniform policy, and
MD10-102A	kitchen employees receive the required training in a timely	oversight inspections.
1st, 2nd, 11th, 12th,	manner. There were also sanitation-related deficiencies at 5	
13th Judicial District	of the 15 sampled schools that were visited. They were also	NYCDOE officials agreed with the
	lacking or obstructed choking first-aid posters and instances	recommendations and indicated
	of employees' non-adherence to NYCDOE's uniform policy.	that they will implement corrective
		action.