



TO: P-12 Education Committee

FROM: Angelique Johnson-Dingle *Angelique Johnson-Dingle*

SUBJECT: Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents

DATE: April 25, 2024

AUTHORIZATION(S): *Beth A. Johnson*

SUMMARY

Issue for Decision

Should the Board of Regents approve the proposed renewal charters for the following charter schools authorized by the Board of Regents pursuant to Article 56 of the Education Law (the New York Charter Schools Act):

- **AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation** (Five-year renewal and revision to (1) increase the school's grade span from its current Grade 9 through Grade 12 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to the school's authorized enrollment from 500 students to 875 students by year four of the renewal charter term, and (2) amend the school's Key Design Elements);
- **American Dream Charter School** (Five-year renewal);
- **Bold Charter School** (Five-year renewal and a revision to increase the school's grade span from its current kindergarten through Grade 5 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to the school's authorized enrollment from 480 students to 700 students by year five of the renewal charter term);
- **Bronx Arts and Science Charter School** (Five-year renewal and a revision to increase the school's grade span from its current kindergarten through Grade 5 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to the school's authorized enrollment from 360 students to 621 students);
- **Creo College Preparatory Charter School** (Five-year renewal);

- **Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology** (Three-year renewal);
- **Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx** (Five-year renewal and a revision to increase the school's grade span from its current kindergarten through Grade 5 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to the school's authorized enrollment from 410 students to 620 students);
- **Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts** (Five-year renewal); and
- **South Bronx Classical Charter School** (Five-year renewal).

Reason(s) for Consideration

Required by State statute.

Proposed Handling

This issue will come before the P-12 Education Committee for recommendation to the Full Board for action at the May 2024 meeting.

Procedural History

The New York State Education Department (NYSED or "the Department") made the renewal recommendations being presented to the Board of Regents for approval and issuance as required by Article 56 of the Education Law and 8 NYCRR §119.7.

Background Information

The Board of Regents and the Department are bound by law, regulation, and Regents-endorsed policies regarding the criteria that can be considered in decision-making pertaining to the authorization of new charter schools, charter school renewals, and charter school revisions. Detailed information on these laws, regulations, and Regents-endorsed policies can be found in the Appendix. For each school, a link to the school's *Renewal Visit Report*, which provides detailed information on the school's assessment results and status in relation to each Performance Benchmark can be found in each school's Table 1.

Related Regents Items

November 2012: [Board of Regents Charter School Renewal Policy](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2012Meetings/November2012/1112p12a1.pdf)
(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2012Meetings/November2012/1112p12a1.pdf>)

September 2018: [Charter School Performance Framework](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/sites/regents/files/918p12a7.pdf)
(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/sites/regents/files/918p12a7.pdf>)

AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation

November 2018: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/1118p12a1.pdf>)

May 2020: [Charter Schools: Merger Revisions to Charters Authorized by the New York City Department of Education Chancellor](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/520bra6.pdf>)

American Dream Charter School

December 2013: [Initial Applications and Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/1213p12a2%5B1%5D.pdf>)

March 2017: [Revisions to Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/317p12a5.pdf>)

March 2019: [Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/319p12a1.pdf>)

March 2021: [Revision Recommendation for a Charter School Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/321p12a5.pdf>)

June 2022: [Revision Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/622p12a8.pdf>)

Bold Charter School

June 2018: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/618p12a3.pdf>)

Bronx Arts and Science Charter School

November 2018: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/1118p12a1.pdf>)

April 2023: [Revisions to Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/sites/regents/files/423p12a3.pdf>)

Creo College Preparatory Charter School

June 2018: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/618p12a3.pdf>)

Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology

November 2015: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications and Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/1115p12a2.pdf>)

February 2022: [Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/222p12a1REVISED.pdf>)

Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx

November 2017: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/1117p12a2.pdf>)

Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts

December 2013: [Charter Schools: Initial Applications and Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/1213p12a2%5B1%5D.pdf>)

June 2014: [Revision to Charter Authorized by the Board of Regents: Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/614p12a3.pdf>)

March 2019: [Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/419p12a1.pdf>)

March 2021: [Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/321p12a6revised.pdf>)

May 2023: [Revision to Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/sites/regents/files/523p12a1.pdf>)

South Bronx Classical Charter School

December 2005: [Charter School Applications and Proposed Charters](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2005Meetings/December2005/1205emscvesida5.htm>)

January 2011: [Charter Schools: Renewal of Charters Authorized by the Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education \(NYCDOE\)](#)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2011Meetings/January2011/111p12a2.pdf>)

February 2012: [Charter Schools: Revision to Charter Authorized by the Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education \(NYCDOE\)](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2012Meetings/February2012/212p12a1.pdf)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2012Meetings/February2012/212p12a1.pdf>)

May 2015: [Charter Schools: Charter Renewal Recommendations for Charters Authorized by the Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education \(NYCDOE\)](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/May%202015/515p12a1.pdf)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/May%202015/515p12a1.pdf>)

April 2016: [Charter Schools: Merger Revision to Charters Authorized by the Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education \(NYCDOE\)](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/416p12a3.pdf)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/416p12a3.pdf>)

March 2017: [Revision to Charters Authorized by the Board of Regents](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/317p12a5.pdf)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/317p12a5.pdf>)

May 2019: [Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the Board of Regents](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/519p12a4.pdf)

(<https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/519p12a4.pdf>)

Recommendation

It is recommended that the Board of Regents take the following action:

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **American Dream Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **American Dream Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **Bold Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **Bold Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **Bronx Arts and Science Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **Bronx Arts and Science Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **Creo College Preparatory Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **Creo College Preparatory Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2027**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that **South Bronx Classical Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law, and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of Section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of **South Bronx Classical Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2029**.

Timetable for Implementation

The Regents action for the above-named charter schools will become effective immediately.

AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation (AECI II)
Board Chair	Carlo Schiattarella
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) 9 ¹
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2019
Charter Term	Initial Charter Term: September 3, 2019 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facilities	116 E.169 th Street, Bronx, NY 10452 - Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	AECI II offers its students a strong foundation in computer science by providing four years of core computer classes and opportunities for computer electives as well. Courses range from Microsoft Applications to Python Coding, Game Design to Robotics, and others. Students are also given a chance to earn certification for some of the computer applications. This provides them with strong skills as well as credentials for their college applications or resumes.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/aeci-ii-nyc-charter-high-school-computer-engineering-and-innovation (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	Grade 9	Grades 9-10	Grades 9-11	Grades 9-12	Grades 9-12
Total Approved Enrollment	125	249	375	500	500

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024-2025	Year 2 2025-2026	Year 3 2026-2027	Year 4 2027-2028	Year 5 2028-2029
Grade Configuration	Grades 9-12	Grades 6, 9-12	Grades 6-7, 9-12	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12
Total Proposed Enrollment	500	625	750	875	875

¹ Twenty-eight percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal and Revisions Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term and revision described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• AECI II exceeded the New York State (NYS) proficiency rates for Aggregate and Subgroup 4-Year Cohort Regents testing outcomes.• In 2023, AECI II graduated its first cohort with an August 4-year graduation rate of 94 percent, +8 percentage points above NYS. Each subgroup also exceeds the corresponding NYS rate, +19, +26, and +11, respectively, for students with disabilities (SWD), English language learners (ELL), and economically disadvantaged (ED) students.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Enrollment rates of the SWD and ELL subgroups are slightly below the district of location (DOL), and retention rates in the aggregate and for all three subgroups are below the DOL.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2015 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings²
AECI II: NYC Charter High School for Computer Engineering and Innovation

2015 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic trends toward proficiency, proficiency and high school graduation. At all grade levels and all assessments, scoring proficiently means achieving a performance level of 3 or higher (high school Regents and Common Core Regents exam score of 65 or higher).	Meets
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to the New York State Learning Standards (NYSLS) for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a safe and respectful learning environment. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

² Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: N/A
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Material Revisions:

The school is seeking approval of the following material revisions to the charter to:

- Increase the current Grade 9 through Grade 12 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to its authorized enrollment from 500 students to 875 students by year four of the renewal charter term.

- Amend the Key Design Elements (KDE)

From:

- Computer Engineering and Innovation;
- Strong Academic Foundations;
- Instructional Excellence;
- Project-based Learning Classrooms;
- Support for the Whole Student;
- Development of Young Professionals with Core Values;
- Intensive College Readiness Preparation;
- Data-Informed Teaching & Learning; Distributed Leadership; and
- A Positive Culture of High Expectations and Mutual Respect.

To:

- Teaching and Learning;
- Supportive Environment for Student Growth & Development;
- Culture, Climate, and Family Engagement;
- College and Career Readiness;
- Support for Diversified Learners; and
- Organizational Capacity.

Approving the grade expansion revision request will result in a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school because students will develop a stronger foundation in computer science concepts and skills as well as experience in project-based learning at a younger age. This will help students develop the skills necessary to be successful at the high school.

Approving the KDE revision request is likely to improve student learning and achievement because the revised KDE are more understandable and help align them with the other school in the AECI Network.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on November 2, 2023. Nine people attended. No one spoke.

The school provided evidence of community support for the grade expansion recommendation through the following ways:

- The school provided to the NYSED Charter School Office (CSO) letters from 14 current students, and

- A petition signed by more than 35 parents.

Please note that for all charter school revisions, the school was required to conduct community engagement prior to submitting the revision request.

American Dream Charter School

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	American Dream Charter School
Board Chair	Luz Maria Rojas
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) 7 ³
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2014
Charter Terms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Charter Term: August 25, 2014 - June 30, 2019 • First Renewal Term: July 1, 2019 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Middle School: 510 E. 141st Street, 4 Fl, Bronx, NY 10454 – Public Space • High School: 403 Concord Avenue, Bronx, NY 10454 – Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dual language school • As of June 2023, more than 77 percent of graduating seniors earned the Seal of Biliteracy and 100 percent earned the Seal of Civic Readiness. • The school was recognized by the College Board with a 2023 AP Access Award which honors schools that encourage more low-income and underrepresented minority students to take AP Courses.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/american-dream-charter-school (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	Grades 6-11	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12
Total Approved Enrollment	490	600	600	600	600

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024 to 2025	Year 2 2025 to 2026	Year 3 2026 to 2027	Year 4 2027 to 2028	Year 5 2028 to 2029
Grade Configuration	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12	Grades 6-12
Total Recommended Enrollment	600	600	600	600	600

³ Thirty-eight percent of students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term (and revisions) described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The school has closely approached or exceeded NYS graduation rates for the past three years.• The school has exceeded the DOL for aggregate school level proficiency on the New York State Testing Program (NYSTP) assessments in English language arts (ELA), math, and science.• The school is fully enrolled and exceeds the DOL for enrollment of ELLs and EDs at +12 and +4 percentage points, respectively. Throughout the charter term, the school has exceeded the DOL for retention of all students and subgroups.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The school has underperformed on the NYSTP assessments relative to New York State proficiency rates.• The school has under-enrolled SWD.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2019 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings⁴
American Dream Charter School

2019 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic proficiency, trends toward proficiency, similar schools, college and career readiness, and high school graduation, if applicable. Proficiency at the elementary/middle school level shall be defined as achieving a performance level of 3 or higher on Grade 3-8 state assessments in ELA, math, and science. At the high school level, passing shall be defined as obtaining a Regents exam score of 65 or higher.	Approaches
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school implements research-based practices and has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to New York State Learning Standards for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Student and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a positive, safe, and respectful learning environment that prepares all students for college and career. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students. High schools are meeting persistence rates commensurate with the NYSED target.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

⁴ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: In February 2020, the NYSED CSO issued a Notice of Concern based on the school exceeding the permissible number of uncertified teachers. The school has satisfactorily addressed this issue and is currently in compliance.
- Year 2: In May 2021, the NYSED CSO issued a Notice of Deficiency and a request for a Corrective Action Plan (CAP) to address under-enrollment of students with disabilities. The CAP was implemented, a weighted enrollment preference for students with disabilities was added to their lottery, and targeted recruitment efforts are ongoing.
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on October 30, 2023. Ninety-one people attended, and 20 spoke. Twenty were in favor of the renewal, and no one was opposed.

The school provided evidence of community support for this renewal recommendation through the following ways:

- NYSED CSO received 10 letters of support from charter school leaders in Bronx, Queens, and Manhattan.

Bold Charter School

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Bold Charter School (Bold)
Board Chair	Mr. Raymond Joseph
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) 8 ⁵
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2019
Charter Term	Initial Charter Term: August 14, 2019 – June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lower Campus K-1: 1093 Southern Blvd. Bronx, NY 10459 - Private Space • Upper Campus 2-5: 1090 Close Ave. Bronx, NY 10472 - Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	Bold prioritizes thoughtful innovation in all aspects of the school’s design. Bold is committed to thinking beyond traditional structures when executing its key design elements and to thinking beyond typical solutions when addressing any challenges that arise. This commitment to innovation helps the school deliver on its mission and ensure extraordinary academic and personal outcomes for students.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/bold-charter-school (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 1	K - Grade 2	K - Grade 3	K - Grade 4	K - Grade 5
Total Approved Enrollment	120	210	300	390	480

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024-2025	Year 2 2025-2026	Year 3 2026-2027	Year 4 2027-2028	Year 5 2028-2029
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 7	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8
Total Recommended Enrollment	500	580	660	680	700

⁵ Twenty-four percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal and Revisions Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term (and revisions) described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • With consistent leadership since its start, Bold displays strong assessment results across all student subgroups. • Student learning is enhanced by high-quality curricular choices and data-informed modifications to programming, as needed. • Bold has developed robust and multifaceted feedback structures for teachers, demonstrating their increasing organizational capacity. • Bold Charter School has extremely strong State assessment results and has rates of proficiency in ELA and math that exceed both NYS and the DOL in the aggregate and for ED, ELL, and SWD. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bold was at 84 percent of its contracted enrollment in 2022-2023. • Bold has two locations, which presents logistical challenges for both staff and families. Some parents have children attending both locations.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2015 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings⁶
Bold Charter School

2015 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic trends toward proficiency, proficiency and high school graduation. At all grade levels and all assessments, scoring proficiently means achieving a performance level of 3 or higher (high school Regents and Common Core Regents exam score of 65 or higher).	Meets
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to the New York State Learning Standards (NYSLS) for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a safe and respectful learning environment. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

⁶ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: On May 3, 2021, the NYSED CSO issued a Notice of failing to enroll a comparable number of ELL when compared to the DOL (minus four percentage points) and for having four uncategorized uncertified teachers. Both issues have been addressed and are no longer an area of concern.
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Material Revisions:

The school is seeking approval of the following material revisions to the charter.

- Amend its grade span from the school's current kindergarten through Grade 5 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to the school's authorized enrollment from 480 students to 700 students by year five of the renewal charter term.

Bold retains a higher percentage of students and families each year compared to its local districts. Bold backfills open seats at all grade levels, and, if approved to expand its number of seats and grades, would be able to meet the demand of non-Bold families who currently sit on Bold's waitlist. As of August 2023, Bold had 142 students on its waitlist for the 2023-2024 school year. Approving these revision requests will result in a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school because it will provide a higher-quality middle school option than what is currently available.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on November 1, 2023. Sixty-nine people attended, and 16 spoke. Sixteen were in favor of the renewal and revisions. No one was opposed.

The school provided evidence of community support for this renewal and revisions recommendation by sending the NYSED CSO 32 letters of support from families and community members.

Please note that for all charter school revisions, the school was required to conduct extensive community engagement prior to submitting the revision request.

Bronx Arts and Science Charter School

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Bronx Arts and Science Charter School (BASCS)
Board Chair	Adaline Walker Santiago
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) 8 ⁷
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2019
Charter Term	Initial Charter: August 26, 2019 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	iLearn Schools (iLearn)
Facilities	925 Hutchinson River Parkway, Bronx, NY 10465 - Public Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	BASCS and iLearn believe that every scholar deserves a high-quality STEAM-based education regardless of race, gender, sexual orientation, ability status, language spoken, socio-economic status, faith, or zip code. As such it is the policy of BASCS to provide every scholar with equal and bias-free access to all school facilities, courses, programs, activity and services to give them maximum opportunity to achieve their potential.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/bronx-arts-and-science-charter-school (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 2	K - Grade 3	K - Grade 4	K - Grade 5	K - Grade 5
Total Approved Enrollment	207	249	318	360	360

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024 to 2025	Year 2 2025 to 2026	Year 3 2026 to 2027	Year 4 2027 to 2028	Year 5 2028 to 2029
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 7	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8
Total Recommended Enrollment	483	552	621	621	621

⁷ Twenty-four percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal and Revisions Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term (and revisions) described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • From 2022 to 2023, BASCS improved academic outcomes for its students from 13 percent to 40 percent proficient on the NYSTP 3-8 Assessments for ELA, and the school is currently plus five percentage points above the DOL, NYC CSD 8. Math proficiency also improved from seven percent to 37 percent and the school is now one percentage point below the DOL. Additionally, 48 percent of students are trending toward or maintaining proficiency in ELA and 57 percent are doing the same in math. • The school has improved its iLearn School coaching process. • Implemented a schoolwide Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports (PBIS) program, resulting in improved classroom culture, and family engagement. • Addressing operational deficiencies regarding ELL policy and procedures, and fingerprint clearance issues. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The school underperforms the State’s proficiency rate for all subjects and groups with the exception of ELA for ELL and ED. • According to the Similar Schools metric, the school is underperforming academically compared to schools with similar grade bands and subgroup enrollment. • The school has under enrolled SWD, ELL, and ED students when compared to the DOL in every year of the school's operation; and • The school's retention rates for all groups are below the DOL.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2015 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings⁸
Bronx Arts and Science Charter School

2015 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic trends toward proficiency, proficiency and high school graduation. At all grade levels and all assessments, scoring proficiently means achieving a performance level of 3 or higher (high school Regents and Common Core Regents exam score of 65 or higher).	Approaches
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to the New York State Learning Standards (NYSLS) for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a safe and respectful learning environment. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

⁸ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: The NYSED CSO issued a Notice of Deficiency on March 22, 2021, based on identification and placement of ELL. The school has satisfactorily addressed this issue.
 - The NYSED CSO issued a Notice of Deficiency on May 4, 2021, based on NYSED’s Office of School Personnel Review and Accountability (OSPRA) fingerprint clearance procedures and compliance. The school has satisfactorily addressed this issue.
 - The NYSED CSO issued a Notice of Concern on May 3, 2021, for failing to enroll a comparable number of ELL and SWD to the DOL. This remains an area of concern.
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Material Revisions:

The school is seeking approval of the following material revisions to the charter:

- Amend the school’s grade span from its current K through Grade 5 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to the school’s authorized enrollment from 360 students to 621 students.

Approving these revision requests are likely to improve student learning and achievement by providing a continuous and enriching educational pathway, accommodating students as they transition from elementary to middle school.

Approving these revision requests will result in a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school because the expansion to include middle school grades aligns with the school's vision for a seamless educational journey that nurtures and challenges students from kindergarten through eighth grade.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on October 30, 2023. Forty-two people attended, and seven spoke in favor of the renewal and revisions. No one was opposed.

The school provided evidence of community support for these revisions by sending the NYSED CSO 207 letters of support and emails from members of the board, parents, the Bronx Community Board 10, the South Asian TV Channel, and local business owners.

Please note that for all charter school revisions, the school was required to conduct extensive community engagement prior to submitting the revision request.

Creo College Preparatory Charter School

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Creo College Preparatory Charter School (Creo)
Board Chair	Ms. Laura Reyes
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) ⁹
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2019
Charter Term	Initial Charter Term: August 28, 2019 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facilities	524 Courtlandt Ave, Bronx, NY 10451 - Private
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	As of 2022-2023, Creo had completed its planned growth and serves students in Grades 5 through 8. In 2022-2023 the ‘founding cohort’ of 8 th graders scored 70 percent proficient in ELA and 72 percent in math, exceeding NYS by +14 and +29 percentage points, respectively.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/creo-college-preparatory-charter-school (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	Grade 5	Grades 5-6	Grades 5-7	Grades 5-8	Grades 5-8
Total Approved Enrollment	96	192	288	384	480

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment*

	Year 1 2024-2025	Year 2 2025-2026	Year 3 2026-2027	Year 4 2027-2028	Year 5 2028-2029
Grade Configuration	Grades 5-8	Grades 5-8	Grades 5-8	Grades 5-8	Grades 5-8
Total Recommended Enrollment	384	384	384	384	384

* A conforming (technical correction) to revise its authorized enrollment from the currently approved 480 students to 384 students.

⁹ Thirty-eight percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal and Revision Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term (and revisions) described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creo Charter School has extremely strong State assessment results and has rates of proficiency in ELA and math that exceed both NYS and the DOL in the aggregate and for ED, ELL, and SWD. • The school has a rigorous and coherent curriculum and local assessments that are aligned to the New York State Learning Standards (NYSL) for all students. • The school has significant systems in place where families, community members and staff working together to share in the responsibility for students' academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over this charter term, Benchmark 4: Financial Condition has experienced a change in the school's financial indicators. • Over this charter term, Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention has had consistent under-enrollment of ELL and ED student subgroups.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2015 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings¹⁰
Creo College Preparatory Charter School

2015 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic trends toward proficiency, proficiency and high school graduation. At all grade levels and all assessments, scoring proficiently means achieving a performance level of 3 or higher (high school Regents and Common Core Regents exam score of 65 or higher).	Meets
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to the New York State Learning Standards (NYSLS) for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a safe and respectful learning environment. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Exceeds
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Approaches
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

¹⁰ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: N/A
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on November 13, 2023. Eleven people attended, and four spoke in favor of the renewal. No one was opposed.

The school provided evidence of community support for this renewal by sending the NYSED CSO eight letters of support from parents, financial institutes, and local business owners.

Please note that for all charter school revisions, the school was required to conduct extensive community engagement prior to submitting the revision request.

Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology
Board Chair	Maya Crane
District of Location	Rochester City School District ¹¹
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2017
Charter Terms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Charter Term: August 21, 2017 - June 30, 2022 • First Renewal Term: July 1, 2022 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facility	1001 Lake Avenue, Rochester New York 14613 - Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology integrates social emotional learning and supports throughout the curricular and support services offerings, with instructional staff and support staff sharing responsibility for implementation.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/exploration-elementary-charter-school-science-and-technology (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2022 to 2023	Year 2 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 5	K - Grade 5
Total Approved Enrollment	475	475

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024 to 2025	Year 2 2025 to 2026	Year 3 2026 to 2027
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 5	K - Grade 5	K - Grade 5
Total Recommended Enrollment	475	475	475

¹¹ Twenty-five percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over the current charter term, the school has demonstrated growth in the areas of teaching and learning, financial condition, board oversight, organizational structure, mission and key design elements implementation, and legal compliance. • The school has expanded commitment and implementation of its Science, Technology Engineering, and Math (STEM) program. • The school has reorganized its leadership team and restructured the board of trustees. The school’s mental health support staff collaborates with general instructional staff to provide Social Emotional Learning (SEL) curriculum within the classroom. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the school’s academic results exceed the DOL, Rochester CSD, for all students, SWD, and ED students, they are well below the State with ELA proficiency at 17% and math at 19%. • The school had declining results on the NYSTP 3-8 Assessments for ELA from the 2022 to the 2023 administrations of the exams. • The school has taken on a large lease liability that has negatively impacted its composite score. • Overall enrollment has fallen slightly below the required 85% threshold for the past two years. • The school’s SWD and ELL subgroup enrollment rates continue a pattern of being below the DOL. • The school is failing to retain students at rates comparable to the DOL, with the retention rate for SWD being 25 percentage points below.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2019 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings¹²
Exploration Elementary Charter School for Science and Technology

2019 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic proficiency, trends toward proficiency, similar schools, college and career readiness, and high school graduation, if applicable. Proficiency at the elementary/middle school level shall be defined as achieving a performance level of 3 or higher on Grade 3-8 state assessments in ELA, math, and science. At the high school level, passing shall be defined as obtaining a Regents exam score of 65 or higher.	Falls Far Below
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school implements research-based practices and has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to New York State Learning Standards for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Student and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a positive, safe, and respectful learning environment that prepares all students for college and career. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students. High schools are meeting persistence rates commensurate with the NYSED target.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: N/A

¹² Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the Rochester City School District on October 3, 2023. Eleven people attended, and one person spoke via Zoom. One person was in favor of the renewal. No one was opposed.

The school actively engages with the Rochester community to prepare students for their future roles. Through events like curriculum nights and family gatherings, they foster relationships and provide support to families. Additionally, partnerships with organizations like the Rochester Museum and Science Center, Therapy Dogs International, and Bergmann Engineering offer students diverse learning opportunities. The school says that these collaborations help them to provide a vertically integrated curriculum for students.

Please note that for all charter school revisions, the school was required to conduct community engagement prior to submitting the revision request.

Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx (NCSB)
Board Chair	Patricia Soussloff
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) 7 ¹³
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2019
Charter Term(s)	Initial Charter: July 1, 2019 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facilities	411 Wales Ave, Bronx, NY 10454 - Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	The Autistic Spectrum Disorder (ASD) Program is carefully designed to provide a supportive environment for children with social-cognitive learning challenges combined with a rigorous academic program. ASD students participate in all aspects of the school program. They also attend Social Club, which is small-group intervention led by speech-language pathologists targeting social cognition and behavior.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/neighborhood-charter-school-bronx (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 1	K - Grade 2	K - Grade 3	K - Grade 4	K - Grade 5
Total Approved Enrollment	130	200	270	340	410

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024 to 2025	Year 2 2025 to 2026	Year 3 2026 to 2027	Year 4 2027 to 2028	Year 5 2028 to 2029
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 7	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8
Total Proposed Enrollment	480	550	620	620	620

¹³ Thirty-eight percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal and Revision Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term (and revision) described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• NCSB has strong academic outcomes, meeting targets at the school and subgroup level in ELA, math, and science.• In the 2022-2023 school year, the school outperformed the school's DOL, NYC CSD 7, by wide margins in grade 3-8 assessments for all students and each subgroup, with the all students group being +37 percentage points in ELA and +51 percentage points in math.• NCSB continues to enroll more SWD as compared to the DOL.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The school enrolls a smaller percentage of ELL and ED students relative to the DOL.• The school had more uncertified teachers than allowable.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2015 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings¹⁴
Neighborhood Charter School: Bronx

2015 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic trends toward proficiency, proficiency and high school graduation. At all grade levels and all assessments, scoring proficiently means achieving a performance level of 3 or higher (high school Regents and Common Core Regents exam score of 65 or higher).	Meets
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to the New York State Learning Standards (NYSLS) for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a safe and respectful learning environment. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Approaches

¹⁴ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: N/A
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Material Revision:

The school is seeking approval of the following material revision to the charter:

- Increase the school’s grade span from its current kindergarten through Grade 5 configuration to include Grades 6 through 8 and make a corresponding increase to its authorized enrollment from 410 students to 620 students.

Approving this revision request is likely to improve student learning and achievement because the school provides a specialized ASD program for children with Autism. The ASD program supports students by not only providing them with the services that they need but also providing an environment where they learn the same rigorous curriculum, in an integrated environment, as their peers.

Approving this revision request will result in a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school because it provides familiarity and consistency for ASD students who are already attending the school and who would otherwise need to find a new environment for middle school.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on November 1, 2023. Six people attended, and three spoke. Three were in favor of the renewal/revision and no one was opposed.

Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts (RACSA)
Board Chair	Ann Seigler
District of Location	Greece Central School District ¹⁵
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2014
Charter Terms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Charter Term: August 25, 2014 - June 30, 2019 • First Renewal Term: July 1, 2019 - June 30, 2021 • Second Renewal Term: July 1, 2021 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facility	299 Kirk Road, Rochester New York 14612 – Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	A culture of data-driven decision making at RACSA is instilled across the organization from instructional decisions in the classroom to school culture and climate as well as board recruitment and strategic planning. The school’s core mission to integrate arts into a rigorous curriculum is well established and contributes to student success.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/renaissance-academy-charter-school-arts (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2021 to 2022	Year 2 2022 to 2023	Year 3 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 6
Total Approved Enrollment	506	506	506

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024 to 2025	Year 2 2025 to 2026	Year 3 2026 to 2027	Year 4 2027 to 2028	Year 5 2028 to 2029
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 6	K - Grade 6
Total Recommended Enrollment	506	506	506	506	506

¹⁵ Three percent of all students residing in this school district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A culture of data-driven decision making is instilled across the organization from instructional decisions in the classroom to school culture and climate as well as board recruitment and strategic planning. • The school’s core mission to integrate arts into a rigorous curriculum is well established and contributes to student success. • The school has strengthened its academic program, cultural norms, and board composition across the charter term, contributing to improved student performance and stable organizational operations. • The school has retained a large proportion of its staff, ensuring that the staff training related to the school’s programs and procedures are deeply understood and consistently implemented. • The board has engaged in the intentional recruitment and training of new members with the expertise needed to promote the long-term goals and success of the organization. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Despite the school’s targeted efforts to improve the likelihood of selecting and enrolling students from the SWD and ELL populations, the proportion of those populations relative to the DOL has not shown an increase. • Currently, the school’s late start times, determined by the district’s transportation schedule, have presented a challenge to some families.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2019 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings¹⁶
Renaissance Academy Charter School of the Arts

2019 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic proficiency, trends toward proficiency, similar schools, college and career readiness, and high school graduation, if applicable. Proficiency at the elementary/middle school level shall be defined as achieving a performance level of 3 or higher on Grade 3-8 state assessments in ELA, math, and science. At the high school level, passing shall be defined as obtaining a Regents exam score of 65 or higher.	Approaches
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school implements research-based practices and has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to New York State Learning Standards for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Student and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a positive, safe, and respectful learning environment that prepares all students for college and career. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students. High schools are meeting persistence rates commensurate with the NYSED target.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Meets

¹⁶ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: N/A
- Year 3: N/A

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the Greece Central School District on October 3, 2023. Ten people attended, and two spoke. Five board members were in favor of the renewal. Three board members were opposed.

The school provided evidence of community support for this renewal recommendation by submitting three letters of support from community agencies, two of which support refugees and the third a bank providing community service.

Please note that for all charter school revisions, the school was required to conduct extensive community engagement prior to submitting the revision request.

South Bronx Classical Charter School

Table 1: Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	South Bronx Classical Charter School (SBC)
Board Chair	Jacob Elghanayan
District of Location	New York City (NYC) Community School District (CSD) 12 ¹⁷
Initial Commencement of Instruction	Fall 2006
Charter Terms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Charter Term: December 9, 2005 - December 8, 2010 • First Renewal Term: December 9, 2010 - June 30, 2015 • Second Renewal Term: July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2019 • Third Renewal Term: July 1, 2019 - June 30, 2024
Comprehensive Management Service Provider	None
Facilities	977 Fox Street, Bronx, NY 10459 – Private Space
Innovative and Noteworthy Programs (as reported by the school)	SBC has developed an effective program for new teachers and ongoing development of veteran teachers. The ClassiCorps program takes recent college graduates and provides them with training and support to become classroom teachers. In addition, the professional development program provides all teachers with choice and access to a variety of academic and social emotional learning topics.
Link to Charter School Renewal Report	https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/south-bronx-classical-charter-school (Note: This Report includes academic, enrollment, and fiscal tables.)

Table 2: Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2019 to 2020	Year 2 2020 to 2021	Year 3 2021 to 2022	Year 4 2022 to 2023	Year 5 2023 to 2024
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8
Total Approved Enrollment	500	500	500	500	500

Table 3: Recommended Renewal Term Grade Levels and Recommended Enrollment

	Year 1 2024 to 2025	Year 2 2025 to 2026	Year 3 2026 to 2027	Year 4 2027 to 2028	Year 5 2028 to 2029
Grade Configuration	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8	K - Grade 8
Total Proposed Enrollment	500	500	500	500	500

¹⁷ Twenty-six percent of all students residing in this district attend charter schools.

Rationale for Renewal Recommendation

Based on the Board of Regents Renewal Policy, NYSED recommends that the Board of Regents grant the renewal term (and revisions) described above in the **Issue for Decision** section.

As the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the district is greater than 5 percent of the total public-school enrollment, pursuant to Education Law Section 2852(2)(d), NYSED notes that granting this renewal application provides a significant educational benefit to the students attending and expected to attend this charter school.

Highlights	
Strengths	Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• SBC began operations in January 2005 and is seeking its fourth charter renewal.• Throughout the term, the school has significantly outperformed both the DOL and NYS on the NYSTP 3-8 assessments for all students and each subgroup. For example, ELA proficiency was +56 to +66 percentage points above the DOL while math proficiency was +70 to +82 points above the DOL.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Compared to the DOL, SBC continues to enroll and retain smaller percentages of students with disabilities and economically disadvantaged students than the DOL.• The school also exceeds the allowable number of uncertified teachers.

Performance Framework Ratings:

At the time of renewal, the charter school was rated on each of the 10 NYSED Charter School Performance Framework Benchmarks. These ratings reflect performance over the entire charter term and are considered when making a renewal recommendation, pursuant to the Board of Regents Renewal Policy.

2019 Charter School Performance Framework Benchmark Ratings¹⁸
South Bronx Classical Charter School

2019 Performance Benchmark		Level
Educational Success	Benchmark 1: Student Performance: The school has met or exceeded achievement indicators for academic proficiency, trends toward proficiency, similar schools, college and career readiness, and high school graduation, if applicable. Proficiency at the elementary/middle school level shall be defined as achieving a performance level of 3 or higher on Grade 3-8 state assessments in ELA, math, and science. At the high school level, passing shall be defined as obtaining a Regents exam score of 65 or higher.	Meets
	Benchmark 2: Teaching and Learning: School leaders have systems in place designed to cultivate shared accountability and high expectations and that lead to students' well-being, improved academic outcomes, and educational success. The school implements research-based practices and has rigorous and coherent curriculum and assessments that are aligned to New York State Learning Standards for all students. Teachers engage in strategic practices and decision-making in order to address the gap between what students know and need to learn so that all students experience consistent high levels of engagement, thinking and achievement.	Meets
	Benchmark 3: Culture, Climate, and Student and Family Engagement: The school has systems in place to support students' social and emotional health and to provide for a positive, safe, and respectful learning environment that prepares all students for college and career. Families, community members and school staff work together to share in the responsibility for student academic progress and social-emotional growth and well-being. Families and students are satisfied with the school's academics and the overall leadership and management of the school.	Meets
Organizational Soundness	Benchmark 4: Financial Condition: The school is in sound and stable financial condition as evidenced by performance on key financial indicators.	Meets
	Benchmark 5: Financial Management: The school operates in a fiscally sound manner with realistic budgets pursuant to a long-range financial plan, appropriate internal controls and procedures, and in accordance with state law and generally accepted accounting practices.	Meets
	Benchmark 6: Board Oversight and Governance: The board of trustees provides competent stewardship and oversight of the school while maintaining policies, establishing performance goals, and implementing systems to ensure academic success, organizational viability, board effectiveness and faithfulness to the terms of its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 7: Organizational Capacity: The school has established a well-functioning organizational structure, clearly delineated roles for staff, management, and board members. The school has systems and protocols that allow for the successful implementation, evaluation, and improvement of its academic program and operations.	Meets
Faithfulness to Charter & Law	Benchmark 8: Mission and Key Design Elements: The school is faithful to its mission and has implemented the key design elements included in its charter.	Meets
	Benchmark 9: Enrollment, Recruitment, and Retention: The school is meeting or making annual progress toward meeting the enrollment plan outlined in its charter and its enrollment and retention targets for students with disabilities, English language learners, and students who are eligible applicants for the free and reduced priced lunch program; or has demonstrated that it has made extensive good faith efforts to attract, recruit, and retain such students. High schools are meeting persistence rates commensurate with the NYSED target.	Approaches
	Benchmark 10: Legal Compliance: The school complies with applicable laws, regulations, and the provisions of its charter.	Approaches

¹⁸ Charter schools authorized or renewed beginning in the 2019-2020 school year and thereafter use the [2019 Charter School Performance Framework](#), and all other charter schools use the [2015 Charter School Performance Framework](#) until renewal. Refer to the appropriate framework for the applicable benchmark standards.

Notices of Concern and/or Deficiency in the Current Charter Term:

- Year 1: N/A
- Year 2: N/A
- Year 3: N/A
- Year 4: N/A
- Year 5: N/A

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on November 6, 2023. Four people attended. One spoke in favor of the renewal, and no one was opposed.

APPENDIX
Laws, Regulations, and Regents-endorsed internal Policies Applicable to
Board of Regents-authorized Charter School Renewals

Statutory requirements pertaining to Board of Regents charter school decision making are enumerated in Article 56 of the Education Law. This section of the law sets forth the purpose of charter schools to:

- (a) Improve student learning and achievement;
- (b) Increase learning opportunities for all students, with special emphasis on expanded learning experiences for students who are at-risk of academic failure;
- (c) Encourage the use of different and innovative teaching methods;
- (d) Create new professional opportunities for teachers, school administrators and other school personnel;
- (e) Provide parents and students with expanded choices in the types of educational opportunities that are available within the public school system; and
- (f) Provide schools with a method to change from rule-based to performance-based accountability systems by holding the schools established under this article accountable for meeting measurable student achievement results.

Criteria regarding the evaluation of charter schools, including for renewal decisions, are set forth in Section 2852(2) of the Education Law:

- (a) Does the charter school described in the application meet the requirements set out in applicable laws, rules and regulations;
- (b) Does the charter school demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner;
- (c) Will approving the charter school action make it likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes of the law; and
- (d) In a school district where the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the base year is greater than five percent of the total public school enrollment of the school district in the base year (i) would granting the application have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the proposed charter school or (ii) did the school district in which the charter school will be located consent to such application?

In addition, Renewal Guidelines contained in the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education (8 NYCRR §119.7) were adopted by the Board of Regents and require that the Board further consider the following when evaluating a charter renewal application:

- (a) The information in the charter school's renewal application;
- (b) Any additional material or information submitted by the charter school;
- (c) Any public comments received;
- (d) Any information relating to the site visit and the site visit report;
- (e) The charter school's annual reporting results including, but not limited to, student academic achievement;
- (f) The Department's renewal recommendation and the charter school's written response, if any; and
- (g) Any other information that the board, in its discretion, may deem relevant to its determination whether the charter should be renewed.
- (h) The Regents must also consider the totality of the evidence presented in each case, and may accept or reject, in whole or in part, the department's renewal recommendation, provided

however that the Regents are not prohibited from weighing any one factor more heavily than another.

[The Board of Regents Renewal Policy](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2012Meetings/November2012/1112p12a1.pdf) (https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2012Meetings/November2012/1112p12a1.pdf) sets forth the following renewal options and standards upon which the Department's recommendation is based:

Full-Term Renewal: A school's charter may be renewed for the maximum term of five years. In order for a school to be eligible for a full-term renewal, the school must have compiled a strong and compelling record of meeting or exceeding Benchmark 1 during the current charter term and, at the time of the renewal analysis, have met substantially all of the other performance benchmarks in the Framework.

Short-Term Renewal: A school's charter may be renewed for a shorter term, typically of three years. The Regents will place an even greater emphasis on student performance for schools applying for their second or subsequent renewal, which is consistent with the greater time that a school has been in operation and the corresponding increase in the quantity and quality of student achievement data that the school has generated. In order for a school to be eligible for short-term renewal, a school must either: (a) have compiled a mixed or limited record of meeting Benchmark 1 but, at the time of the renewal analysis, have met substantially all of the other performance benchmarks in the Framework, which will likely result in the school's being able to meet Benchmark 1 with the additional time that short-term renewal permits, or (b) have compiled an overall record of meeting Benchmark 1 but falls far below meeting one or more of the other performance benchmarks in the Framework.

Nonrenewal: A school's charter will not be renewed if the school does not apply for renewal or the school fails to meet the benchmark standards for either full-term or short-term renewal. In the case of nonrenewal, a school's charter will be terminated upon its expiration, and the school will be required to comply with the [Department's Closing Procedures](https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/oversight-plan-board-regents-authorized-charter-schools) (https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/oversight-plan-board-regents-authorized-charter-schools) to ensure an orderly closure by the end of the school year.

To operationalize these statutory and regulatory requirements, the Board of Regents endorsed the Charter School Performance Framework. This document, and the ten academic, organizational, and legal domains contained within it, were created based on the limited criteria that can be considered when making decisions pertaining to the authorization of new charter schools, charter school renewals, and charter school revisions as set forth in Section 2852(2) of the Education Law. Comprehensive data for these benchmark standards is included in the charter school Regents item, summary documents, and Regents meeting presentations.

Performance Framework

The Board of Regents Charter School Performance Framework, which is part of the Board of Regents Charter School Renewal Policy and the Oversight Plan included in the Charter Agreement for each school, outlines three key areas of charter school performance: (1) Educational Success; (2) Organizational Soundness; and (3) Faithfulness to Charter and Law. The Charter School Performance Framework sets forth ten performance benchmarks in these three areas. The Charter School Performance Framework is designed to focus on performance outcomes, preserve operational autonomy, and facilitate transparent feedback to schools. It aligns with the Department's ongoing accountability and effectiveness work under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) and holds charter schools accountable to standards set forth in the

Education Law, while providing the Regents with discretion. Generally, charter schools are required to demonstrate performance outcomes that exceed those of traditional public schools.

The Department considers evidence related to all ten performance benchmark areas of the Charter School Performance Framework when making recommendations to the Regents concerning charter renewal applications. However, student academic performance is of paramount importance when evaluating each school ([See 8 NYCRR §119.7](https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/charter-school-regulations-1197) (<https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/charter-school-regulations-1197>)). The recommendations in this document were made after a full due-diligence process over the charter term as set forth in the [NYSED Charter School Monitoring Plan](https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/oversight-plan-board-regents-authorized-charter-schools) (<https://www.nysed.gov/charter-schools/oversight-plan-board-regents-authorized-charter-schools>), including review of the information presented by the schools in their Renewal Applications; specific fiscal reviews; a renewal site visit of up to two days conducted by a Department team for each school; comprehensive analysis of achievement data; and consideration of public comment.