



TO: P-12 Education Committee

FROM: John L. D'Agati *John L. D'Agati*

SUBJECT: Renewal Recommendations for Charter Schools Authorized by the New York City Department of Education - Chancellor

DATE: January 30, 2020

AUTHORIZATION(S): *Sharam L. Talae*

SUMMARY

Issue for Decision

Should the Board of Regents approve the proposed renewal charters for the following charter schools authorized by the New York City Department of Education pursuant to Article 56 of the Education Law (the New York Charter Schools Act):

1. **Bronx Community Charter School** (full-term, five-year renewal).
2. **Mott Haven Academy Charter School** (full-term, five-year renewal and a revision to increase authorized enrollment (*nunc pro tunc* from July 1, 2019) from 450 students to 468 students).

Reason(s) for Consideration

Required by State statute.

Proposed Handling

This issue will be before the P-12 Education Committee and the Full Board for action at the February 2020 Regents meeting.

Procedural History

The New York City Department of Education (NYCDOE) made the renewal recommendations being presented to the Board of Regents for approval and issuance as required by Article 56 of the Education Law and 8 NYCRR 119.7.

Charter School Renewal Applications

In Article 56 of the Education Law, §2852(2) requires the chartering entity (in this case the Board of Regents) to make the following findings when considering a charter renewal application:

- (a) The charter school described in the application meets the requirements set out in this article and all other applicable laws, rules, and regulations;
- (b) The applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner;
- (c) Granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of section twenty-eight hundred fifty-one of this article; and
- (d) In a school district where the total enrollment of resident students attending charter schools in the base year is greater than 5 percent of the total public school enrollment of the school district in the base year (i) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the proposed charter school or (ii) the school district in which the charter school will be located consents to such application.

In addition, Renewal Guidelines contained in the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education (8 NYCRR 119.7(d)) were adopted by the Board of Regents and require that the Board further consider the following when evaluating a charter renewal application:

- (a) The information in the charter school's renewal application;
- (b) Any additional material or information submitted by the charter school;
- (c) Any public comments received;
- (d) Any information relating to the site visit and the site visit report;
- (e) The charter school's annual reporting results including, but not limited to, student academic achievement;
- (f) The Department's renewal recommendation and the charter school's written response, if any; and
- (g) Any other information that the board, in its discretion, may deem relevant to its determination whether the charter should be renewed.

Related Regents Items

Bronx Community Charter School

[January 2008 Initial Charter](#)

(<http://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/documents/meetings/2008Meetings/January2008/0108emsca20.doc>)

[April 2013 First Renewal](#)

(https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/413p12a4Revised_0.pdf)

[May 2015 Second Renewal & Revision to Expand Grades and Enrollment](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/May%202015/515p12a1.pdf)

(https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/May%202015/515p12a1.pdf)

[March 2016 Enrollment Increase Revision](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/316p12a6.pdf)

(https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/316p12a6.pdf)

Mott Haven Academy Charter School

[January 2008 Initial Charter](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/meetings/2008/2008-01-27)

(https://www.regents.nysed.gov/meetings/2008/2008-01-27)

[April 2013 First Renewal](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/413bra5pdf%5B1%5D.pdf)

(https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/413bra5pdf%5B1%5D.pdf)

[April 2015 Second Renewal](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/Apr%202015/415p12a7Revision2.pdf)

https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/meetings/Apr%202015/415p12a7Revision2.pdf

[February 2016 Enrollment and Grade Expansion Revision](https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/216p12a5.pdf)

https://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/216p12a5.pdf

Recommendations

It is recommended that the Board of Regents take the following action:

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that the **Bronx Community Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law and all other applicable laws, rules, and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the renewal application of the **Bronx Community Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2025**.

VOTED: That the Board of Regents finds that the **Mott Haven Academy Charter School**: (1) meets the requirements set out in Article 56 of the Education Law and all other applicable laws, rules and regulations; (2) the applicant can demonstrate the ability to operate the school in an educationally and fiscally sound manner; (3) granting the application is likely to improve student learning and achievement and materially further the purposes set out in subdivision two of section twenty-eight hundred fifty of this article; and (4) granting the application would have a significant educational benefit to the students expected to attend the charter school, and the Board of Regents therefore approves the

renewal application of the **Mott Haven Academy Charter School** and that a renewal charter be issued, and that its provisional charter be extended for a term up through and including **June 30, 2025**.

Timetable for Implementation

The Regents action for the above-named charter schools will become effective immediately.

Bronx Community Charter School

In accordance with Education Law, Article 56, Sections 2851(4) and 2852(2), Commissioners Regulation 119.7, **the Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education recommends a full-term renewal for a period of five years for Bronx Community Charter School. The charter term would begin on July 1, 2020 and expire on June 30, 2025.**

Bronx Community Charter School (Bronx Community) is meeting most benchmarks set forth in the New York City Department of Education Charter School Accountability Framework. The school is implementing the mission, key design elements, education program, and organizational plan set forth in the charter.

Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Bronx Community Charter School
Board Chair	Gil Schmerler
District of location	NYC CSD 10
Opening Date	Fall 2008
Charter Term(s)	July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2020
Current Term Authorized Grades/ Approved Enrollment	K – Grade 8/ 520 students
Proposed Renewal Term Authorized Grades/ Proposed Approved Enrollment	K – Grade 8/ 520 students
Facilities	3170 Webster Avenue, Bronx – Private Space
Mission Statement	<i>Italicized and justified Bronx Community Charter School is a small learning community founded on the principle that children learn best when they are active participants in their own learning. Our students raise questions about the world around them, engage with a wide range of materials, and learn through their interactions with each other and all of the adults in the school community. Children learn to use their minds well, cultivating strong intellectual habits and skills to become self-directed learners with clear passions and ambitions. Teachers know children deeply and develop powerful curriculum to meet the needs and interests of their students. All members of our school community are committed to making thoughtful choices, advancing democratic values, and effecting change in the broader community.</i>
Key Design Elements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Student Centered Differentiated Learning • Student Driven Inquiry Learning • Project Based Learning • Authentic/ Real World Learning • Family Engagement • Staff Driven Initiatives • Professional Learning that Improves Practice
Recommended Material Revisions	None

Noteworthy: The Bronx Community educational program provides strong outcomes for ELL students. Bronx Community works to build students’ English language skills, enables them to succeed on the NYSESLAT and NYS exams, and to attain English language proficiency while ensuring that students maintain a connection to, and pride in, their native language and culture. Bronx Community has also been successful retaining ELL students.

Innovative Programs: Bronx Community offers an inquiry- and project-based learning option to the families of the Bronx, including an emphasis on authentic and real world learning; one noteworthy example of this is the annual school-wide study of the Bronx River.

Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2015 to 2016	Year 2 2016 to 2017	Year 3 2017 to 2018	Year 4 2018 to 2019	Year 5 2019 to 2020
Grade Configuration	K – Grade 6	K – Grade 7	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8
Total Approved Enrollment	425	475	520	520	520

***Proposed Renewal Term Grade Levels and Proposed Enrollment**

	Year 1 2020 to 2021	Year 2 2021 to 2022	Year 3 2022 to 2023	Year 4 2023 to 2024	Year 5 2024 to 2025
Grade Configuration	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8
Total Proposed Enrollment	520	520	520	520	520

*The proposed chart was submitted by Bronx Community in its renewal application. It is subject to change pending the final renewal recommendation and approval by the Board of Regents.

Summary of Evidence for Renewal

Key Performance Area: Educational Success

Student Performance – Elementary/Middle School Outcomes

See Table 1 regarding assessment proficiency regarding 3-8 math and ELA. See Table 2 below regarding 3-8 math and ELA exam aggregate and subgroup student performance compared to the district and state average. **According to the 2018-2019 school year ESEA accountability designations, Bronx Community is *In Good Standing*.**

Academic Program for Elementary School/Middle School:

Bronx Community Charter School offers curricula and coursework aligned to New York Common Core standards in ELA, math, Social Studies and Science. In addition, the school offers Art, Dance, Poetry, and Spanish.

Academic Program for Students with Disabilities and English language learners (ELLs)/Multilingual Learners (MLLs):

The school offers Integrated Co-Teaching (ICT) on all grade levels and Special Education Teacher Support Services (SETSS) for Students with Disabilities (SWD). The school employs multiple ELL teachers to work with ELL/MLL students.

**Table 1: Elementary/Middle School Assessment Proficiency State and District Differentials Over Time
Comparison to NYC CSD 10**

		ELA					Math				
		Bronx Community Charter School	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS	Bronx Community Charter School	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS
All Students	2014-2015	20%	19%	+2	31%	-11	31%	26%	+5	43%	-12
	2015-2016	25%	25%	-0	38%	-13	26%	26%	+0	42%	-16
	2016-2017	33%	27%	+6	39%	-6	25%	25%	+1	43%	-17
	2017-2018	39%	33%	+6	45%	-7	27%	28%	-2	45%	-18
	2018-2019	39%	34%	+5	45%	-6	36%	32%	+4	47%	-11
SWD	2014-2015	0%	4%	-4	7%	-7	12%	11%	+1	14%	-2
	2015-2016	0%	6%	-6	8%	-8	9%	9%	-1	13%	-4
	2016-2017	12%	6%	+5	9%	+3	8%	8%	+0	13%	-5
	2017-2018	15%	10%	+5	14%	+1	11%	9%	+2	15%	-4
	2018-2019	18%	11%	+7	14%	+4	16%	11%	+5	16%	-0
ELL/MLL	2014-2015	0%	3%	-3	5%	-5	0%	8%	-8	15%	-15
	2015-2016	0%	3%	-3	5%	-5	6%	8%	-1	13%	-7
	2016-2017	11%	4%	+7	6%	+6	23%	7%	+16	14%	+9
	2017-2018	16%	6%	+10	9%	+7	20%	8%	+12	16%	+4
	2018-2019	9%	6%	+3	9%	-0	23%	9%	+14	17%	+6
ED	2014-2015	17%	16%	+1	21%	-4	26%	24%	+2	31%	-5
	2015-2016	22%	23%	-1	27%	-6	22%	23%	-1	31%	-8
	2016-2017	30%	24%	+6	28%	+1	22%	22%	+0	31%	-9
	2017-2018	37%	31%	+6	35%	+1	22%	26%	-3	34%	-12
	2018-2019	38%	32%	+6	36%	+2	33%	30%	+3	37%	-4

*District and State averages reflect only the grades served by the charter school in that school year

**Charter school and District averages include Regents outcomes for tests taken in lieu of the state ELA or Math test and so may not be directly comparable to the State averages.

Table 2: Elementary/Middle School Assessment Proficiency Outcomes: Charter School, District & NYS

		ELA					Math				
		Bronx Community Charter	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS	Bronx Community Charter	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS
Grade 3	2014-2015	18%	20%	-1	31%	-13	19%	25%	-6	42%	-23
	2015-2016	26%	29%	-4	42%	-16	32%	28%	+4	44%	-12
	2016-2017	27%	28%	-1	43%	-16	36%	29%	+7	48%	-12
	2017-2018	45%	36%	+9	51%	-6	46%	34%	+13	54%	-7
	2018-2019	67%	38%	+28	52%	+14	62%	35%	+26	55%	+7
Grade 4	2014-2015	21%	19%	+2	33%	-11	45%	28%	+17	43%	+2
	2015-2016	22%	29%	-7	41%	-19	25%	28%	-3	45%	-19
	2016-2017	33%	30%	+3	41%	-8	28%	25%	+2	43%	-15
	2017-2018	35%	33%	+1	47%	-13	28%	28%	-0	48%	-20
	2018-2019	41%	37%	+4	48%	-7	44%	34%	+10	50%	-7
Grade 5	2014-2015	20%	17%	+4	30%	-9	29%	25%	+4	43%	-14
	2015-2016	25%	21%	+4	33%	-8	25%	23%	+2	40%	-15
	2016-2017	24%	24%	+1	35%	-11	22%	25%	-3	43%	-21
	2017-2018	24%	25%	-0	37%	-12	29%	26%	+3	44%	-14
	2018-2019	15%	28%	-12	38%	-22	26%	29%	-3	46%	-20
Grade 6	2015-2016	28%	21%	+7	34%	-6	22%	23%	-1	40%	-18
	2016-2017	25%	20%	+5	32%	-7	15%	22%	-8	40%	-25
	2017-2018	34%	37%	-3	49%	-15	12%	24%	-12	44%	-32
	2018-2019	31%	34%	-3	47%	-16	27%	29%	-2	47%	-20

Grade 7	2016-2017	55%	30%	+25	42%	+13	20%	20%	-0	38%	-18
	2017-2018	35%	29%	+7	40%	-5	11%	24%	-13	41%	-31
	2018-2019	33%	29%	+5	40%	-6	21%	25%	-4	43%	-23
Grade 8	2017-2018	57%	40%	+17	48%	+10	25%	33%	-9	30%	-5
	2018-2019	61%	40%	+22	48%	+14	38%	39%	-1	33%	+5

**Charter school and District averages include Regents outcomes for tests taken in lieu of the state ELA or Math test and so may not be directly comparable to the State averages.

Key Performance Area: Organizational Viability

Financial Condition

Bronx Community Charter School appears to be in good or sound financial condition as evidenced by performance on key indicators derived from the school's independently audited financial statements.

The NYCDOE reviews the financial performance and management of charter schools using quantitative and qualitative methods. Near-term indicators, such as the current ratio and unrestricted days cash, are measures of liquidity and of the charter school's capacity to maintain operations. Long-term indicators, such as total margin and debt-to asset ratio, are measures of the charter school's capacity to remain viable and to meet financial obligations.¹

Financial Management

The NYCDOE reviewed Bronx Community Charter School's audited financial statements from fiscal years (FY) 2016, 2017, 2018 and 2019 to determine whether the independent auditor observed sufficient internal controls over financial reporting. In three out of those four years, (FY 2016, 2017 and 2019) the auditor did identify any deficiencies in internal controls that could be considered material weaknesses. In FY 2018, the auditor did identify one material finding regarding the use of a formal bid process for contracts greater than \$5,000. This finding was corrected by the following fiscal year (FY 2019).

¹ These rigorous indicators of fiscal soundness are aligned with those recommended by the National Association of Charter School Authorizers.

Key Performance Area: Faithfulness to the Charter and Law

Enrollment, Recruitment and Retention

Bronx Community Charter School backfills students on all grades from its waitlist.

Through efforts towards increasing the percentage of at-risk students enrolled, the school is meeting its targets for economically disadvantaged (ED), students with disabilities (SWDs), and coming close to but not yet meeting its targets for English language learners (ELLs)/Multilingual learners (MLLs), (Table 3). The school has increased the percentages of all three groups (ED, SWDs and ELL/MLLs) in each year of the charter term.

The school is making good faith efforts to recruit, serve, and retain at-risk students² and has implemented a lottery preference for ELL/MLL students. Efforts to recruit and retain students in the ED, ELL/MLL, and SWD populations include:

- Making all recruitment materials available in English and Spanish and conducting open houses in both languages
- Building connections to local special needs school and encouraging the local Committee on Pre-School Special Education (CPSE) to publicize the lottery to families with entering kindergarteners

Table 3: Student Demographics Comparison to District of Location

	SWD			ELL/MLL			ED		
	Bronx Community Charter School	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District	Bronx Community Charter School	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District	Bronx Community Charter School	NYC CSD 10	Differential to District
2014-2015	19%	23%	-4	17%	28%	-12	83%	85%	-2
2015-2016	19%	24%	-5	18%	27%	-9	82%	85%	-2
2016-2017	22%	24%	-2	22%	31%	-9	85%	84%	+1
2017-2018	23%	25%	-2	21%	31%	-10	85%	88%	-3
2018-2019	24%	25%	-1	22%	31%	-8	88%	88%	-0

² Education Law §2854(2)(a) requires that schools demonstrate good faith efforts to attract and retain a comparable or greater enrollment of students with disabilities, FRPL eligible students and English language learners when compared to the enrollment figures for such students in the school district in which the charter is located. SUNY and the Regents were charged with setting specific enrollment and retention targets for each charter school, and have done so. Education Law §2852(9-a)(b)(i). All charter schools that were initially chartered after August 2010 or renewed after January 1, 2011, are expected to meet or exceed the enrollment and retention targets set by the Regents and SUNY. When submitting an application for renewal of the charter, schools are required to provide information detailing the means by which they will meet the enrollment and retention targets (Education Law §2851(4)(e)), and this information is considered by the Regents in the review of the school's performance over the charter term. A school's plan to change its enrollment practices, whether by weighting the lottery or preferencing, may also be considered when determining whether the school will meet the targets in the upcoming charter term. A school's repeated failure to meet or exceed its enrollment and retention targets, when combined with a failure to show that extensive efforts to meet the targets have been made, may be cause for termination or revocation of the charter pursuant to section Education Law §2855(1)(e).

According to NYCDOE data, in the 2018-2019 school year, 89% of students were retained in Bronx Community Charter School compared with 86% in the district of location.

Legal Compliance

Bronx Community Charter School operates in accordance with applicable law, regulations, rules and other policies, including the terms of its charter, its by-laws and other school-specific policies. It is also in compliance with federally mandated disciplinary procedures for students with disabilities, and the Dignity for All Students Act. The board holds meetings in accordance with the Open Meetings Law.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education on November 19, 2019. One hundred forty eight people attended, and twenty-eight spoke. Twenty-eight were in favor of the renewal and zero were opposed.

Mott Haven Academy Charter School

In accordance with Education Law, Article 56, Sections 2851(4) and 2852(2), Commissioners Regulation 119.7, the Chancellor of the **New York City Department of Education recommends a full-term renewal for a period of five years for Mott Haven Academy Charter School. The charter term would begin on July 1, 2020 and expire on June 30, 2025, and the school would be permitted to revise its charter to expand enrollment (*nunc pro tunc to July 1, 2019*) from 450 students to 468 students.**

Mott Haven Academy Charter School (Haven Academy) is meeting most benchmarks set forth in the New York City Department of Education Charter School Accountability Framework. The school is implementing the mission, key design elements, education program, and organizational plan set forth in the charter.

Charter School Summary

Name of Charter School	Mott Haven Academy Charter School
Board Chair	Patricia Mulvaney
District of location	NYC CSD 7
Opening Date	Fall 2008
Charter Term(s)	July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2020
Current Term Authorized Grades/ Approved Enrollment	K – Grade 8/ 450 students
Proposed Renewal Term Authorized Grades/ Proposed Approved Enrollment	K – Grade 8/ 468 students
Facilities	170 Brown Place, Bronx – Private Space
Mission Statement	<i>The Mott Haven Academy Charter School empowers children in a supportive educational environment that addresses and reduces the barriers to academic success through the integration of family support services with a rigorous, college-preparatory academic program. Our graduates will be resilient, resourceful, independent scholars who have the skills necessary to reach their full potential and to build a better future.</i>
Key Design Elements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trauma-Informed Environment • Data Driven Decision Making • Supportive School Culture and Climate • Rigorous Standards-Based Curriculum • High Attendance Percentages and Systems • Parents as Partners • Community Partnerships
Recommended Material Revisions	Expand enrollment, <i>nunc pro tunc to July 1, 2019</i> , from 450 students to 468 students

Noteworthy: Haven has a strong partnership with The New York Foundling. The school serves a large percentage of students in the foster care system. Haven’s instructionally sound and responsive educational program includes: two highly qualified teachers in each classroom, a strong behavior and special education support staff, a schedule that allows for constant small group, data driven instruction, as well as continual teacher feedback and professional development. Additionally, the school’s learning environment includes a school-wide positive behavior support system and a highly researched social emotional curriculum.

Innovative Programs: The school offers a lottery preference for Students who are in the foster care system and/or receiving prevention services. Haven Academy is the first and most advanced school designed for children living in the foster care and child welfare system. Using social-emotional curriculum in a trauma-informed environment, Haven's vision is to remove the barriers that children in the child welfare system face through the provision of comprehensive support services in a rigorous academic setting. Haven Academy is a testing ground for innovative programming that can be replicated for vulnerable populations nationwide.

Current Grade Levels and Approved Enrollment

	Year 1 2015 to 2016	Year 2 2016 to 2017	Year 3 2017 to 2018	Year 4 2018 to 2019	Year 5 2019 to 2020
Grade Configuration	K – Grade 5	K – Grade 5	K – Grade 6	K – Grade 7	K – Grade 8
Total Approved Enrollment	300	300	350	400	450

***Proposed Renewal Term Grade Levels and Proposed Enrollment**

	Year 1 2020 to 2021	Year 2 2021 to 2022	Year 3 2022 to 2023	Year 4 2023 to 2024	Year 5 2024 to 2025
Grade Configuration	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8	K – Grade 8
Total Proposed Enrollment	468	468	468	468	468

*The proposed chart was submitted by Haven Academy in its renewal application. It is subject to change pending the final renewal recommendation and approval by the Board of Regents.

Summary of Evidence for Renewal

Key Performance Area: Educational Success

Student Performance – Elementary/Middle School Outcomes

See Table 1 regarding assessment proficiency regarding 3-8 math and ELA. See Table 2 below regarding 3-8 math and ELA exam aggregate and subgroup student performance compared to the district and state average. **According to the 2018-2019 school year ESEA accountability designations, Mott Haven Academy Charter School is *In Good Standing*.**

Academic Program for Elementary School/Middle School:

Mott Haven Academy Charter School offers curricula and coursework aligned to New York Common Core standards in ELA, math, Social Studies and Science. In addition, the school offers Technology, Dance, and Art.

Academic Program for Students with Disabilities and English language learners (ELLs)/Multilingual Learners (MLLs):

The school offers Integrated Co-Teaching (ICT) on all grade levels and Special Education Teacher Support Services (SETSS) for Students with Disabilities (SWD). The school employs multiple ELL teachers to work with ELL/MLL students.

**Table 1: Elementary/Middle School Assessment Proficiency State and District Differentials Over Time
Comparison to NYC CSD 7 District**

		ELA					Math				
		Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS	Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS
All Students	2014-2015	31%	12%	+19	31%	+0	55%	18%	+38	43%	+13
	2015-2016	43%	21%	+22	39%	+4	70%	21%	+50	43%	+27
	2016-2017	37%	24%	+12	40%	-3	59%	24%	+35	45%	+15
	2017-2018	51%	30%	+21	46%	+5	57%	27%	+30	48%	+9
	2018-2019	46%	30%	+16	45%	+1	51%	28%	+23	48%	+2
SWD	2014-2015	16%	4%	+12	7%	+9	42%	7%	+35	14%	+28
	2015-2016	31%	6%	+25	9%	+22	59%	9%	+50	14%	+45
	2016-2017	18%	7%	+11	10%	+8	36%	11%	+25	15%	+20
	2017-2018	32%	10%	+21	15%	+17	38%	14%	+24	17%	+21
	2018-2019	25%	10%	+15	14%	+11	44%	13%	+31	17%	+26
ELL/MLL	2014-2015	15%	5%	+11	5%	+10	46%	10%	+37	15%	+31
	2015-2016	27%	5%	+22	6%	+22	64%	12%	+52	14%	+50
	2016-2017	20%	10%	+10	7%	+13	70%	15%	+55	16%	+54
	2017-2018	38%	10%	+28	11%	+26	42%	18%	+24	18%	+23
	2018-2019	29%	9%	+21	9%	+20	63%	14%	+48	18%	+45
ED	2014-2015	29%	12%	+16	21%	+8	55%	18%	+37	31%	+24
	2015-2016	42%	21%	+21	28%	+14	70%	20%	+50	31%	+39
	2016-2017	36%	24%	+12	29%	+7	59%	24%	+35	33%	+26
	2017-2018	50%	29%	+20	36%	+14	56%	27%	+29	36%	+20
	2018-2019	45%	30%	+15	35%	+10	51%	28%	+24	38%	+14

*District and State averages reflect only the grades served by the charter school in that school year.

**Charter school and District averages include Regents outcomes for tests taken in lieu of the state ELA or Math test and so may not be directly comparable to the State averages.

Table 2: Elementary/Middle School Assessment Proficiency Outcomes: Charter School, District & NYS

		ELA					Math				
		Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS	Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District	NYS	Differential to NYS
Grade 3	2014-2015	45%	15%	+30	31%	+14	71%	20%	+52	42%	+29
	2015-2016	57%	26%	+31	42%	+15	76%	24%	+53	44%	+32
	2016-2017	38%	27%	+11	43%	-5	76%	28%	+48	48%	+28
	2017-2018	56%	38%	+18	51%	+5	76%	39%	+37	54%	+22
	2018-2019	61%	43%	+18	52%	+9	80%	35%	+46	55%	+26
Grade 4	2014-2015	27%	12%	+15	33%	-6	66%	16%	+50	43%	+23
	2015-2016	39%	24%	+14	41%	-2	71%	22%	+49	45%	+27
	2016-2017	37%	25%	+11	41%	-4	33%	22%	+11	43%	-10
	2017-2018	44%	33%	+11	47%	-3	58%	30%	+28	48%	+10
	2018-2019	52%	36%	+16	48%	+4	68%	29%	+39	50%	+18
Grade 5	2014-2015	6%	10%	-5	30%	-24	22%	17%	+6	43%	-20
	2015-2016	31%	14%	+17	33%	-3	62%	16%	+46	40%	+22
	2016-2017	35%	19%	+15	35%	-1	69%	21%	+48	43%	+26
	2017-2018	41%	20%	+22	37%	+5	25%	23%	+3	44%	-18
	2018-2019	41%	22%	+19	38%	+4	41%	27%	+14	46%	-5
Grade 6											
	2017-2018	61%	27%	+34	49%	+12	70%	17%	+54	44%	+26
	2018-2019	41%	28%	+13	47%	-6	42%	26%	+16	47%	-5
Grade 7											
	2018-2019	38%	22%	+16	40%	-2	27%	21%	+6	43%	-16

**Charter school and District averages include Regents outcomes for tests taken in lieu of the state ELA or Math test and so may not be directly comparable to the State averages.

Key Performance Area: Organizational Viability

Financial Condition

Mott Haven Academy Charter School appears to be in good or sound financial condition as evidenced by performance on key indicators derived from the school's independently audited financial statements.

The NYCDOE reviews the financial performance and management of charter schools using quantitative and qualitative methods. Near-term indicators, such as the current ratio and unrestricted days cash, are measures of liquidity and of the charter school's capacity to maintain operations. Long-term indicators, such as total margin and debt-to asset ratio, are measures of the charter school's capacity to remain viable and to meet financial obligations.³

Financial Management

The NYCDOE reviewed Mott Haven Academy Charter School's audited financial statements from fiscal years (FY) 2016, 2017, 2018 and 2019 to determine whether the independent auditor observed sufficient internal controls over financial reporting. The auditor did not identify any deficiencies in internal controls that could be considered material weaknesses in any of those years.

Key Performance Area: Faithfulness to the Charter and Law

Enrollment, Recruitment and Retention

Mott Haven Academy Charter School backfills students on all grades from its waitlist.

Through efforts towards increasing the percentage of at-risk students enrolled, the school is within 3 percentage points of but not yet meeting its targets for students with disabilities (SWDs) and English language learners (ELLs)/Multilingual learners (MLLs). The school is exceeding its target for economically disadvantaged (ED) students (Table 3). The school has increased the percentages of all three groups (ED, SWDs and ELL/MLLs) over the course of the charter term.

The school is making good faith efforts to recruit, serve, and retain at-risk students⁴. The school offers a preference to students who are in the foster care system and/or receiving prevention services, and is meeting its design to serve one-third students who are in the foster care system and one-third students

³ These rigorous indicators of fiscal soundness are aligned with those recommended by the National Association of Charter School Authorizers.

⁴ Education Law §2854(2)(a) requires that schools demonstrate good faith efforts to attract and retain a comparable or greater enrollment of students with disabilities, FRPL eligible students and English language learners when compared to the enrollment figures for such students in the school district in which the charter is located. SUNY and the Regents were charged with setting specific enrollment and retention targets for each charter school, and have done so. Education Law §2852(9-a)(b)(i). All charter schools that were initially chartered after August 2010 or renewed after January 1, 2011, are expected to meet or exceed the enrollment and retention targets set by the Regents and SUNY. When submitting an application for renewal of the charter, schools are required to provide information detailing the means by which they will meet the enrollment and retention targets (Education Law §2851(4)(e)), and this information is considered by the Regents in the review of the school's performance over the charter term. A school's plan to change its enrollment practices, whether by weighting the lottery or preferencing, may also be considered when determining whether the school will meet the targets in the upcoming charter term. A school's repeated failure to meet or exceed its enrollment and retention targets, when combined with a failure to show that extensive efforts to meet the targets have been made, may be cause for termination or revocation of the charter pursuant to section Education Law §2855(1)(e).

receiving prevention services. Efforts to recruit and retain students in the ED, ELL/MLL, and SWD populations include:

- Working closely with community organizations to recruit high needs populations in the surrounding neighborhood,
- Recruiting at child welfare agencies and homeless shelters; and
- Employing Spanish speaking recruitment staff.

Table 3: Student Demographics Comparison to District of Location

	SWD			ELL/MLL			ED		
	Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District	Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District	Mott Haven Academy Charter School	NYC CSD 7	Differential to District
2014-2015	25%	25%	+1	18%	24%	-6	87%	97%	-10
2015-2016	25%	26%	-0	18%	23%	-4	97%	97%	+0
2016-2017	28%	27%	+1	22%	25%	-3	98%	97%	+1
2017-2018	30%	28%	+2	22%	25%	-4	98%	96%	+2
2018-2019	27%	29%	-2	22%	25%	-3	97%	95%	+2

According to NYCDOE data, in the 2018-2019 school year, 93% of students were retained in Mott Haven Academy Charter School compared with 84% in the district of location.

Legal Compliance

Mott Haven Academy Charter School operates in accordance with applicable law, regulations, rules and other policies, including the terms of its charter, its by-laws and other school-specific policies. It is also in compliance with federally mandated disciplinary procedures for students with disabilities, and the Dignity for All Students Act. The board holds meetings in accordance with the Open Meetings Law.

Summary of Public Comment

The required public hearing was held by the New York City Department of Education] on November, 6, 2019. Nineteen people attended, and eight spoke. Eight were in favor of the renewal and zero were opposed.