

THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT / THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK / ALBANY, NY 12234

TO:	Audits/Budget and Finance Committee
FROM:	Sharon Cates-Williams
SUBJECT:	Board of Regents Oversight – Financial Accountability
DATE:	September 6, 2011

AUTHORIZATION(S):

SUMMARY

Issues for Discussion

The following topics will be discussed with the Members of the Committee on Audits/Budget and Finance:

- 1. Review of the Monthly Fiscal Report
- 2. Review of Office of Audit Services Activities (Attachment I)
- 3. Completed Audits (Attachment II)

Reason(s) for Consideration

Update on Activities

Proposed Handling

Discussion and Guidance

Procedural History

The information is provided to assist the Committee in carrying out its oversight responsibilities.

Background Information

1. <u>Review of the Monthly Fiscal Report</u> The Committee will be updated on the Department State Operations expenditure and revenue projections. 2. <u>Review of Office of Audit Services Activities</u>

The Committee will be briefed on the activities of the Office of Audit Services during the period from July 1, 2010 to June 30, 2011. (Attachment I)

3. <u>Completed Audits</u>

The Committee is being presented with 50 audits this month. (Attachment II)

Audits are provided as follows:

Office of Audit Services

Altmar-Parish-Williamstown Central School District ARRA Report Roosevelt Union Free School District

Office of the State Comptroller Audits

A Comparison of Liquid Propane-Powered and Diesel-Powered School Buses (Bainbridge-Guilford Central School District, Ithaca City School District, Owego-Apalachin Central School District, Trumansburg Central School District, Union-Endicott Central School District, and Vestal Central School District) Amsterdam (Greater) School District **Bayport Blue Point Union Free School District** Berkley College TAP Audit Berne-Knox-Westerlo Central School District Bethlehem Central School District BOCES Treatment of the Annual Surplus from CoSer Operations (Broom-Tioga BOCES and Orange-Ulster BOCES) Bridgehampton Union Free School District **Carmel Central School District** Cayuga-Onondaga BOCES Central Islip Union Free School District Chenango Valley Central School District Cohoes City School District Colton-Pierrepont Central School District and Parishville-Hopkinton Central School District (1 report) Corinth Central School District Corning City School District Dryden Central School District Eden Central School District Elmont Union Free School District Fonda-Fultonville Central School District Franklinville Central School District Hannibal Central School District Hilton Central School District Ilion Central School District Iroquois Central School District Johnstown (Greater) School District

Kendall Central School District Kingston City School District Lakeland Central School District Lexington School for the Deaf Follow-up Report Liberty Central School District Miller Place Union Free School District Newburgh Enlarged City School District Newfane Central School District Oversight of Scoring Practices on Regents Examinations Follow-up Pocantico Hills Central School District Putnam Valley Central School District Sachem Central School District Sagaponack Common School District Saugerties Central School District Schuylerville Central School District Stillwater Central School District Troy Enlarged City School District Union Free School District of the Tarrytowns Waterford-Halfmoon Union Free School District Watertown City School District Windham-Ashland-Jewett Central School District

City of New York Office of the Comptroller

Department of the Education's Controls over High School Progress Reports

Recommendation

For items one (Review of the Monthly Fiscal Report), two (Office of Audit Services Activities), and three (Completed Audits) no further action is recommended.

Timetable for Implementation

N/A

The following materials are attached:

- Office of Audit Services Activities (Attachment I)
- Summary of Audit Findings Including Audit Abstracts (Attachment II)

Office of Audit Services Summary Results of Activities July 1, 2010 – June 30, 2011

The Office of Audit Services (OAS) is responsible for internal and external audits as well as financial statement review and analysis. The 2010-11 school year represented the second year of the Office of Audit Services Two-Year Audit plan. This report summarizes the activities of OAS in the second year of carrying out the plan.

OAS is managed by a director, two audit managers and one support staff. There are currently 13 professional auditors on staff in the positions of associate and senior auditors as well as two education specialists.

During this second year of the plan the Office of Audit Services:

- Issued final reports on 15 audits and one consultant engagement.
- Received and analyzed over 1,000 financial statements which included 690 school districts, 37 BOCES, 138 charter schools and 188 colleges and universities.
- Sent 557 letters related to missing items in the financial statements.
- Provided analysis of 137 charter schools financial statements to the Department's Charter School office.
- Analyzed the financial statements of 188 college and university financial statements. As a result of the analysis we issued 35 advisory memo's to the Office of Higher Education for their action.
- Reviewed financial data and provided analysis of 128 institutions to the Bureau of Proprietary School Supervision.
- Reveiwed 915 A-133 single audit during this year which included 652 school districts, 38 BOCES, 23 charter schools and 202 not for profit institutions and issued 145 letters containing the Department's determination on the audit findings.
- Ensured the Department's compliance with Section 170.12 of the Commissioners Regulations by tracking and receiving 1,745 corrective action plans between July 2009 and June 2010.

The Office did not entirely complete all of the initiative contained in the original approved plan because of excess days needed to complete audits from the prior plan, some audits taking significantly more resources than planned and the conduct of some special request audits..

• Original two-year plan called for the completion of 43 audits, OAS completed 25 with 8 in process.

Attachment II

Audit	Procurement	Claims Processing	Payroll	Cash	Financial Reporting	Information Technology	Extraclassroom Activity Fund	Segregation of Duties	Budgeting	Conflict of Interest	Medicaid Revenue Enhancements	Tuition Assistance Program (TAP)	Energy Management	Other
Office of Audit Services														
* Altmar-Parish-Williamstown Central School District (footnote 1)														\checkmark
* Roosevelt Union Free School District (footnote 4)														\checkmark
Office of the State Comptroller														
Amsterdam (Greater) City School District														
Bainbridge-Guilford Central School District														
Bayport-Blue Point Union Free School District														
Berkeley College TAP Audit (2010-T-2)												\checkmark		
Berne-Knox-Westerlo Central School District	\checkmark													
Bethlehem Central School District	\checkmark								\checkmark					
* Bridgehampton Union Free School District (footnote 5)														\checkmark
* Broome-Tioga BOCES (footnote 2)					\checkmark				\checkmark					\checkmark
Carmel Central School District														
Cayuga-Onondaga BOCES										\checkmark				
Central Islip Union Free School District											\checkmark			
Chenango Valley Central School District														
Cohoes City School District														
* Colton-Pierrepont Central School District and Parishville- Hopkinton Central School District (footnote 8)														\checkmark
Corinth Central School District									\checkmark					

Audit	Procurement	Claims Processing	Payroll	Cash	Financial Reporting	Information Technology	Extraclassroom Activity Fund	Segregation of Duties	Budgeting	Conflict of Interest	Medicaid Revenue Enhancements	Tuition Assistance Program (TAP)	Energy Management	Other
Corning City School District														
Dryden Central School District														
Eden Central School District														
Elmont Union Free School District	\checkmark			\checkmark						\checkmark				
Fonda-Fultonville Central School District								\checkmark						
Franklinville Central School District														
Hannibal Central School District	\checkmark													
Hilton Central School District														
Ilion Central School District					\checkmark									
Iroquois Central School District														
Ithaca City School District													\checkmark	
Johnstown (Greater) City School District							\checkmark							
Kendall Central School District					\checkmark									
Kingston City School District			\checkmark								\checkmark			
Lakeland Central School District		\checkmark												
Lexington School for the Deaf	\checkmark													
Liberty Central School District									\checkmark					
Miller Place Union Free School District			\checkmark											
* Newburgh Enlarged City School District (footnote 8)														\checkmark
* Newfane Central School District (footnote 8)														\checkmark
* Orange-Ulster BOCES (footnote 2)														\checkmark
Owego-Apalachin Central School District													\checkmark	
Pocantico Hills Central School District														
Putnam Valley Central School District														

September 2011	6	2	4	7	10	18	1	1	8	3	2	1	6	11
* New York City Department of Education (footnote 7)														
New York City Office of the Comptroller	- [1				I	[
Windham-Ashland-Jewett Central School District														
Watertown City School District														
Waterford-Halfmoon Union Free School District	\checkmark				\checkmark									
Vestal Central School District													\checkmark	
Union-Endicott Central School District													\checkmark	
* Union Free School District of the Tarrytowns (footnote 3)														\checkmark
Trumansburg Central School District														
** Troy (Enlarged) City School District														
Stillwater Central School District														
* State Education Department (2011-F-6) (footnote 6)						,								
Schuylerville Central School District					,									
Saugerties Central School District														
** Sachem Central School District ** Sagaponack Common School District														
Audit	Procurement	Claims Processing	Payroll	Cash	Financial Reporting	Information Technology	Extraclassroom Activity Fund	Segregation of Duties	Budgeting	Conflict of Interest	Medicaid Revenue Enhancements	Tuition Assistance Program (TAP)	Energy Management	Other
	nent	essing	=	_	porting	ion ogy	room und	of Duties	bu	nterest	evenue 1ents	stance TAP)	agement	

- American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) Funds CoSer Operations Debt Financing Graduation Rates 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.
- 5. 6.
- Non-Resident Tuition Regent Examination Scoring School Progress Reports Transportation Costs
- 7.
- 8.

** No recommendations

The Department's Internal Audit Workgroup met to review each of the audits being presented this month. Letters will be sent to all of the auditees reminding them of the requirement to submit a corrective action plan.

	Office of Audit Services						
Audit	Major Finding(s)	Recommendation/Response					
Altmar-Parish- Williamstown Central School District Use of American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) Funds Awarded for the July 1, 2009 - June 30, 2010 School Year. ARRA-1010-22 5th Judicial District	The amount of projected cash expenditures claimed by the District on their June 25,2010 FS-25 for ARRA-ESF, included both encumbered and expended amounts for a project to upgrade the District's security system. In addition, one of the claimed security system expenditures was \$225 greater than what was documented on the vendor's invoice. Further, the District did not prepare semi-annual certifications for two employees whose salaries were being paid with ARRA-IDEA 611. The District also did not prepare personnel activity reports for one employee whose salary was partially paid from ARRA-IDEA 619, 13 employees whose salaries were partially paid from ARRA-ESF, and 49 employees whose salaries were partially paid from ARRA-Title I.	5 recommendations The report's recommendations focus on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to ARRA-ESF grants, undocumented ESF costs, personnel activity reports, and interest earned on Federal funds. <i>The District agreed with the</i> <i>recommendations and indicated</i> <i>that they will implement corrective</i> <i>action.</i>					
Roosevelt Union Free School District Data Accuracy and Reliability SD-1110-01 10th Judicial District	Finally, the District earned interest amounting to \$170.58, and has not yet returned the \$70.58 that is supposed to be returned to the Department. There was significant improvement in the reporting and documentation of student data over the three year period. However, the District's reported graduation cohorts for 2003, 2004, and 2005 were misstated in SIRS. Additionally, records at the District did not contain documentation to support a majority of the students who were designated as having transferred out of the District, and student file documentation showed that 12 students, for all three cohort years, did not have the correct transfer code assigned to them. Student records also did not contain documentation to support all students coded as graduates, some students coded as non-graduates met the necessary graduation	4 recommendations The report's recommendations focus primarily on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to supporting documentation and graduation rates. The District agreed with the majority of the recommendations and have indicated they will implement corrective action, or					

	requirements, and students did not always receive the	have already done so.
	appropriate diploma type to which they were entitled.	
	Finally, the District reported a 10 percent graduation rate for	
	Finally, the District reported a 19 percent graduation rate for the 2003 cohort and a 59 percent graduation rate for the 2004	
	and 2005 cohorts, but we found that the District's graduation	
	rates are 25, 31, and 50 percent for the 2003, 2004, and 2005	
	cohorts, respectively.	
	Office of the State Comptroller	
Audit	Major Finding(s)	Recommendation/Response
A Comparison of Liquid	LP-powered buses cost more than the diesel alternative.	1 recommendation
Propane-Powered and	However, New York State currently provides NYSERDA grant	
Diesel-Powered School	funds to bridge the difference in cost. It was also determined	(6 recommendations for the 6
Buses	that LP fuel costs - with help from a Federal tax credit - are	districts)
2011-MR-1	lower, and that maintenance of LP buses is less expensive.	
Bainbridge-Guilford	However, paying for LP infrastructure (fueling stations) could	It is recommended that when
Central School District	add to a district's start-up costs for using LP buses. If	considering the purchase of new
(P4-10-61), Ithaca City	government tax credits for LP-powered buses continue to be	school buses, district officials
School District (P4-10-	available, and if surcharges on diesel-powered buses	should analyze the comparative
64), Owego-Apalachin	continue to increase, LP-powered buses can be a lower-cost	costs and benefits of diesel- and
Central School District	alternative to diesel-powered buses. LP fuel is also safer to	LP-powered buses to determine if
(P4-10-63),	use and store than diesel fuel.	LP-powered buses can provide
Trumansburg Central		better overall long-term value in
School District (P4-10-		meeting the district's transportation
60), Union-Endicott		needs.
Central School District		District affinials for a difficient
(P4-10-59), and Vestal		District officials from all Districts
Central School District		agreed with the recommendations
(P4-10-62)		and have indicated that they will
6th Judicial District		implement corrective action.

Amsterdam (Greater) City School District 2011-2012 Budget Review B5-11-12 4th Judicial District	While it is generally advised against to use the fund balance to finance expenses beyond legally mandated levels, given current economic conditions and planned reductions in State Aid, the District's actions were found to be reasonable. However, the District must be aware that a fund balance available for operations could eventually be depleted.	It is recommended that District officials closely monitor the District's use of fund balance to ensure that action is taken, if necessary to reduce appropriations and/or identify other funding sources that can be used if fund balance is no longer available to fund District operations. A response has not yet been
Bayport-Blue Point Union Free School District Information Technology Controls in School Districts 2011M-111 10th Judicial District	The vulnerabilities identified in the audits are not discussed in the report due to the sensitivity of the information. Rather, the findings were communicated separately to District officials so they could take corrective action	received from the District . 1 recommendation The District stated that it has taken action towards reviewing policy and identifying changes that need to take place to best fit the technology environment. The actions will be identified in the corrective action plan, which will address all findings and recommendations.
Berkeley College (Manhattan Campuses) Tuition Assistance Program (TAP) Awards 2010-T-2 1 st Judicial District	It was determined that Berkeley College was overpaid \$634,714, because school officials incorrectly certified students as eligible for Tuition Assistance Program (TAP) awards. The accuracy of the school's certifications were tested for the three-year period ended June 30, 2008, by reviewing a sample of 200 randomly-selected awards. From the sample, 16 payments totaling \$18,108 were disallowed. The projection of these 16 awards to the school's payment population for the three-year period results in an audit disallowance of \$558,320. 65 awards totaling \$76,394	3 recommendations It is recommended that the Higher Education Services Corporation (HESC) recover \$634,714 plus interest from Berkeley College for incorrect TAP certifications. It is also recommended that HESC ensure that Berkeley officials verify that residency and citizenship requirements are met for students

	from outside the three-year period were also disallowed.	who are certified as TAP eligible.
		It is recommended that the Department ensure Berkeley officials comply with Department requirements relating to matriculation, full-time attendance, good academic standing, and accelerated TAP payments.
		A response has not yet been received from the Department or HESC regarding the recommendations.
Berne-Knox-Westerlo Central School District	District officials did not properly segregate the Treasurer's	14 recommendations
Internal Controls Over	duties and did not implement procedures for the electronic transfer of funds as required by Board policy.	The recommendations focused
Selected Financial		primarily on strengthening the
Activities and Information Technology 2011M-16	The duties related to performing the electronic transfers were not properly segregated and the agreements with the District's banks had deficiencies. District officials also did not comply with an enforce the District's purchasing policies for the	policies and procedures regarding purchasing, cash disbursements, and information technology.
3rd Judicial District	with or enforce the District's purchasing policies for the procurement of goods and services when competitive bidding was not required by law.	The District agreed with the recommendations and have indicated that they implement
	District officials also have not developed a disaster recovery plan, and have not established adequate controls to protect the District's file servers and confidential data stored on the servers.	corrective action.
Bethlehem Central	The District did not have statutory authority for a reserve fund	6 recommendations
School District Internal Controls Over	that had a balance of \$1.89 million in the 2010-11 fiscal year. Therefore, the District's general fund unreserved fund balance	The recommendations focused on
Budgeting and	should have been reported as \$5.7 million, which was 6.5	strengthening the policies and

Purchasing	percent of the subsequent year's budget and in excess of the	procedures regarding the surplus
2010M-243	statutory limit.	fund balance, reserve funds, the
3rd Judicial District		segregation of purchasing duties,
	In addition, the purchasing agent did not effectively monitor	purchasing policies, and contracts.
	the District's purchasing procedures, and as a result, District	parendonig peneleo, and contracto.
	staff made certain purchases that were not in the best interest	The District agreed with the
	of District taxpayers. District staff made purchases for gifts	recommendations and have agreed
	totaling \$4,274 in violation of the New York State Constitution,	to implement corrective action.
	from employee-owned businesses totaling \$5,838 in violation	
	of Board policy. They also entered into professional service	
	contracts totaling \$718,800 and purchased other items not	
	subject to competitive bidding requirements totaling \$16,800 -	
	without seeking price competition - in violation of Board	
	policy.	
BOCES Treatment of	Both BOCES (Broome-Delaware-Tioga and Orange-Ulster)	8 recommendations
the Annual Surplus	have been generating significant and growing surpluses	o recommendations
From CoSer Operations	because they routinely overbill for CoSer services, and	(13 recommendations for the 2
2011-MS-1	regularly have priced CoSer services higher than necessary	BOCES)
(Broome-Tioga BOCES	to cover CoSer costs. It was determined that BOCES set	
(S9-10-53) and Orange-	tuition rates using historical enrollment rates rather than	The report's recommendations
Ulster BOCES (S9-10-	current year enrollment projections from districts.	focused on strengthening the
54))		policies and procedures pertaining
6th and 9th Judicial	Additionally, BOCES do not make mid-year pricing	to increasing surpluses from CoSer
District	adjustments based on actual program participation that would	operations, delays in reporting and
District	reduce overbilling. As a result, Broome-Tioga (BT) BOCES'	paying surplus amounts to school
	surplus grew 45 percent (from \$7.3 million to \$10.5 million)	districts, and inappropriate
	and Orange-Ulster (OU) BOCES' surplus rose 141 percent	retention of adult education
	(from \$3.8 million to \$9.1 million) between 2006-07 and 2008-	surplus.
	09. The school districts served by BT and OU BOCES do not	ourpiuo.
	include significant surpluses, which averaged \$500,000 per	Both BOCES generally disagreed
	participating district in 2008-09, on their financial statements	with certain areas in the report, as
	because neither BOCES provides individual districts with an	
		well as the report's overall tone.
	estimate of their surplus refunds until mid-way through the	

	next fiscal year.	Orange-Ulster BOCES specifically disagreed with the
	Finally, BT BOCES accumulated unreserved fund balance from one CoSer in violation of Education Law, and incorrectly reported these monies on its financial statements. BT BOCES made significant profits on their CoSer's adult education courses, and used the funds to make discretionary purchases.	disagreed with the recommendation pertaining to increasing surplus and tuition billing.
Bridgehampton Union Free School District Non-Resident Tuition 2011M-13 10th Judicial District	Twenty-one non-resident students attended the District in 2009-10, and 19 non-resident students attended the District in 2010-11, representing approximately 13 percent of the District's 150 students. According to the Board's adopted policies and related resolutions, the tuition for these non-resident students could have totaled \$256,225 for the fiscal years 2009-10 and 2010-11. However, the District only charged tuition totaling \$144,575 for these students. The District has collected \$100,525 of the tuition charged, with \$42,800 still expected to be collected for 2010-11. The remaining \$1,250 is lost revenue for one student as the	2 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding non-resident tuition. District officials have indicated that they will review their policies to be sure they are accurate and will continue to charge and bill for the
	District failed to collect an outstanding balance for the 2009- 10 school year.	appropriate rates moving forward.
Carmel Central School	District officials did not establish adequate IT policies and	6 recommendations
District Internal Controls Over Information Technology 2011M-21 9th Judicial District	procedures, and District employees did not use District-owned computers in accordance with the Board's adopted policy. A teacher's District computer was used to access pornographic websites, and District employees spent 314 hours during the audit period accessing five non-job-related sites from District computers, which we estimate cost District taxpayers \$9,834 in wasted productivity.	The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to internal controls over information technology.
	Further, District personnel spent 1,691 hours, with an estimated salary value of \$52,962, on a social networking site. Finally, District officials did not have a disaster recovery	The district response did not specifically address each recommendations. However, the District believes its filters were

Cayuga-Onondaga BOCES Internal Controls Over Administrators' Private Business Interests	plan or classify the District's data according to its sensitivity and importance in the event of system disruption. The Board and BOCES officials have created a work environment where there is an inappropriate blending of employees' public responsibilities and their private business interests. We found that private work hours and public work hours cannot be distinguished. In fact, some employees'	correctly blocking pornographic websites. The instance in question was an uncategorized website. In addition, the employee in question was dealt with appropriately. The District also disagreed to a certain extent with the Comptrollers recommendations regarding use of computers for personal business and the amount of time identified in the report may be overstated. 7 recommendations The recommendations focused on strengthening the policies pertaining to administrator's private
2010M-149 7th Judicial District	BOCES work responsibilities mirror the work they do in their private business enterprises. They provide the same services for the same exact school districts they serve as a BOCES employee, at times using materials in their private business that they developed as a BOCES employee. In addition, we also found an Assistant Superintendent, whose 2009-10 salary was \$152,527, also "contracts" with BOCES in a barter	business interests. The BOCES indicated they plan on implementing all seven of the recommendations.
	arrangement to provide additional services to BOCES and is allowed to run his private business out of the BOCES offices. This individual also provides his services to some of the same school districts through his private business enterprise that he also serves as a BOCES employee.	
Central Islip Union Free School District Medicaid Revenues 2011M-89 10th Judicial District	Medicaid-eligible claims for at least 10 students were not submitted for reimbursement because District officials responsible for Medicaid reimbursements were not aware of the services that these students had received.	6 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining

	In addition, District officials did not submit claims for students	to Medicaid revenues.
	they knew received IEP-related services, case reviews, or	
	transportation services due to a lack of documentation. In	The District officials agreed with the
	other cases, the District had documentation but did not submit	recommendations and have
	it, or the services were not provided under the direction of a	indicated that they will implement
	licensed therapist or speech pathologist. As a result, Medicaid	corrective action.
	claims for reimbursement for 50 students, totaling \$301,008	
	were not submitted. If these claims had been submitted and	
	approved, the District and New York State would have	
	received 25 percent of the cost, totaling \$75,252 each.	
Chenango Valley	The significant revenue and expenditure projections in the	1 recommendation
Central School District	proposed budget are reasonable.	
2011-2012 Budget		It is recommended that District
Review	The District plane to make one time expanditures and	officials include the surplus fund
B4-11-9	The District plans to make one-time expenditures and	•
	additional debt payments, as well as increase reserves by	balance in the 2011-12 budget.
6th Judicial District	\$900,000 (before June 30, 2011), in order to reduce the	This approach will also avoid the
	amount of the unappropriated fund balance from \$2.2 million,	need to spend the money quickly
	to \$1.3 million.	before the year's end.
	Lleven the District's entropy of size ways at the requirement	The District has not used submitted a
	However, the District's approach circumvents the requirement	The District has not yet submitted a
	that the District's voters approve District expenditures through	response pertaining to the
	an annual budget vote	recommendation.
Cohoes City School	The vulnerabilities we identified in the audits are not	1 recommendation
District	discussed in these reports due to the sensitivity of this	
Information Technology	information. Rather, the findings have been communicated	The District indicated that
Controls in School	separately to District officials so they could take corrective	corrective actions have already
Districts	action.	been initiated.
2011M-112		
3rd Judicial District		
Colton-Pierrepont	The differences between construction costs of two separate	2 recommendations
Central School District	bus garages and of a shared transportation facility were	
and Parishville-	calculated. It was determined that certain costs would be	It is recommended that the Districts

Hopkinton Central School District Shared Transportation Facility 2011M-27 4th Judicial District	duplicated by building two separate bus garages. (For example, with two bus garages, both Districts would be paying for land, site work, and architect and legal services.) By having one shared facility these types of costs are reduced. Using the architect's cost projections, it is estimated that by building a new shared facility instead of building separate facilities, the Districts could save taxpayers about \$1.9 million just in construction costs alone. In addition, if the Districts could share buses, they would need fewer total buses, and they could collectively purchase one less bus each year and save about \$100,000 annually.	 consider utilizing a shared transportation facility, and if the shared facility is constructed, a formal inter-municipal agreement should be used to define and clarify the arrangement. Both Districts agreed with the recommendations and indicated that they planned to implement corrective action.
Corinth Central School District Fund Balance and Reserves 2010M-256 4th Judicial District	The Board and District officials consistently overestimated expenditures and underestimated revenues, which resulted in annual operating surpluses, and appropriated fund balance they did not need, resulting in increases to fund balance of \$2.8 million over the last four fiscal years. Further, the District's unreserved, unappropriated fund balance exceeded the amount allowed by law in each of the last four years. It is estimated that the District has over \$1.89 million in excess fund balance and unnecessary reserves that could be used to benefit taxpayers.	8 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to fund balance and reserves. The District stated that there was a general feeling of agreement toward the findings and recommendations in the draft report, and that once a final report is issued, they will respond accordingly.
Corning City School District Information Technology Controls in School Districts 2011M-113 7th Judicial District	The vulnerabilities identified in the audits are not discussed in these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather, the findings have been communicated separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	1 recommendation The District indicated that it had received the draft report and has currently prepared a corrective action plan for the audit findings.

	The second PC as the strength of the second s	
Dryden Central School	The vulnerabilities identified in the audits are not discussed in	1 recommendation
District	these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather,	T I () I ()
Information Technology	the findings have been communicated separately to District	•
Controls in School	officials so they could take corrective action.	focused on strengthening the
Districts		policies pertaining to information
2011M-114		technology.
6th Judicial District		
		The District agreed with the
		recommendations and has
		indicated that they will implement
		corrective action.
Eden Central School	District officials have not properly managed fund balance in	6 recommendations
District	accordance with statute. Over the past three years, District	
Financial Condition and	officials used non-transparent practices to reduce fund	The report's recommendations
Health Insurance	balance levels to within statutory limits rather than using	focused primarily on strengthening
Benefits	surplus monies to reduce the tax levy as required by statute.	the policies and procedures
2011M-51	District officials did not disclose their intent during the budget	regarding the District's financial
8th Judicial District	process to use \$1.5 million to fund various reserves. Instead	condition, and health insurance
our succear District	they simply transferred excess fund balance at year end.	benefits.
	liney simply transiened excess fund balance at year end.	benefits.
	Additionally for the fiscal years 2006.07 through 2000.10	District officials agreed with the
	Additionally, for the fiscal years 2006-07 through 2009-10	District officials agreed with the
	District officials appropriated more than \$4.6 million of fund	recommendations and have
	balance to finance operations. However, because the District	indicated that they will implement
	consistently experienced operating surpluses over this period,	corrective action.
	the appropriated fund balance was not actually used to	
	finance operations. As a result of District officials' financial	
	management and non-transparent budgeting practices,	
	taxpayers likely have been paying more than necessary to	
	fund District operations.	
	There were also significant procedure and control deficiencies	
	over the monitoring and reviewing of health insurance	
	benefits. However, a review of health insurance records	

	indicated that the District was generally providing appropriate health insurance benefits in accordance with employment contracts and collective bargaining agreements.	
Elmont Union Free School District Internal Controls Over Selected Financial Operations 2011M-12 10th Judicial District	The Board inappropriately delegated the discretionary functions of approving purchase orders, journal entries and wire transfers to its business consultant. Consequently, the business consultant was responsible for approving all District purchases, including the purchase of his own services. In addition, he approved journal entries and wire transfers for the two months reviewed totaling \$25.4 million, representing a combined 93 percent of all such activity for those two months. The District also paid four former employees \$9,820 for unused vacation leave that was not expressly authorized by their employment agreements, or by Board resolutions. District officials generally did not solicit competition when obtaining professional services and continued to use the same professionals year after year. Payments made to 10 professionals, totaling \$1.23 million, we reviewed, and it was determined that six of the professionals, who were paid \$1 million, were hired without the benefit of competition.	 16 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to procurement, information technology, and cash disbursement procedures. The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Enlarged City School District of Troy 2011-2012 Budget Review B5-11-13 3rd Judicial District	The significant revenue and expenditure projections in the proposed budget are reasonable.	There are no recommendations.

Fonda-Fultonville	The Deard did not adapt on online banking policy and did not	6 recommondations
	The Board did not adopt an online banking policy and did not	6 recommendations
Central School District	develop procedures for online banking activities. Online	
Online Banking	banking duties were not properly segregated and account	The report's recommendations
2011M-62	accessibility was not properly controlled.	focused on strengthening the
4th Judicial District		policies and procedures pertaining
	Additionally, the Treasurer and Deputy Treasurer did not use	to online banking.
	proper procedures when accessing and exiting online banking	
	sessions. Finally, the Treasurer and Deputy Treasurer did not	District officials agreed with the
	receive appropriate online banking training and access to the	recommendations and have
	District's bank accounts has not been monitored. As a result,	indicated that they will implement
	District funds are at risk.	corrective action.
Franklinville Central	While District officials did a good job of controlling	6 recommendations
School District	expenditures, District budgets routinely overestimated	
Financial Management	appropriations. As a result, the District generated more than	The report's recommendations
2011M-7	\$2.3 million in operating surpluses over a three-year period.	focused on strengthening the
8th Judicial District		policies and procedures pertaining
	Additionally, four District reserves funded by budget surpluses	to fund balance, surplus fund
	had unsupported balances totaling \$2.3 million at June 30,	balance, reserves, and
	2010. Combining the District's unreserved fund balance over	expenditures.
	the legal limit and the unsupported balances in the four	'
	reserves, the District has accumulated \$4.1 million in excess	The District agreed with the
	funds that should be used to benefit taxpayers.	recommendations and have
		indicated that they will implement
		corrective action.
Hannibal Central School	The District officials did not seek competitive bids, as	3 recommendations
District	required, for two of 10 purchases totaling \$57,500. They also	
Internal Controls Over	did not obtain the required number of written or verbal quotes,	The report's recommendations
Purchasing and Fuel	as stated in the School Business Administrator's guidelines	focused on strengthening the
Inventories	for purchases under the bidding threshold, for five of 21	policies and procedures pertaining
2011M-49	purchases totaling \$18,344. The District also paid four of	to competitive bidding, and
5th Judicial District	seven professional service providers a total of \$183,600	gasoline inventory.
	without soliciting competition.	g
		District officials agreed with the
	1	Lieuret emerale agreea mar are

Hilton Central School	Finally, District officials should improve controls over gasoline and diesel fuel inventory. The District could not account for 3,123 gallons of fuel valued at \$6,739 because the District has not established policies and procedures to effectively control these inventories. The vulnerabilities identified in the audits are not discussed in	recommendations and have indicated that they will implement corrective action. 1 recommendation
District	these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather,	The recommendations focused on
Information Technology Controls in School	the findings have been communicated separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	strengthening the policies and
Districts		procedures pertaining to
2011M-115 7th Judicial District		information technology.
		The District agreed with many of the recommendations contained in the report and will implement corrective action.
Ilion Central School	The District has accumulated approximately \$1.95 million in	6 recommendations
District Financial Condition and Internal Controls Over Cafeteria Receipts 2010M-242 5th Judicial District	excess funds that should be used to benefit taxpayers. The District retained at least twice the amount of fund balance allowed by law in each of the last four fiscal years' budgets. The District's budgets have resulted in operating surpluses in three out of the last four fiscal years. Therefore, none of the fund balance that was appropriated in those three years was actually used, and the District's year-end fund balance actually increased rather than decreased.	The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to the internal control over cafeteria receipts, and financial condition. <i>District officials agreed with the</i> <i>recommendations, and have</i>
	Finally, the District has not established adequate internal controls over cafeteria cash receipts.	indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Iroquois Central School	The vulnerabilities identified in the audit was not discussed in	1 recommendation
District	the report due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather,	The report's recommendations
Information Technology Controls in School	findings were communicated separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the

Districts 2011M-116 8th Judicial District		policies and procedures pertaining to information technology. The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement
Johnstown (Greater) City School District Internal Controls Over Extra-Classroom Activities 2011M-28 4th Judicial District	Although the Board established a policy for the activity fund, the policy is not adequate because it does not provide specific guidance for the financial management and recordkeeping of the activity fund, and it has not been updated since 2001. The District developed an extra-curricular handbook to supplement the Board policy; however, the handbook has not been formally adopted by the Board. Furthermore, while the handbook is more comprehensive than the District policy, it still does not establish adequate internal controls over extra- curricular activity monies.	corrective action.6 recommendationsThe report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures regarding extraclassroom activities.District officials agreed with the recommendations and have indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Kendall Central School District Financial Condition 2011M-18 8th Judicial District	As of June 30, 2010, the District overstated certain liabilities by \$6 million and overfunded certain reserves by a total of \$1.85 million. Had the liabilities been properly accounted for and the reserves reasonably funded, the combined total of \$7.85 million would have increased the District's actual unreserved, unappropriated fund balance to \$8.5 million at the end of the 2009-10 fiscal year, representing 52 percent of the ensuing year's appropriations of \$16.2 million. In addition, District officials had borrowed money the District did not need in amounts ranging from \$1.5 million to \$2 million, and incurred associated debt issuance and interest costs totaling almost \$195,000, during the last three completed fiscal years.	5 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to the District's financial condition. The District agreed with the recommendations and agreed to implement corrective action.

Kingston City School	Controls over cash disbursements for certain service	11 recommendations
District	providers by vendors were not appropriately designed and	11 recommendations
Internal Controls Over	operating effectively. The District made payments for various	The report's recommendations
Selected Financial	services that did not comply with agreed-upon contractual	focused on strengthening the
Activities	conditions and rates.	policies and procedures pertaining
2011M-78		to cash disbursements, banking,
3rd Judicial District	The District also has a lack of comprehensive policies and	Medicaid claims processing, and
	procedures, which has allowed control deficiencies to exist in	information technology.
	the areas of bank agreements, dedicated computers, Internet	
	usage, and online banking access.	The District agreed with the
		recommendations and have
	Further, one Board member had a prohibited interest in a	indicated that they will implement
	District contract, and another Board member did not disclose	corrective action.
	his interest in a District contract, as required.	
	Internal controls over Medicaid claims processing for special	
	needs transportation are not appropriately designed or	
	operating effectively. The District did not require its vendor	
	bus drivers to maintain ridership calendars and, therefore, the	
	District was unable to submit claims for reimbursement	
	totaling \$114,620.	
	The Board also has not developed a formal, written disaster	
	•	
Lakeland Central	recovery plan. At an average salary of \$89,719 for technology	4 recommendations
School District	administrators, the District could save approximately	4 recommenuations
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	The report's recommendations
Administrative Costs	\$209,942 if it chose to operate its instructional technology	The report's recommendations
Relating to Instructional	program with technology administrators equal to twice the	focused on strengthening the
Technology Operations	average of other similar districts. In addition, by revaluating	policies and procedures pertaining
and Claims Processing	the amount of resources utilized for videographer and website	to the administrative costs for
2010M-246	services, the District could potentially save an additional	instructional technology operations.
9th Judicial District	\$68,000.	
		The District agreed with the

	Finally, the Board has not adopted a written job description, policies, and/or procedures to provide specific instructions and communicate its expectations to the claims auditor. As a result, the claims auditor, who has served in that position for the past 10 years, was not aware of the requirement to report	recommendations and indicated that they will implement corrective action.
	directly to the Board.	
Lexington School for the Deaf Review of Procurement	The initial audit report was issued on January 14, 2010, and examined whether Lexington officials had established and	Both of the recommendations have been implemented.
Practices Follow-up 2011-F-8	maintained an adequate system of internal control over its procurement practices. It was determined that Lexington officials did not comply with Department guidance for	
11th Judicial District	procurement of goods and services valued at more than \$10,000 and public works valued at more than \$20,000. Lexington officials also did not always comply with their own policies and procedures when procuring goods and services valued at more than \$5,000. The objective of the follow-up was to assess the extent of implementation as of June 10, 2011 of the two recommendations included in the initial report.	
Liberty Central School	It was found that the significant revenue and expenditures	1 recommendation
District 2011-2012 Budget Review B4-11-10 3rd Judicial District	projections in the proposed budget are reasonable. In the District's proposed budget, there is an appropriation of \$1.15 million of projected fund balance to help finance the District's 2011-12 operations. This will leave \$2 million as unappropriated fund balance, an amount that is \$400,000	It is recommended that the District include the surplus fund balance in the 2011-12 budget and use this money to benefit taxpayers.
	over the limit allowed by statute.	The District has not yet responded to the recommendation.
Miller Place Union Free School District	District officials did not implement formal procedures for retirement reporting. Retirement reports prepared by a payroll	4 recommendations
Internal Controls Over Retirement Reporting and Cash	clerk that were submitted to New York State and Local Retirement System (NYSLRS) were not reviewed for accuracy, nor approved by an appropriate official. As a result,	The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining

Disbursements	five employees improperly received service credit for 534.3	to retirement reporting, and the
2011M-67	days they did not earn.	cash disbursements process.
10th Judicial District		
	The District's internal controls over cash disbursements are	The District agreed with the
	appropriately designed and operating effectively to safeguard	recommendations and has
	cash.	indicated that they will implement
		corrective action.
Newburgh Enlarged City	The District can save money by reducing excess capacity on	6 recommendations
School District	buses, and sharing transportation for students with disabilities	
Transportation Cost	with other districts. By making these changes to improve	The recommendations focused on
Savings	transportation efficiency, the District could achieve as much	strengthening the policies and
2010M-230	as \$2.2 million in annual cost savings.	procedures pertaining to
9th Judicial District		transportation performance
	In addition, the District did not have a process for tracking	measures and analysis and State
	approved transportation contracts or timely reconciling	transportation aid.
	transportation expenditures and as a result the District's State	
	Transportation Aid may be reduced by approximately	The District disagreed with the
	\$938,000. The District also had missed the opportunity to	recommendation that District
	claim an additional \$30,900 in expenditures which were	officials should maximize the
	attributable to approved contracts and would have provided	capacity of students on each bus to
	approximately \$24,700 in additional aid to the District.	reduce the number of bus routes.
		The remainder of the
		recommendations were agreed
		upon, and the District has indicated
		that they will implement corrective
		action.
Newfane Central School	Although the District properly established an EBALR, it did not	4 recommendations
District	fund the reserve in an appropriate manner. The Employee	
Employee Benefit	Benefit Accrued Liability Reserve (EBALR) is overfunded by	The report's recommendations
Accrued Liability	\$8.1 million. In addition, by increasing bus occupancy,	focused on strengthening the
Reserve Fund and	eliminating bus routes, and sharing common routes with	policies and procedures pertaining
Student Transportation	neighboring districts, the District could potentially save in	to the EBALR and student

Operations 2010M-232 8th Judicial District	excess of \$418,000 annually in transportation costs. This amount represents approximately 20 percent of the District's student transportation costs in the 2009-10 fiscal year.	transportation. The District disagreed with the findings pertaining to the EBALR, but agreed to implement corrective action with regard to student transportation.
Pocantico Hills Central School District Information Technology Controls in School Districts 2011M-117 9th Judicial District	The vulnerabilities we identified in the audits are not discussed in these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather, we have communicated our findings separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	1 recommendation The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to information technology.
		The District agreed with the recommendations and have indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Putnam Valley Central School District Information Technology Controls in School Districts 2011M-118 9th Judicial District	The vulnerabilities we identified in the audits are not discussed in these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather, we have communicated our findings separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	2 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to information technology. The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Sachem Central School District Internal Controls Over Purchasing	The District had established adequate internal controls over purchasing and these controls seemed to be working effectively.	There were no recommendations.

2011M-48 10th Judicial District		
Sagaponack Common School District Non-Resident Tuition 2011M-33 10th Judicial District	The Board adopted a non-resident tuition rate of \$3,000 per student for 2010-11. The maximum tuition the Board could charge according to the SED formula was \$52,179 per student. In 2010-11, five of the District's 18 students were non-residents for whom the District billed and collected tuition totaling \$15,000. There was no evidence that students from other districts significantly increase the District's costs. Therefore, while the District is not charging the SED approved rate, the tuition it is collecting helps cover a small portion of the District's costs.	There were no recommendations.
Saugerties Central School District Financial Condition and Internal Controls Over Information Technology 2011M-50 3rd Judicial District Fiscal Stress	The District's adopted budget for the 2007-08 fiscal year contained an inaccurate estimate of State aid revenues, in excess of the State Education Department's (SED's) published estimates. This resulted in an operating deficit of \$1.9 million. Although the District had revenue shortfalls in the 2008-09 year, it did not have an operating deficit. However, the District again overestimated State aid in the 2009-10 fiscal year, which brought the total operating deficit to \$1.5 million. These combined operating deficits reduced the unreserved fund balance in the District's general fund to a deficit of over \$1.1 million at June 30, 2010. Further, as a result of revenue shortfalls, District officials found it necessary to issue a \$3 million revenue anticipation note (RAN) in July 2009 and a \$4.9 million RAN in June 2010 to meet cash flow needs during the 2009-10 and 2010-11 fiscal years. Finally, District management needs to improve controls over IT.	7 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to financial condition, and information technology. The District agreed with the recommendations and have indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Schuylerville Central School District	The vulnerabilities identified in the audits are not discussed in these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather,	1 recommendation
Information Technology Controls in School	the findings have been communicated separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the

Districts 2011M-119 4th Judicial District		policies and procedures pertaining to information technology.The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
State Education Department Oversight of Scoring Practices on Regents Examinations 2011-F-6	The initial audit report was issued on November 19, 2009, and the objective was to determined whether SED oversight of local school districts provided adequate assurance that the districts accurately scored Regents exams. It was determined that SED reviews of the scoring of selective Regents exams identified significant inaccuracies by local school districts. Of the 12 recommendations included in the initial report, eight of them were implemented, two were partially implemented, and one was not implemented. The two partially implemented recommendations pertained to developing a corrective action plan and then following up with the school for improper scoring practices, and obtaining and reviewing all exams requested by schools during a Department review. The recommendation that was not implemented was regarding requesting that schools with significant exam scoring deficiencies advise SED of any changes made to exam scores as a result of errors identified by the Department	Of the 12 recommendations included in the initial report, eight of them were implemented, two were partially implemented, and one was not implemented. <i>The Department disagreed with the</i> <i>recommendation that requesting</i> <i>that schools with significant exam</i> <i>scoring deficiencies advise SED of</i> <i>any changes made to exam scores</i> <i>as a result of errors identified by</i> <i>the Department Review. The small</i> <i>sample of tests selected and the</i> <i>timing of reviews would make any</i> <i>adjustment of individual student</i> <i>scores unfair and impractical.</i>
Stillwater Central School District Budgeting Practices 2011M-47	Review.The Board routinely adopted budgets that were conservative, particularly for expenditures. For the last five fiscal years, the District overestimated expenditures by a total of approximately \$4.8 million. The conservative budget	3 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the

	-	1
4th Judicial District	estimates resulted in revenues exceeding expenditures by approximately \$2.8 million over the last five years. Furthermore, the District's spending plans made it appear that the District would appropriate a portion of its accumulated	policies and procedures pertaining to budget estimates, and the surplus fund balance.
	fund balance each year to close projected budget gaps. In	The District agreed with the
	reality, the District's budget resulted in an operating surplus in	recommendations and has
	the last five completed fiscal years and no fund balance was ever used as a source of financing in those years.	indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Union Free School	District officials did not provide any documentation to show	3 recommendations
District of the	that they performed the necessary analysis of potential debt	
Tarrytowns	refinancing measures that may have identified ways to reduce	The report's recommendations
Debt Refinancing	interest costs over the life of the District's debt.	focused on strengthening the
2011M-4 9th Judicial District		policies and procedures pertaining to debt financing.
		to debt infancing.
		The District agreed with the recommendations and have indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Waterford-Halfmoon	The Board did not fully comply with the requirements of the	15 recommendations
Union Free School	2005 School District Accountability Legislation. Specifically,	T 0 10
District Internal Controls Over	one Board member did not obtain the required training as to his financial oversight responsibilities. Although the Board did	The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the
Financial Operations	appoint a claims auditor, she did not report directly to the	policies and procedures pertaining
2010M-251	Board or perform a satisfactory audit of claims. Additionally,	to board oversight, and internal
4th Judicial District	the Business Manager circumvented the Board's policy by	controls over financial operations.
	making budget transfers totaling approximately \$1.1 million,	
	without obtaining the required Board approval. Internal	The District agreed with the
	controls over financial operations are also inadequate. For example, the Board's policy manual does not provide for the	recommendations and has indicated that they would
	proper segregation of duties and Business Office employees	implement corrective action.
	have the ability to circumvent any internal controls in place.	
	Finally, employees have received buy-out and longevity	

	payments totaling \$59,670 to which they may not have been entitled.	
Watertown City School District Information Technology Controls in School Districts 2011M-110 5th Judicial District	The vulnerabilities identified in the audits are not discussed in these reports due to the sensitivity of this information. Rather, the findings have been communicated separately to District officials so they could take corrective action.	5 recommendations The report's recommendations focused on strengthening the policies and procedures pertaining to information technology procedures.
		The District agreed with the recommendations and has indicated that they will implement corrective action.
Windham-Ashland-	The District has not established sufficient controls over its IT	15 recommendations
Jewett Central School	system. District officials have not established a formal security	
District	plan, do not adequately monitor system activity, and have not	The report's recommendations
Internal Controls Over	established appropriate controls over remote access and	focused primarily on strengthening
Information Technology	backing up system data.	the policies pertaining to the
and Online Banking		District's IT system, and online
2010M-248	In addition, the Board has not established a formal online	banking and wire transfers.
3rd Judicial District	banking policy and procedures governing electronic and wire transfers. The Business Manager serves as the online	The District agreed with the
	banking contact/administrator for all of the District's online	recommendations and has
	banking activity and has online access to the bank accounts	indicated that they will implement
	for transactional purposes. However, she also records	corrective action.
	transactions and has the responsibility for monitoring all	
	electronic banking activity with limited oversight by other	
	District officials. With these incompatible duties, the Business	
	Manager could initiate an online wire transfer to an	
	unauthorized bank account without immediate detection.	

New York City Office of the Comptroller			
Audit	Major Finding(s)	Recommendation/Response	
New York City	In 2006-07, the Department of Education (DOE) implemented	10 recommendations	
Department of	annual School Progress Reports for the purpose of creating		
Education	greater accountability, establishing expectations, and	The report's recommendations	
Audit Report on the	uniformly measuring and comparing school progress. The	focused on strengthening the	
Department of	progress reports reflect letter grades that rate how each of the	policies and procedures regarding	
Education's Controls	City's public schools is performing. The audit determined	school progress reports.	
Over High School	whether DOE maintained adequate controls to ensure that		
Progress Reports	data reflected in the annual high school progress reports are	The Department agreed with the	
MJ10-133A	reliable, comparable, and understandable so that	recommendations and have	
1st, 2nd, 11th, 12th,	stakeholders could reasonable rely on the progress reports	indicated that they will implement	
13th Judicial District	for decision-making purposes.	corrective action.	
	It was determined that DOE maintained adequate controls; however, there were some instances where hard-copy student files and/or Regents exam documentation were not available for review.		