TO: The Honorable the Members of the Board of Regents
FROM: Tony Lofrumento
SUBJECT: Summary of the December 2017 Meeting
DATE: January 11, 2018

AUTHORIZATION(S):

Executive Summary

Issue for Decision

Review of the Summary of the December 2017 Meetings of the Board of Regents.

Proposed Handling

Approval of the Summary of December 2017 meetings.

Procedural History

This document summarizes the actions of the Board of Regents during the monthly meeting and is brought before the Board the following month for approval.

Recommendation

Approval of the Summary of the December 2017 meetings.

Timetable for Implementation


VOTED, that the Summary of the December 2017 Meetings of the Board of Regents of The University of the State of New York be approved.

BR (A) 2
SUMMARY OF THE DECEMBER 2017 MEETING

OF THE BOARD OF REGENTS

OF

THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK

Held at the State Education Building
Albany, New York

December 11 and 12, 2017

Anthony Lofrumento, Secretary
Board of Regents
THE BOARD OF REGENTS

The Board of Regents of The University of the State of New York held a public session on Monday, December 11, 2017 at 9:00 a.m. pursuant to a call to duty sent to each Regent.

MEETING OF THE FULL BOARD, Monday, December 11th at 9:00 a.m.

Board Members in Attendance:
Betty A. Rosa, Chancellor
T. Andrew Brown, Vice Chancellor
Roger Tilles
Lester W. Young, Jr.
Christine D. Cea
Wade S. Norwood
Kathleen M. Cashin
James E. Cottrell
Josephine Victoria Finn
Judith Chin
Beverly L. Ouderkirk
Catherine Collins
Judith Johnson
Nan Eileen Mead
Luis O. Reyes
Susan W. Mittler

Also present were Commissioner of Education, MaryEllen Elia, Executive Deputy Commissioner, Elizabeth Berlin, Counsel and Deputy Commissioner for Legal Affairs, Alison B. Bianchi, and the Secretary, Board of Regents, Anthony Lofrumento. Regent Elizabeth S. Hakanson was absent and excused.

Chancellor Betty A. Rosa called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and asked Regent Reyes to provide thoughts for a moment of reflection.

ACTION ITEM

Executive Session Motion

MOVED, that the Board of Regents convene in executive session, Tuesday, Tuesday, December 12th at 11:40 a.m. to discuss litigation matters.

Motion by: Vice Chancellor T. Andrew Brown
Seconded by: Regent Christine D. Cea
Action: Motion carried unanimously
PRESENTATION

Regents Early Childhood Work Group Blue Ribbon Committee Presentation

Commissioner Elia, Regent Young, Regent Reyes, Zoila Morell, Ph.D. and Ms. Sherry Cleary presented recommendations with fiscal implications to transform the birth to age eight early care and education system in the state of New York (Attachments I and II.)

Chancellor Betty A. Rosa adjourned the meeting.
MEETING OF THE FULL BOARD, Tuesday, December 12th at 11:50 a.m.

**Board Members in Attendance:**
Betty A. Rosa, Chancellor
T. Andrew Brown, Vice Chancellor
Roger Tilles
Lester W. Young, Jr.
Christine D. Cea
Wade S. Norwood
Kathleen M. Cashin
James E. Cottrell
Josephine Victoria Finn
Judith Chin
Beverly L. Ouderkirk
Catherine Collins
Judith Johnson
Nan Eileen Mead
Luis O. Reyes
Susan W. Mittler

Also present were Commissioner of Education, MaryEllen Elia, Executive Deputy Commissioner, Elizabeth Berlin, Counsel and Deputy Commissioner for Legal Affairs, Alison B. Bianchi, and the Secretary, Board of Regents, Anthony Lofrumento. Regent Elizabeth S. Hakanson was absent and excused.

Chancellor Betty A. Rosa called the meeting to order at 11:50 a.m. and asked Regent Cashin to provide thoughts for a moment of reflection.

**ACTION ITEM**

Charter Applications  
BR (A) 1

MOVED, that the Board of Regents approve each application in accordance with the recommendations contained in the summary table (see Appendix I).

**Summary of the November 2017 Meetings of the Board of Regents**  
BR (A) 2

MOVED, that the Summary of the November 2017 Meetings of the Board of Regents of The University of the State of New York be approved.

Motion by: Regent Beverly L. Ouderkirk  
Seconded by: Regent Roger Tilles  
Action: Motion carried unanimously.
PROGRAM AREA CONSENT ITEMS

Office of Counsel

2018 Regulatory Agenda  
BR (CA) 14

MOVED, that the 2018 Regulatory Agenda for the State Education Department be approved, as submitted.

Adult Career and Continuing Education Services

Appointments to the New York State Independent Living Council, Inc.  
BR (CA) 1

MOVED, that Vernon Bonse be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Kathryn Carroll be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Chad Eldred be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Lynn Drucker be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Robin Jones be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.


MOVED, that Maria Samuels be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.


MOVED, that Raymond Pierce be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Joseph Bravo be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.
MOVED, that Daniel Fuster be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Lindsay Miller be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Henry Nixon be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Clifton Perez be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Edith Prentiss be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

Appointment to the New York State Rehabilitation Council
BR (CA) 2

MOVED, that Valerie DeClara be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.


MOVED, that Mica Gonzales be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Peter Herring be appointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Susan Scheer be appointed for a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Joan Parker be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Tonya Robinson-Mayer be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.

MOVED, that Michael A. Sherman be reappointed to a three-year term beginning January 1, 2018 and ending December 31, 2020.
Higher Education

Conferral of Degrees: Dowling College; Globe Institute of Technology; and Elim Bible Institute and College

BR (CA) 3 - REVISED

MOVED, that the Board of Regents confer upon the following individuals, who have completed the requirements for registered degree programs at Dowling College; Globe Institute of Technology; and Elim Bible Institute and College the respective degrees as listed below:

Dowling College

The following students have completed the requirements for their respective awards as indicated:

*Master of Science (M.S.)*
Guinta, Christina Marie
Skidmore, Erin A.
Vella, Suzanne Joseph

*Bachelor of Business Administration (B.B.A.)*
Jahanmir, Lyssa F.
Snyder, Christopher Thomas

*Bachelor of Science (B.S.)*
George, Anthony Joseph

*Advanced Certificate*
Coggiano III, Anthony

Globe Institute of Technology

The following student has completed the requirements for the Bachelor of Business Administration (B.B.A.) award:

Juncaj, Preka

The following student has completed the requirements for the Associate in Applied Science (A.A.S.) award:

Raad, Joseph G.
Elim Bible Institute and College

The following students have completed the requirements for the Associate in Applied Science (A.A.S.) award:

Auker, Holly J.
Aument, Lenita E.H.
Bhujel, Ram Chandra
Brecht, Victoria Elise
Brich, Tyler C.
Caballero Peredo, Fernando Javier
Carter, Kristina Ceara
Czysz, Kerina Starr
Forster, Aaron James
Garcia, Khrista Rebecca
Gorog, Ethan Emerich
Gudiwada, Nikhil John
Guilzon, Benjamin Mark
Hunt, Nicole Kristine
Jangam, Prasanna Kumar
Johnston, Jennifer Mildred
Kaiser, Jillian Grace
Khadka, Bijaya
Kryva, Kseniia
Lauffenburger, Jessica Grace
Luffy, Stephen Matthew
Lynn, Luke Edward
Marchitell, Jacob A.
Markova, Yoana Marcheva
Miller, Emily Ruth
Nantongo, Sylvia Karen
Ortiz, Marlanie Ann
Piontek, Keith A.
Puddington, Meghan Grace
Quick, Stephen Anthony
Schlager, Eli N.
Smales, Mariah Joy
Sotelo, Christopher Luke
Sterlace, Sarah Reneé
Sylvester, Christian James
Thorpe, Meredith Joy
VanSanten, Jeremy E.
Winheld, Abigail J.

Proposed Amendment to Add a New Section 80-5.26 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education to Allow a Temporary Certificate for Teachers
Displaced from Puerto Rico and/or Another U.S. Territory as a Result of Hurricane Maria to Teach in New York State

BR (CA) 4

MOVED, that Section 80-5.26 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education be added, as submitted, effective January 15, 2018, as an emergency action upon a finding by the Board of Regents that such action is necessary for the preservation of the general welfare to immediately certify teachers in New York State who were affected and displaced by Hurricane Maria for a temporary period of time and to ensure that the emergency rule that was adopted at the October 2017 meeting remains in effect until it can be adopted as a permanent rule.

Proposed Amendment to Section 80-6.1 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to Continuing Teacher and Leader Education for Teachers in Nonpublic Schools to Implement Chapter 311 of the Laws of 2017

BR (CA) 5

MOVED, that §80-6.1 of the Regulations of the Commissioner be amended, as submitted, effective January 15, 2018, as an emergency action upon a finding by the Board of Regents that such action is necessary for the preservation of the general welfare in order to immediately adopt the proposed amendment to timely implement the changes to Education Law §3006-a, as amended by Chapter 331 of the Laws of 2017 and to ensure that the emergency rule adopted at the October 2017 Regents meeting remains continuously in effect until it can be adopted as a permanent rule.

Proposed Amendment to Section 145-2.1 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Eligibility Criteria for the Tuition Assistance Program

BR (CA) 6

MOVED, that paragraph (4) of subdivision (a) and subdivision (e) of §145-2.1 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education be amended, as submitted, effective December 27, 2017.

The State University of New York College at Oneonta: Master Plan Amendment to offer a Bachelor of Science (B.S.) Degree in Exercise Science

BR (CA) 8

MOVED, that the Board of Regents approve a master plan amendment to authorize the State University of New York College at Oneonta to offer its first program in the Health Professions. The amendment will be effective until December 12, 2018, unless the Department registers the program prior to that date, in which case master plan amendment shall be without term.
Update on the edTPA Standard Setting Panel and Amendment to Section 80-1.5 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education to Extend the edTPA Safety Net and Revise the Eligibility Criteria for the Multiple Measures Review Process

BR (CA) 15

MOVED, that §80-1.5 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education be amended, as submitted, effective December 27, 2017.

Professional Practice

(Re)Appointments of Members to the State Boards for the Professions and (Re)Appointments of Extended Members to the State Boards for the Professions for Service on Licensure Disciplinary and/or Licensure Restoration and Moral Character Panels

BR (CA) 9

MOVED, that the Regents approve the proposed (re)appointments.

Report of the Committee on the Professions Regarding Licensing Petitions

BR (CA) 10

MOVED, that the Regents approve the recommendations of the Committee on the Professions regarding licensing petitions and degree conferrals.

Regents Permission to Operate in New York State: University of Vermont

BR (CA) 11

MOVED, that the Regents approve the proposed permission to operate which authorizes the University of Vermont to use six clinical agencies in New York for clinical education of students enrolled in its FNP, ANP and CNL programs leading to the DNP degree.

Proposed Amendment of §70.10 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Mandatory Peer Review Program in Public Accountancy

BR (CA) 12

MOVED, that paragraph (5) of subdivision (b) of §70.10 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education be amended, as submitted, effective January 15, 2018, as an emergency action upon a finding by the Board of Regents that such action is necessary for the preservation of the public health and general welfare to ensure that the emergency rule adopted at the October 2017 Regents meeting remains continuously in effect until the proposed rule can be presented for adoption and take effect as a permanent rule.
Reappointment of Adjunct Members of the Regents Review Committee
BR (CA) 12

MOVED, that Regents should approve the proposed reappointments.

MOVED, that the Regents approve the consent agenda items.

Motion by: Regent Roger Tilles
Seconded by: Regent Nan Eileen Mead
Action: Motion carried unanimously.

STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS

CULTURAL EDUCATION

Your Committee on Cultural Education Committee had its scheduled meeting on December 11, 2017. Regent Roger Tilles, Chair of the Cultural Education Committee, submitted the following written report. In attendance were committee members: Regent Tilles, Chair, Regent Cea, Regent Cottrell, Regent Chin, Regent Johnson, Regent Ouderkirk, and Regent Mead. Regents, in addition to CE Committee Members, in attendance were: Chancellor Rosa, Vice Chancellor Brown, Regent Norwood, Regent Collins, and Regent Mittler. Also in attendance were Commissioner Elia, Executive Deputy Commissioner Berlin, Senior Deputy Commissioner for Education Policy Jhone Ebert, and Counsel and Deputy Commissioner for Legal Affairs Alison Bianchi.

ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION

Canaan Historical Society – Executive Session [CE (A) 1]

The Cultural Education Committee convened an executive session at 3:00 p.m. in the matter of whether the Board of Regents should hold a hearing pursuant to Education Law §226(4) on the application of Philip Warner to remove Gary and Tammy Flaherty from their official positions within the Canaan Historical Society and order the transfer of certain artifacts to another cultural entity.

Regent Tilles motioned that the Committee recommend the following action to the Full Board of Regents:

VOTED: That the Board of Regents determine that a hearing in this matter is not required and dismiss the petition in its entirety, pursuant to §3.31(t) of the Rules of the Board of Regents. Petitioner has sought relief not available under Education Law §226(4), and petitioner has alleged facts which, even if proven true, would not warrant removal under Education Law §226(4).
Regent Cea seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously. The Full Board will consider the Committee’s recommendation in this matter at its meeting on Tuesday, December 12, 2017.

The Cultural Education Committee convened a public session at 3:20 p.m.

Chair’s Remarks: Regent Tilles introduced Deputy Commissioner Mark Schaming who provided a brief report on Office of Cultural Education news and activities including State Museum work with the State University at Albany to offer students the opportunity to participate in an archaeology field school at two sites in Albany: Ten Broeck Mansion and the Stephen and Harriet Myers Residence. Deputy Commissioner Schaming also provided an update on a successful 4th Annual Taste NY Holiday Market that brought in over 5,000 members of the public on December 3rd, and noted the creation of an educator guide for the Votes for Women exhibition which align with the Next Generation Standards for ELA and Social Studies framework.

Update on Library Regents Advisory Council 2020 Vision Plan [CE (D) 2]

State Librarian Bernard Margolis provided an update on policy recommendations for library services in New York State. In April 2012, the Board of Regents accepted the Regents Advisory Council on Libraries policy recommendation report, Creating the Future: A 2020 Vision and Plan for Library Service in New York State, which provides sixty recommendations for improving and advancing library services. The Department has used the Advisory Council’s report, as it has used previous Commission and task force reports, as a key resource for developing statewide policies and program priorities.

Genealogical Resources at the State Archives [CE (D) 1]

Monica Gray, Archives & Records Management Specialist 2 presented an overview of the genealogical resources available from the State Archives and will review the impact of online access to images and indexes, highlighting the Archives’ relationship with Ancestry.com. Use of genealogical resources continues to be one of the most popular services of the State Archives. During the first nine months of 2017, over 56,000 unique users accessed genealogical resources on the State Archives website. During the same period, images of State Archives records containing genealogical information available through Ancestry.com were accessed a total of 5,186,020 times. The unique relationship with Ancestry.com enabled the State Archives to digitize, index and make available records from 51 different records series, including nearly 600,000 service records from New Yorkers who served in World War I, records of the sales of Loyalist land 1762-1830, New York Censuses from 1892-1925, Civil War muster rolls, and pension claims of disabled Revolutionary War veterans. These materials are available free of charge to New Yorkers through a contractual agreement with Ancestry.com.
HIGHER EDUCATION

Your Higher Education Committee held its scheduled meeting on December 12, 2017. All members were present.

Action Items

MOTION FOR ACTION BY FULL BOARD

Madam Chancellor and Colleagues: Your Higher Education Committee recommends, and we move, that the Board of Regents act affirmatively upon each recommendation in the written report of the Committee’s deliberations at its meeting on December 12, 2017, copies of which have been distributed to each member of the Board of Regents.

Matters Not Requiring Board Action:

Proposed Amendments to Part 30 of the Regents Rules and Section 52.21 and Part 80 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to a New Certification Area and Tenure Area for Computer Science

Your Committee discussed proposed amendments to Part 30 of the Regents Rules and Section 52.21 and Part 80 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education relating to a new certification area and tenure area for computer science. The amendment will establish a computer science certificate title that spans all grade levels in response to the growing need and desire to prepare students to succeed in a world with constantly evolving computer technologies. The amendments include adding computer science as a “special subject” tenure area and a provision that will “grandfather” in those currently teaching computer science. Following the 45-day public comment period required under the State Administrative Procedure Act, it is anticipated that the proposed amendments will come back to the Board of Regents at its March 2018 meeting. If adopted at the March 2018 meeting, the proposed amendment will become effective on March 28, 2018.

Proposed Amendment to Section 80-3.4 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Mentoring Requirement for Professional Certification

Your Committee discussed a proposed to Section 80-3.4 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education relating to the mentoring requirement for professional certification. This amendment would require that mentoring take place during the first 180 days of employment, rather than the first year of employment, allowing those hired later in a school year to participate in the full mentoring experience. Following the 45-day public comment period required under the State Administrative Procedure Act, it is anticipated that the proposed amendment will come back to the Board of Regents at its March 2018 meeting. If adopted at the March 2018 meeting, the proposed amendment will become effective on March 28, 2018.
Discussion of Whether Educator Preparation Programs Should be Considered Continuously Accredited If They Apply for Accreditation Through an Alternative Professional Association that is Seeking Recognition from the Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA) or the United States Department of Education (USDE)

Your Committee discussed a conceptual approach to consider educator preparation programs continuously accredited if they apply to an association that is applying to USDE or CHEA for national recognition within a certain time period. Your Committee approved this approach. Therefore, the Department will bring to the Board at its January 2018 meeting a proposed regulatory change to Section 52.21 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education to consider EPPs participating in an alternative accreditation process to be continuously accredited for program registration purposes. HE (D) 1

Proposed Amendment to Section 80-5.13 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education to Allow for Greater Flexibility in Alternative Teacher Preparation Programs

Your Committee discussed a proposed amendment to Section 80-5.13 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education to allow great flexibility in alternative teacher preparation programs. This amendment will maintain the three-year employment commitment for those candidates pursuing a Transitional B certificate, but in lieu of all three years being full-time, the proposed amendment allows a candidate to be initially employed part-time while gradually assuming more responsibility and ultimately teaching full-time for at least one school year. Following the 45-day public comment period required under the State Administrative Procedure Act, it is anticipated that the proposed amendment will come back to the Board of Regents at its March 2018 meeting. If adopted at the March 2018 meeting, the proposed amendment will become effective on March 28, 2018. HE (D) 3

Matters Requiring Board Action:

Proposed Amendment to Sections 30-3.2 and 30-3.5 of the Rules of the Board of Regents and Sections 52.21 and 80-3.10 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Adoption of the 2015 Professional Standards for Educational Leaders with Certain New York Specific Modifications for the Purpose of Registration of School Building Leader Programs and School Building Leader Evaluation

Your Committee approved a proposed amendment to adopt the 2015 Professional Standards for Educational Leaders (PSELs). The proposed amendment requires that all school building leader programs that are registered or seek registration under §52.21 of the Commissioner’s Regulations on or after December 1, 2020 be aligned to the PSELs, with modifications as recommended by the Principal Project Advisory Team. The proposed amendment also establishes new professional practice expectations for all principals. Any evaluations of the school building leaders under the new standards will go
into effect after December 1, 2022. In addition, the proposed amendment requires that any evaluation of principals conducted on or after December 1, 2022 shall be aligned to the PSELs, with modifications as determined by the Board of Regents. However, nothing shall be construed to abrogate any conflicting provisions of any collective bargaining agreement in effect on December 1, 2022 that requires the use of the 2008 ISLLC Standards. This change will require that all principal practice rubrics be resubmitted to the Department through an updated Request for Proposals, which the Department will release to the field prior to December 1, 2022. The proposed amendment will become effective on December 27, 2017.

**St. Paul’s School of Nursing Application for Degree-Granting Authority**

Your Committee approved the extension of provisional degree conferring authority to St. Paul’s School of Nursing at its Queens and Staten Island campuses. Regent Cea abstained from the vote. The Board requested a second motion requiring that the Department present the Board with St. Paul’s interim study and self-report in one year (December 2018). This motion was also approved.

**Consent Agenda**

The Board of Regents acted on the following consent agenda items at the December 2017 meeting.

- **Conferral of Degrees: Dowling College, Globe Institute of Technology and Elim Bible Institute and College** - Approved the conferral of degrees upon students successfully completing programs at Dowling College, Globe Institute of Technology and Elim Bible Institute and College. BR (CA) 3

- **Proposed Amendment to Add a New Section 80-2.26 to the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education to Allow Teachers Displaced from Puerto Rico and/or Another U.S. Territory as a Result of Hurricane Maria to Teach in New York State** - The Board approved an amendment to add a new Section 80-5.26 to the Commissioner’s Regulations to allow for a temporary certificate for teachers who have been displaced from Puerto Rico and/or other U.S. territories as a result of Hurricane Maria to teach in New York upon meeting certain requirements. BR (CA) 4

- **Proposed Amendment to Section 80-6.1 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to Continuing Teacher and Leader Education for Teachers in Nonpublic Schools to Implement Chapter 311 of the Laws of 2017** - The Board approved an amendment to conform the Commissioner’s Regulations to an amendment made to Chapter 311 of the Laws of 2017 which amended Education Law §3006-a. BR (CA) 5

- **Proposed Amendment to Section 145-2.1 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Eligibility Criteria for the Tuition
**Assistance Program** - The Board approved amendments to Section 145-2.1 of the Regulations which clarify the terms “economically disadvantaged” and “educationally disadvantaged” related to HEOP eligibility. BR (CA) 6

- **Master Plan Amendment: The State University of New York College at Oneonta** - Approved an amendment to the master plan to authorize the State University of New York College at Oneonta to offer a Bachelor of Science (B.S.) degree in Exercise Science. BR (CA) 8

**P-12 EDUCATION**

Your P-12 Education Committee held its scheduled meeting on December 11, 2017. All members were present, except for Regent Hakanson, who was excused. Regent Young started the meeting by introducing the Superintendent of the Newburgh Enlarged City School District, Dr. Roberto Padilla. Dr. Padilla introduced Linda Romano, a Health Science Teacher in his district, who was named national teacher of the year by the Association for Career and Technical Education. Ms. Romano started the Nurse Aide Program at Newburgh Free Academy which now has an enrollment of over 200 students.

**ACTION ITEMS**

Superintendent Determination Option for Certain Students with Disabilities to Graduate with a Local Diploma [P-12 (A) 1]

Your Committee recommends that paragraph (12) of subdivision (d) of section 100.5 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education be amended, as submitted, effective December 12, 2017, as an emergency action upon a finding by the Board of Regents that such action is necessary for the preservation of the general welfare in order to ensure that certain students with disabilities who are graduating from high school in January 2018 and thereafter are aware that they may be considered an eligible student for the superintendent determination option if they meet the requirements of the proposed rule. It is also necessary to ensure that superintendents are on notice that they must, upon the written request of a parent or guardian, make a determination as to whether certain students with disabilities are eligible for a local diploma, if the student meets the requirements of the proposed rule.

**MOTION FOR ACTION BY FULL BOARD**

Madam Chancellor and Colleagues: Your P-12 Education Committee recommends, and we move, that the Board of Regents act affirmatively upon each recommendation in the written report of the Committee’s deliberations at its meeting on December 12, 2017, copies of which have been distributed to each Regent.
MATTERS NOT REQUIRING BOARD ACTION

Senior Deputy Commissioner’s Report – Senior Deputy Commissioner Jhone Ebert updated the Committee on the following important initiative.

Next Generation Learning Standards Conference – On November 30 the Department held a conference on Next Generation Standards: Supporting All Students. This was a one-day professional learning opportunity to strengthen theoretical and practical knowledge to implement high quality, academically rigorous standards for all New York State students. Committee members recommended that Department staff ask districts to share with us their strategies for communicating with their constituents on the new standards and their plan to implement the standards in their classrooms. Staff will provide an update at a future meeting on those communication strategies.

Smart Schools Bond Act [P-12 (D) 1] – the Committee was provided with an update on the utilization of the Smart Schools Bond Act. Staff provided background information on the Smart Schools Bond Act and the Review Board process. Discussion focused on changes in the program as a result of the 2017-18 State Budget, such as changes to the sharing calculations for nonpublic schools and expanding the share available to religious and independent schools. New guidance, as well as accompanying IT system changes are well underway to reflect the change. In addition, a supplemental $25 million in loan funds for nonpublic school devices was made available under the new program – to assist nonpublic schools in districts that had already submitted Smart Schools Plans prior to the enactment of the program changes. Department staff will continue to work with districts to ensure that the Smart Schools Investment Plans that are submitted meet the requirements of the statute. When guidance reflecting the changes made in the 2017-18 Enacted Budget is approved, staff will contact districts affected by the new law to inform them of the changes.

Minimum Instruction Requirement for State Aid [P-12 (D) 2] – the Committee was provided proposed amendments to regulations relating to the minimum instruction requirement for State Aid. Staff reviewed current statute, regulation, and guidance and provided background on the 180-day Advisory Committee. The Advisory Committee held five regional meetings around the State and gathered feedback from school districts and stakeholders. As a result of these regional meetings, the Department has advanced proposed amendments to regulations that would provide school districts additional flexibility when establishing their school calendars and clarity around existing procedures relating to the scheduling of examinations, superintendent conference days, and extraordinary weather conditions. The proposed amendment will be submitted to the Board of Regents at a future meeting.

P-12 EDUCATION/HIGHER EDUCATION JOINT MEETING

Your P-12 Education and Higher Education Committees held a joint meeting on December 11, 2017. All members were present, except for Regent Hakanson, who was
excused.

**MATTERS NOT REQUIRING BOARD ACTION**

Grade-Level Extensions for Certain Candidates who hold a Students with Disabilities Generalist Teaching Certificate [P-12/HE (D) 1] – the Committees discussed proposed amendments to regulations relating to grade-level extensions for certain candidates who hold a Students with Disabilities Generalist certificate. Discussion focused on the four different extension certificates proposed for current holders of Students with Disabilities Generalist certificates. By extending the grade bands in which qualified teachers of students with disabilities may teach, the Department believes this will help to address the shortage of teachers of students with disabilities. The proposed amendments will be presented to the Board of Regents for adoption at their March 2018 meeting.

**PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE**

Your Professional Practice Committee held its scheduled meeting on December 12, 2017. All Committee members were present, except Regent Elizabeth S. Hakanson, who was excused. Chancellor Betty A. Rosa was also present, but did not vote on any case or action.

**ACTION ITEMS**

Professional Discipline Cases

Your Committee recommends that the reports of the Regents Review Committees, including rulings, findings of fact, determinations as to guilt, and recommendations, by unanimous or majority vote, contained in those reports which have been distributed to you, be accepted in 4 cases, with Regent Josephine Victoria Finn and Regent Catherine Collins both abstaining in two of those cases (Cal. Nos. 28908 & 28909). In addition, your Committee recommends, upon the recommendation of the Committee on the Professions, that 45 consent order applications and 13 surrender applications be granted, and further recommends that 1 summary suspension application be granted.

These recommendations are made following the review of 63 cases involving eighteen licensed practical nurses, seventeen registered professional nurses, seven licensed practical nurses who are also registered professional nurses, two licensed master health counselors, two pharmacists, one certified public accountant, one dentist, one licensed master social worker, one licensed master social worker who is also a licensed clinical social worker, one occupational therapist, one professional engineer, and one registered professional nurse who is also a nurse practitioner (Family Health) and also a nurse practitioner (Psychiatry).
Restorations

Your Committee recommends the following:

That the application of Ram S. Makkeror restoration of his license to practice as a physician in New York State be denied [PPC EXS (A) 4]

That the revised application of Henry Magiet restoration of his license to practice as a Pharmacist in New York State be granted. It is recommended that the determination rendered in this matter on October 17, 2017, the Vote and Order issued in this matter on October 17, 2017, all be deemed corrected to include the terms of probation of the Committee on the Professions (COP), as exhibit A of the COP Report and Recommendation, and that the determination rendered on October 17, 2017 shall otherwise remain in full force and effect. [PPC EXS (A) 5]

Approvals

Proposed Amendment of §29.7 of the Rules of the Board of Regents and §63.6 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Unprofessional Conduct Special Provisions and the Requirements for Substituting Interchangeable Biological Products for Prescribed Products in the Profession of Pharmacy – Your Committee recommends the following:

That subdivision (a) of section 29.7 of the Rules of the Board of Regents and paragraph (7) of subdivision (a) and clause (c) of subparagraph (ii) of paragraph (8) of subdivision (b) of section 63.6 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education be amended, as submitted, effective December 12, 2017, as an emergency action upon a finding by the Board of Regents that such action is necessary for the preservation of the public health and general welfare in order to timely implement the requirements of Chapter 357 of the Laws of 2017, which defined the terms “biological product” and “interchangeable biological product” and established the requirements for the substitution of a biological product, as well as the appropriate method of communication by the pharmacist to the prescriber notifying the prescriber of the substitution of the biological product dispensed. [PPC (A) 1]

MOTION FOR ACTION BY FULL BOARD

Madam Chancellor and Colleagues: Your Professional Practice Committee recommends, and we move, that the Board of Regents act affirmatively upon each recommendation in the written report of the Committee’s deliberations at its meeting on December 12, 2017, copies of which have been distributed to each Regent.

MATTERS NOT REQUIRING BOARD ACTION

Your Committee discussed several topics of interest, including:
Deputy Commissioner’s Report/Update

Full Board Consent Agenda Items

• Board (Re)Appointments
• Licensing Petitions
• Proposed Amendment of Section 70.10 of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education Relating to the Mandatory Peer Review Program in Public Accountancy
• Permission to Operate - University of Vermont Permission to Operate for Nursing Programs
• Reappointment of Adjunct Members of the Regents Review Committee

MOVED, that the Committee Reports be approved.

Motion by: Regent Beverly L. Ouderkirk  
Seconded by: Regent Judith Chin  
Action: Motion carried unanimously.

ACTION ITEM

Philip Warner vs. Gary Flaherty, in his official capacity as president, and Tammy Flaherty, in her official capacity as curator, of the Canaan Historical Society  
BR (A) 6

MOVED, that the Board of Regents determines that a hearing in this matter is not required and adopts the attached recommended decision which dismisses the petition in its entirety, pursuant to §3.31(t) of the Rules of the Board of Regents. Petitioner has sought relief not available under Education Law §226(4), and petitioner has alleged facts which, even if proven true, would not warrant removal under Education Law §226(4).

Motion by: Regent Wade S. Norwood  
Seconded by: Regent Josephine Victoria Finn  
Action: Motion carried unanimously.

2018-2019 Regents State Aid Proposal  
BR (CA) 7

Remarks from the State Aid Sub-Committee Co-Chairs to the Board of Regents Prior to Their Vote on the 2018–19 Regents State Aid Proposal
Beverly L. Ouderkirk, Co-Chair, State Aid Subcommittee:

Our Journey

Upon accepting our appointment as co-chairs of the Regents’ State Aid Subcommittee, Regent Nan Mead and I, determined that we shared a desire: that was to leave our mark on Education in NYS for its most valuable assets, its children.

We wished to carve a new path that recognizes the many needs of those students: mental health needs, issues of bullying, poverty, early childhood, English Language Learners, students with special needs, additional CTE opportunities and much more.

We chose to apply our diverse skills in reaching out to others, developing and nurturing relationships, listening intently, seeking input, and focusing on collaboration.

We recognized the importance of applying sensitivity to the growing needs of the diverse population of New York, its children and its communities as well as the immense and changing fiscal and still unknown challenges we are facing on both sides of Washington Avenue here in Albany.

From our many meetings with the leadership of numerous state level educational organizations to meetings with teachers and administrators across the state to exchanges with the Senate and Assembly Education Committee Chairs to our subcommittee colleagues and full BOR dialogue to the support and suggestions of our respected SED staff, our network and the richness of the collective brain grew and priorities clearly emerged.

Like the young girls, from the World of Inquiry School in Rochester in yesterday’s videos said, we could not have created this State Aid Budget Proposal and Legislative Priorities agenda without the valuable contributions of all of you. A sincere thank you! I/we look forward to the next steps in this process – hoping for continued collaboration and efforts to work together with the Governor and the Legislature.

Nan Eileen Mead, Co-Chair, State Aid Subcommittee:

Regent Ouderkirk and I spent many months meeting with our various partners, both internal and external, and we are grateful to all of them. Recognizing throughout that we are faced with a challenging fiscal environment both at the federal level as well as at the state level, we are pleased to put forth what we think represents the best ideas and focuses on our highest priorities based on feedback from our stakeholders. We thank you for this opportunity.
MOVED, that the Regents adopt the attached as their proposal on State Aid to school districts for the school year 2018-2019.

Motion by: Regent Judith Johnson
Seconded by: Regent Judith Chin
Action: Motion carried unanimously.

**Regents 2018-19 State Budget Priorities**

**BR (A) 4**

MOVED, that the Regents approve budget priorities as follows:

**Department Wide**

Building Oversight and Support Capacity at SED: Creation of a 5% set-aside within all new programs for administrative oversight and technical assistance, as is common in federal grants and programs.

Enhancing Transparency by Webcasting Regular Board of Regents Public Meetings

**P-12**

Access to High-Quality Early Education and Early Care Programs: Implementation of the recommendations of the Regents Early Childhood Workgroup’s Blue Ribbon Committee supporting a clear, coherent, and comprehensive strategy to ensure that all of New York State’s children have the fairness of an even start and have access to services that are developmentally appropriate and responsive to culture, race, ethnicity, language, citizenship status, and socioeconomic status.

Promotion of Positive School Climate and Bullying Prevention: Establish a Supportive Schools Grant Program and Technical Assistance Centers to provide resources for schools to be able to assess their current environment and provide them with the support necessary to develop and implement a plan, derived from evidence-based strategies and best practices, for improving school culture, climate, and safety, including prevention of and responses to bullying and ensuring and enhancing DASA compliance.

Expanding Access to Quality High-Level Coursework: Establish a grant program that would expand and scale up existing online coursework platforms that would be provided to high needs school districts at no cost to increase access

5% Set Aside  Efficiency

$200,000  Efficiency

$17 million  Early Learning

$10 million  ESSA

$3 million  ESSA
to advanced level coursework (AP) that is vetted by NYS certified school and district leaders or appropriate entities, inclusive of the needs of ELLs and SWDs, and delivered by a NYS certified teacher.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>Funding</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enhancing the Achievement of English Language Learners- Supporting Spanish Language Arts (SLA) test development and 3-8 and Regents exam translations in order to test student content and language mastery, not just their proficiency in English.</td>
<td>$4.43 million</td>
<td>ESSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Struggling Schools- Support for districts with schools identified under ESSA as Comprehensive Supports and Improvement (CSI) and Targeted Support and Improvement (TSI) in conducting needs assessments and ensuring school improvement plans include evidenced-based interventions.</td>
<td>$3.5 million</td>
<td>ESSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improving Transition Services to NYS Students at Neglected and Delinquent Facilities- Conduct a study of current policies, procedures, and practices related to transition into, among, and out of neglected and delinquent facilities and make recommendations to support the successful re-entry of students into school, post-secondary education, and/or employment.</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
<td>ESSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing High-Quality Professional Learning- Support developing and delivering high-quality professional learning for teachers and leaders across the state.</td>
<td>$2.9 million</td>
<td>ESSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creation of a Parent-Friendly Data Dashboard- Implementation of the data collection and reporting for all new data elements associated with the requirements of New York’s State ESSA plan.</td>
<td>$2.5 million</td>
<td>ESSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring Equal Opportunities for English Language Learners/Multilingual Learners Through Professional Development Technical Assistance &amp; Compliance Support- Enhance Regional Bilingual Education Resource Network (RBERN) support centers’ ability to support to districts in: increasing the English language proficiency and academic content gains of ELLs/MLLs; reducing dropout rates and increase graduation rates; and supporting ELL/MLL parents through culturally responsive and linguistically accessible resources.</td>
<td>$1.6 million</td>
<td>ESSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regents Exams in World Languages- Supporting the development of Regents Exams in Spanish and French.</td>
<td>$950,000</td>
<td>Efficiency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Higher Education

Supporting NYS Access & Opportunity Programs - Support and enhance the state’s opportunity programs. $10 million Equity

Enhancing Supports & Services for Postsecondary Success of Students with Disabilities (joint with ACCES) - Enhanced supports and services for identified students in New York State degree granting colleges and universities. $15 million Equity

Access to a Highly Qualified Diverse Teaching Workforce - Increasing the participation rate of historically underrepresented and economically disadvantaged individuals in teaching careers through Teacher Opportunity Corp II programs. $500,000 Equity

Addressing the Shortage of Bilingual Education Teachers & English to Speakers of Languages Teachers - Expand the Clinically Rich Intensive Teacher Institute program. $770,000 ESSA

Enhancing Teacher Effectiveness - Expanding the Albert Shanker grant to increase access to National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (National Board) certification, which allows teachers to hone their practice, provides professional development, and enhances teacher effectiveness. $500,000 Efficiency

Professional Practice

Development of an Electronic Licensing and Document Management System to Improve Customer Service - Replace a 35 year-old COBOL-based licensing system and enhance customer experience through use of funds resulting 15% registration fee increase authorized by the Legislature in 2009. Spending Authority Efficiency

Cultural Education

State Aid for Library Construction -- Increasing funding to better ensure that all New Yorkers continue to have access to state-of-the-art libraries. $6 million Equity

Expanding Access to Education Programs through Cultural Institutions - Support the Museum Education Act and establish competitive grants to support cultural institutions that seek to establish or improve museum education programs designed to improve and support student learning $5 million Equity
opportunities, including supporting the development of local curricular aids.

Expanding Public Broadcasting Education Programs - Increased State Aid to expand two Public Broadcasting programs, the Enterprise America and GPS for Success, statewide to each public television station.

$5 million Equity

ACCES

Bridge to College & Careers Pilot Program - Enable out-of-school youth and adults to obtain critical basic skills and high school equivalency diplomas which would lead to programs resulting in industry-recognized credentials for employment or a college degree.

Expanding Independent Living Services for Individuals with Disabilities - Independent Living Centers (ILCs) serve people with disabilities and their families by providing an array of services to help these individuals live a fully integrated and self-directed life.

$3 million Equity

$5 million Equity

2018 State Legislative Priorities

BR (A) 5

MOVED, that the Regents approve legislative priorities as follows:

P-12

Tenure and Seniority Protections for Bilingual and ESOL Teachers/Teaching Assistants - Require districts, in the event of an abolition of a position, to excess the teacher/teaching assistant with the least seniority in the tenure area of the position abolished, except where the retention of a less senior teacher/teaching assistant fluent in a specific language is necessary for the school to provide required bilingual/ESOL instruction.

Mandate Relief and State Aid Claims Flexibility - Eliminate or reduce a significant number of statutory mandates and provide greater flexibility relating to transportation, educational management services, special education requirements, as well as school aid and building aid payment flexibility.

Tuition Rate Setting Methodology for Special Act School Districts & 853 Schools - Establish a statutory growth index based on an average of state personal income growth to establish predictable and timely tuition increases and allow for improved budget planning. In addition, the proposal would authorize providers to establish a general reserve fund.

Equity

Efficiency

Efficiency
Regional Secondary Schools Advisory Council - Establish a temporary advisory council composed of legislative and advocacy stakeholders tasked with developing a legislative proposal to establish regional high schools.

Higher Education

Education Equity for DREAMers Act - Eliminate provisions in state law that require students to be a US citizen or permanent lawful resident to receive general awards, including TAP, academic performance awards, scholarships or other financial assistance.

Increasing Access to College and Reducing the Cost to Students through Early College High Schools & P-TECH - Codification of ECHS and P-TECH programs in statute.

Professional Practice

Enhanced Discipline Authority of the Licensed Professions - Add moral character requirements to the professions that currently do not have them, require that licensees notify the Department of a crime or pending conviction of a crime rather than when applying for registration/re-registration every 2-3 years, and create a summary suspension of a license when there are serious public health and safety issues.

ACCES

Enhancing Educational Supports for Students with Disabilities pursuing Post-Secondary Study - Expansion of Reader’s Aid program eligibility to students with print disabilities.

Motion by: Regent Luis O. Reyes  
Seconded by: Regent Judith Johnson  
Action: Motion carried unanimously.

State Education Department November 2017 Fiscal Report  
BR (A) 3

MOVED, that the Board accepts the November 2017 State Education Department Fiscal Report as presented.

Motion by: Regent Beverly L. Ouderkirk  
Seconded by: Regent Nan Eileen Mead  
Action: Motion carried unanimously.

Chancellor Rosa adjourned the meeting.
# Appendix I  
NEW YORK STATE BOARD OF REGENTS CHARTER ACTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Institution</th>
<th>Program Area</th>
<th>County (City/Town) of Location</th>
<th>Description of Charter Action(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brentwood Historical Society</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Suffolk (Brentwood)</td>
<td>Extend provisional charter for five years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee to Preserve the Narcissa Prentiss House</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Steuben (Prattsburgh)</td>
<td>Amend Regents certificate of incorporation to change the corporate address.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corfu Public Library</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Genesee (Corfu)</td>
<td>Grant provisional charter for five years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hopewell Depot Museum</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Dutchess (Hopewell Junction)</td>
<td>Grant provisional charter for five years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwood Public Library</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>St. Lawrence (Norwood)</td>
<td>Extend provisional charter for five years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania Railroad Technical &amp; Historical Society - Long Island Chapter</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Suffolk (Riverhead)</td>
<td>Grant a Regents certificate of incorporation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sand Lake Historical Society</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Rensselaer (Sand Lake)</td>
<td>Amend charter to update IRS dissolution language.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tugboat Preservation Project</td>
<td>CE</td>
<td>Ulster (Kingston)</td>
<td>Extend provisional charter for five years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Canandaigua Montessori School</td>
<td>P12</td>
<td>Ontario (Canandaigua)</td>
<td>Extend provisional charter for three years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The International School of Brooklyn</td>
<td>P12</td>
<td>Kings (Brooklyn)</td>
<td>Amend charter to change the corporate address and grant an absolute charter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Academy of the Arts</td>
<td>P12</td>
<td>Orange (Middletown)</td>
<td>Grant provisional charter for three years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohr Halimud/The Multi-Sensory Learning Center</td>
<td>P12</td>
<td>Kings (Brooklyn)</td>
<td>Consent to filing of certificate of amendment of assumed name “Committee on Dyslexia Education” to change the assumed name to “CODE: Committee on Dyslexia Education”.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix II

REGENTS ACTIONS IN 64 PROFESSIONAL DISCIPLINE CASES
AND 1 RESTORATION PETITION

December 11 - 12, 2017

The Board of Regents announced disciplinary actions resulting in the summary suspension of 1 license, revocation of 2 licenses, surrender of 13 licenses, and 47 other disciplinary actions. The penalty indicated for each case relates solely to the misconduct set forth in that particular case. In addition, the Board acted upon 1 restoration petition.

I. SUMMARY SUSPENSION

Mental Health Practitioners

Hamed Nazin Adaime; Licensed Mental Health Counselor; Watertown, NY 13601; Lic. No. 003444; Cal. No. 30204; Application for summary suspension granted.

II. REVOCATIONS AND SURRENDERS

Nursing

Aironn J. Copeland a/k/a Arionn J. James; Licensed Practical Nurse; Bronx, NY 10467; Lic. No. 284082; Cal. No. 29781; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to charges of sleeping without waking through the entirety of an overnight home care nursing shift and then filing a false report and progress notes fabricating her observations of the patient’s status and activities during the shift.

Mary P. Werner; Registered Professional Nurse; Mooresville, NC 28117; Lic. No. 370704; Cal. No. 29879; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to the charge of practicing the profession of nursing in the State of North Carolina when her license to practice nursing had expired.

Carol Anne Linzee Drastal; Registered Professional Nurse; El Cajon, CA 92021-3308; Lic. No. 307877; Cal. No. 29932; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee did not contest the charge of ordering medical device for a patient without the knowledge or authority from the treating physician and determining that a patient was ineligible for a cardiac study without having the authority to do so.

Sarah Kathryn Rankin a/k/a Sarah Turnbull Rankin; Licensed Practical Nurse; Des Allemands, LA 70030; Lic. No. 278570; Cal. No. 30005; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee did not contest the charge of falsifying a renewal application to the State of Louisiana for licensure as a licensed practical nurse by failing to report arrests in 2010, 2012 and 2013 as required.
Christine Marie Garza; Registered Professional Nurse; Dallas, TX 75230; Lic. No. 512184; Cal. No. 30024; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to the charge of having been convicted of Texas crime.

Wayne Michael Carter; Registered Professional Nurse; Longview, TX 75605-5180; Lic. No. 480537; Cal. No. 30047; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to the charge of having been convicted of Operating a Vehicle Under the Influence of Alcohol, a class B misdemeanor, in the State of Ohio, which if committed in New York State would constitute Driving While Intoxicated, class A misdemeanor.

Beth Ann Medina a/k/a Beth Ann Barber; Registered Professional Nurse; Chadron, NE 69337-0247; Lic. No. 514935; Cal. No. 30054; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee did not contest the charge of finding of professional misconduct by the Colorado State Board of Nursing for being dependent on habit-forming drugs or is a habitual user of a controlled substance or other drugs having similar effects, which if committed in New York State, would constitute professional misconduct for being dependent on, or a habitual user or narcotics, barbiturates, amphetamines, hallucinogens, or other drugs in violation of section 6509(4) of the New York Education Law.

Donna Elaine Robinson a/k/a Donna E. Locsin a/k/a Donna Jacobs; Licensed Practical Nurse; Sarasota, FL 34233; Lic. No. 084551; Cal. No. 30055; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee did not contest the charge of finding of professional misconduct by the Maine State Board of Nursing for performing acts beyond the authorized scope of the level of nursing for which being licensed, which if committed in New York State, would constitute professional misconduct for practicing the profession of nursing beyond its authorized scope in violation of section 6509(2) of the New York Education Law.

Renee N. Caruso; Licensed Practical Nurse; Mechanicville, NY 12118-1103; Lic. No. 293111; Cal. No. 30081; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to charges of having been convicted of Attempted Criminal Possession of a Controlled Substance, Petit Larceny and filing false report and failing to disclose a criminal conviction.

Christine Pearl Virga; Registered Professional Nurse; Chelsea, VT 05038; Lic. No. 466545; Cal. No. 30121; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to the charge of failing to disclose on her New York registration renewal application her discipline in the State of Vermont.

Jessica Grace Knight a/k/a Jessica Ringle; Registered Professional Nurse; Bakersfield, CA 93306-7465; Lic. No. 592818; Cal. No. 30122; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee did not contest the charge of, in the State of Louisiana,
demonstrating impaired behavior while on duty and subsequently testing positive for alcohol.

**Pharmacy**

Divy Dixit; Pharmacist; Edison, NJ 08820-3609; Lic. No. 049976; Cal. No. 29405; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to the charge of having been convicted of Grand Larceny in the 2nd Degree, class C felony.

Michael Robert Lindgren; Pharmacist; Merrick, NY 11566-2213; Lic. No. 058003; Cal. No. 29954; Application to surrender license granted. Summary: Licensee admitted to the charge of conduct in the profession which evidences moral unfitness.

**Social Work**

Mark Patrick Bernardini a/k/a Mark P. Bernardini a/k/a Mark Bernardini; Licensed Master Social Worker, Licensed Clinical Social Worker; Dannemora, NY 12929-2001; Lic. Nos. 060046, 069413; Cal. Nos. 28908, 28909; Found guilty of professional misconduct; Penalty: Revocation.

**III. OTHER REGENTS DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS**

**Dentistry**

Genrietta Arakelova; Dentist; Brooklyn, NY 11235; Lic. No. 050970; Cal. No. 28056; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Censure and Reprimand, $2,500 fine payable within 30 days.

**Engineering, Land Surveying and Geology**

Robert W. Schneck; Professional Engineer; Blue Point, NY 11715; Lic. No. 052788; Cal. No. 29799; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year actual suspension, 2 years probation, $1,000 fine payable within 6 months.

**Mental Health Practitioners**

Mark E. Hillman; Licensed Mental Health Counselor; Clifton Park, NY 12065; Lic. No. 001946; Cal. No. 28342; Found guilty of professional misconduct; Penalty: 2 year suspension, execution of suspension stayed, probation 2 years.

**Nursing**

Alicia M. Stanton; Licensed Practical Nurse; Rochester, NY 14617-1151, Rochester, NY 14620-1846; Lic. No. 266074; Cal. No. 27898; Found guilty of professional misconduct; Penalty: $500 fine, indefinite suspension until alcohol abuse-free and until fit to practice, probation 2 years to commence subsequent to termination of suspension and upon actual return to practice.
Alicia Monique Jackson; Registered Professional Nurse; Buffalo, NY 14215; Lic. No. 583781; Cal. No. 28159; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 6 month actual suspension, 18 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $250 fine payable within 6 months.

Elizabeth Brooke Killenbeck a/k/a Elizabeth B. Killenbeck; Registered Professional Nurse; Frankfort, NY 13340; Lic. No. 602563; Cal. No. 28242; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Allison Defibaugh; Registered Professional Nurse; Malta, NY 12020; Lic. No. 588650; Cal. No. 28713; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Indefinite actual suspension until fit to practice, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice.

Kathleen A. Gay; Licensed Practical Nurse; Rochester, NY 14626; Lic. No. 307513; Cal. No. 29438; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 month actual suspension, 23 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $500 fine payable within 9 months.

Kelly Marie Radford; Licensed Practical Nurse; Syracuse, NY 13204; Lic. No. 281343; Cal. No. 29639; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Indefinite actual suspension for no less than 3 months and until fit to practice, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $500 fine payable within 6 months.

Karen Marie Donegan a/k/a Karen M. Donegan; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; Elmira, NY 14905; Lic. Nos. 169792, 379338; Cal. Nos. 29669, 29670; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 month actual suspension, 23 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $500 fine payable within 6 months.

Amber Marie Fuller; Licensed Practical Nurse; Lockport, NY 14094; Lic. No. 309717; Cal. No. 29713; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Indefinite actual suspension until fit to practice, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $250 fine payable within 6 months.

Heather Andrea Chandonnait; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; Uniondale, NY 11553; Lic. Nos. 238066, 559716; Cal. Nos. 29715, 29716; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 month actual suspension, 23 month stayed suspension, 24 months probation, $1,500 fine.

Carrie A. Barrett; Licensed Practical Nurse; Brockport, NY 14420; Lic. No. 283048; Cal. No. 29717; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Indefinite actual
suspension until fit to practice, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $250 fine payable within 6 months.

Tasheena Butler; Licensed Practical Nurse; Brooklyn, NY 11233; Lic. No. 313401; Cal. No. 29723; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 month actual suspension, 23 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $250 fine payable within 6 months.

Lisa Ann Hammonds a/k/a Lisa A. Jenner; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; Ogdensburg, NY 13669; Lic. Nos. 228515, 541795; Cal. Nos. 29726, 29712; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 month actual suspension, 23 month stayed suspension, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $500 fine payable within 6 months.

Joan Antonoitte Duyan; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; Woodhaven, NY 11421; Lic. Nos. 235759, 545166; Cal. Nos. 29739, 29740; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspensions, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Nicole Renee Guzman-Webler; Registered Professional Nurse; Fort Drum, NY 13602; Lic. No. 671460; Cal. No. 29745; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 year stayed suspension, 1 year probation, $500 fine.

Donna G. Lints; Licensed Practical Nurse; Ilion, NY 13357; Lic. No. 205127; Cal. No. 29749; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 year stayed suspension, 1 year probation, $500 fine.

Roseann Marie Kessler; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; East Northport, NY 11731; Lic. Nos. 245450, 485648; Cal. Nos. 29751, 29752; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspensions, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Jodi L. Fisher a/k/a Jodi Lynn Lindberg a/k/a Jodi L. Downey; Registered Professional Nurse; Orlando, FL 32828; Lic. No. 545408; Cal. No. 29782; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Ann Marie Harvey Anglin; Licensed Practical Nurse; Machiasport, ME 04655; Lic. No. 304631; Cal. No. 29783; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 3 month actual suspension, 21 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice in the State of New York.

Vincent Poromon; Licensed Practical Nurse; Rochester, NY 14619; Lic. No. 305000; Cal. No. 29790; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 year stayed suspension, 1 year probation, $250 fine.
Donald B. Paradise; Registered Professional Nurse; Syracuse, NY 13214; Lic. No. 548396; Cal. No. 29808; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Thaddeus S. Engle; Registered Professional Nurse; Westernville, NY 13486; Lic. No. 619794; Cal. No. 29838; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 6 month actual suspension, 18 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence if and when return to practice, $500 fine payable within 3 months.

Sandra Marie Russ; Registered Professional Nurse; Oneida, NY 13421; Lic. No. 362127; Cal. No. 29847; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Indefinite actual suspension until fit to practice, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice.

Reginald Aumoith; Licensed Practical Nurse; Brentwood, NY 11717-1825; Lic. No. 306834; Cal. No. 29853; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 month actual suspension, 23 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

William Jarosz; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; Lockport, NY 14094; Lic. Nos. 221627, 445151; Cal. Nos. 29854, 29805; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspensions, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

April Lynn Lamberton; Registered Professional Nurse; Plattsburgh, NY 12901; Lic. No. 537510; Cal. No. 29871; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Michelle Elise Walker; Licensed Practical Nurse; Germantown, NY 12526; Lic. No. 313235; Cal. No. 29872; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Valerie J. Shaw; Registered Professional Nurse; Rome, NY 13440; Lic. No. 563512; Cal. No. 29884; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Indefinite actual suspension until fit to practice, upon termination of suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice, $500 fine payable within 6 months.

Marlene Cesar; Registered Professional Nurse, Nurse Practitioner (Family Health), Nurse Practitioner (Psychiatry); North Miami, FL 33181; Lic. No. 685799, Cert. Nos. 339066, 401789; Cal. Nos. 29901, 29902, 29903; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 year stayed suspension, 1 year probation to commence upon return to practice in the State of New York, $500 fine payable within 30 days.

Clifford Merrel Allen; Licensed Practical Nurse; Wynantskill, NY 12198; Lic. No. 245595; Cal. No. 29910; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 1 year stayed suspension, 1 year probation.
Alice D. Frost; Licensed Practical Nurse; Lehigh Acres, FL 33971; Lic. No. 098532; Cal. No. 29911; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: Censure and Reprimand, $250 fine payable within 3 months.

Nicole L. Myers a/k/a Nicole Evans; Licensed Practical Nurse; Augusta, GA 30906; Lic. No. 296702; Cal. No. 29918; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice in the State of New York, $250 fine payable within 30 days.

Maria Joseph Etim; Licensed Practical Nurse, Registered Professional Nurse; Yonkers, NY 10705; Lic. Nos. 263555, 534509; Cal. Nos. 29921, 29922; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 9 month actual suspension, 15 month stayed suspension, 24 months probation, $500 fine.

Occupational Therapy

Cheri Dawn Haven a/k/a Cheri D. Haven; Occupational Therapist; Constantia, NY 13044; Lic. No. 008832; Cal. No. 29520; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $500 fine.

Public Accountancy

Mun Leung Chung; Certified Public Accountant; New York, NY 10002; Lic. No. 076306; Cal. No. 29582; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 2 year stayed suspension, 2 years probation, $2,500 fine.

Social Work

Kacie Leigh Walton; Licensed Master Social Worker; Millerton, PA 16936-9239; Lic. No. 090341; Cal. No. 29480; Application for consent order granted; Penalty agreed upon: 12 month actual suspension, 12 month stayed suspension, 2 years probation to commence upon return to practice in the State of New York.

IV. RESTORATION

The Board of Regents voted on December 12, 2017 to deny the application for restoration of the physician license of Ram S. Makker, Roslyn Heights, NY. Dr. Makker’s license was revoked January 14, 2010.
NYS Board of Regents
Early Childhood Workgroup’s
Blue Ribbon Committee

Final Budget Recommendations

December 2017
Background

In New York, like many states, a student's academic path is significantly impacted by his or her third-grade academic performance. Without the strong start that high-quality early childhood education provides, students who are not proficient in reading by the third grade may never catch up, creating an achievement disparity that increases as they move through the K-12 school system. This finding is most evident for children who are socio-economically in need; children with special needs; children whose first language is other than English; and children who are black, Hispanic or recent immigrants. What is needed is a clear, coherent, and comprehensive strategy to ensure that all of New York State’s children have the fairness of an even start.

The immediate task before the New York State Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup is to prepare a reasoned set of budget recommendations that will be presented to the full Board of Regents for consideration and inclusion in the 2018-19 Budget Request. To accomplish this task, the Workgroup relied on the informed judgment of a Blue Ribbon Committee (BRC), made up of stakeholders representing: researchers, practitioners, policy makers, elected officials, teachers, school administrators, and parents. Representation was not confined to one part of the state; in fact, special efforts were made to ensure a valid and reliable cross section of New York State. We received input from stakeholders with expertise in early care and education from New York State and the nation. Throughout our process, whether at Teachers College in Central Harlem; Nazareth College in a suburb of Rochester; or Mercy College in Westchester County, there was a clear consensus on two facts: quality and investments matter for young children.

Research substantiates that children who attend high-quality early care and education programs are better prepared for kindergarten, have stronger language skills in the first years of elementary school, and are less likely to repeat a grade or drop out of school.\(^1\) High-quality early care and education offers one of the highest returns of any public investment—more than $7 for every dollar spent—by reducing future expenditures on special education, public assistance, and the criminal justice system.\(^2\) Based on this research, the science of brain development and learning, and the Workgroup’s desire to eliminate New York State’s fragmented early care, preschool, and early childhood education, the BRC set out to accomplish its task. Finally, a key priority of the Workgroup was to ensure that deliberations and recommendations were both sensitive and responsive to race, culture, ethnicity, language, citizenship status, and socio-economic status.

Context for the BRC Recommendations:

Emerging from our deliberations was the overarching vision of transforming the birth to age eight early care and education system in the state of New York. We envision a New York where ALL CHILDREN thrive from birth, flourish in preschool, enter the school age program on a trajectory of success, and are academically proficient in third grade by growing up healthy and having opportunities for high-quality early learning experiences that are culturally, linguistically and developmentally appropriate.

---

\(^1\) National Association for the Education of Young Children, Developmental Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood Programs Servicing Children from Birth through Age 8, 2009.

\(^2\) Early Childhood Education. Strategy No. 5 in A Blueprint For Great Schools report from the Transition Advisory Team, California Department of Education August 9, 2011.
Developmentally appropriate practice is informed by what we know from theory and literature about how children develop and learn. For example, all the domains of development and learning—physical, social and emotional, psychological, cognitive and linguistic—are important, and they are inextricably interrelated. A child’s development and learning in one domain are influenced by what takes place in other domains. In addition to domain interrelationships, development and learning requires viewing each child within the cultural context of that child’s family, language spoken, and community, as well as within the broader society. These various contexts, interacting with the domains of development, have a major influence on the developing child. The National Association for the Education of Young Children (2009) identifies the following essential principles of child development and learning that inform practice:

- Children develop best when they have secure, consistent relationships with responsive adults and opportunities for positive relationships with peers;
- Development and learning result from a dynamic and continuous interaction of biological maturation and experience;
- Development and learning proceed at varying rates from child to child, as well as at uneven rates across different areas of a child’s individual functioning;
- Play is an important vehicle for developing self-regulation, as well as for promoting language, cognition, and social competency;
- Development and learning advance when children are challenged to achieve at a level just beyond their current mastery, and when they have many opportunities to practice newly acquired skills;
- Children’s experiences shape their motivation and approaches to learning, such as persistence, initiative, and flexibility; in turn, these dispositions and behaviors affect their learning and development; and
- Development and learning occur in, and are influenced by, multiple social, cultural, and linguistic contexts.

The BRC also concluded that programs and services that support the healthy development of young children cannot be the sole purview of the education system. It is incumbent that state policy makers work across sectors. This concept of shared responsibility is supported by the recent recommendations of New York State’s First 1000 Days on Medicaid, “These are the same kids and families in different systems across time.”

Recommendations

The target of the Blue Ribbon Committee’s recommendations is to transform the birth to age eight early care and education system in the state of New York. To accomplish this task, the Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup has adopted a five-year phased-in approach for education and legislative policies. The priority is to serve children with greatest need and reflect a coordinated effort with other state agencies and initiatives.

The following budget recommendations, which total $37 million for the 2018-19 State Fiscal Year, have been thoughtfully prepared and reflect the constraints of the current fiscal climate. The following budget proposals will begin the process of aligning and integrating our work to ensure that all New

---

3 Developmentally Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood Programs Serving Children from Birth through Age 8. A position statement of the National Association for the Education of Young Children, 2009.
York State’s children experience improved outcomes through access to services that are developmentally appropriate and responsive to culture, race, ethnicity, language, citizenship status, and socioeconomic status.

1. Provide $20M in year one to expand the Prekindergarten Program to approximately 2,000 four-year-old children in 40 school districts, targeting areas of highest need first, and phasing in additional funds over subsequent years until Prekindergarten is fully universal for four-year-old children in New York State. Child seats would be funded at $10,000 per child or double the district’s half-day Universal Prekindergarten allocation, whichever is greater, until an alternate funding method is developed pursuant to a study of the actual costs of quality Prekindergarten programs in New York State.

**Budget Rationale:** During the 2016-17 school year, approximately 120,000 four-year-old children were served in state-administered prekindergarten programs, representing 65% of the State’s eligible four-year-old population. The total number of eligible four-year-old children in New York State is currently 181,500. A $20 million increase in the 2018-19 budget would enable 2,000 more four-year-old children to be served; the overall percentage of students served in New York State would increase to just under 70%. It’s important to note that 30% of the State’s eligible four-year-old children would still not be served. NYSED projects that it would cost a total of $280 million to fully fund those districts that are not currently receiving state-funded prekindergarten dollars. An annual increase of funds for prekindergarten by at least $30 million for each of the next 10 years would bring the overall percentage from its current 65% percent to an estimated 82% of the total four-year-old population in New York State.

2. Provide $300,000 to conduct a cost study to validate the actual cost of a high-quality prekindergarten program for all four-year-old children, with appropriate weightings for areas of economic disadvantage, emergent multilingual learners, and students with disabilities, followed by a similar study for three-year-old children.

**Budget Rationale:** Although New York State currently has several funding structures for prekindergarten programs, a common concern among early childhood stakeholders is that the existing funding methods do not adequately cover the actual cost of operating a high-quality program that is responsive to community and student needs. A request for proposals would be issued to an entity to conduct the cost study.

3. Provide $6M for pilot programs which will target funding to half-day and full-day 10-month and summer inclusion prekindergarten programs for three and four-year-old children. Funds would be blended and layered with existing prekindergarten and preschool special education funding to support classrooms comprised of both preschool students with and without disabilities, which will be subject to a newly developed methodology pursuant to Chapter 59 of the law of 2017.

**Budget Rationale:** In the 2017-18 enacted State budget, NYSED was directed to develop an alternative funding methodology for preschool Special Education Integrated Setting (SCIS) programs. SCIS programs provide specially designed instruction and related services to preschool students with disabilities alongside their peers who do not have disabilities. Due in large part to the separate and inadequate funding structure, there are not enough early childhood programs operating a SCIS model, and many existing SCIS programs do not have sufficient numbers of typically developing peers in their classrooms. The $6M would create a pilot program to target and combine resources needed to serve both student populations in the same
Provide $2M to establish five Early Learning Regional Technical Assistance Centers (TAC) to provide support to early care and educational settings (i.e. in areas that include mental health consultation, training in the use of the Pyramid Model, professional development on implementing high-quality early childhood education, among others). The TACs will develop four content area trainings and a train-the-trainer course for each content area. In addition, the TACs will support school leaders by providing professional development on topics such as differentiation, universal design, and inclusion; multilingual strategies including topics such as linguistically relevant approaches, bilingual education, English as a New Language (ENL) strategies; developmentally appropriate practice including topics such as play-based learning, cultural relevance, and language acquisition; and anti-bias training and trauma-informed care.

Budget Rationale: Currently, 11 professional staff in the Office of Early Learning, located at NYSED in Albany, are responsible for providing technical assistance and monitoring oversight to prekindergarten programs in 471 school districts and thousands of prekindergarten classrooms around the State. The regional TACs are necessary to adequately meet the needs of programs, better respond to local demographics and climates, and coordinate with existing regional support centers for Special Education and Multilingual Learners. In the next budget cycle, NYSED would request an additional $1.5 million to fund three additional TACs, bringing the total number to eight Early Learning Regional TACs around the State.

Provide $2M that is formula-driven (non-competitive) at the statewide, regional, local, and programmatic levels that gives targeted communities the opportunity to self-identify and meet their specific family and community engagement needs. The objective of the funding would be to create program models that weave family and community influence into all levels of the educational system, while reflecting the following values including, but not limited to, cultural responsiveness; family support and engagement; common / wrap-around messaging; attention to trauma and stress; and leaders as weavers. One specific evidenced-based model that could be replicated using these funds involves assigning a family advocate to assist with care beginning at the prenatal stage and continuing with the child and family as necessary through age eight.

Budget Rationale: Allocations will be used to hire family and community engagement coordinators in identified school communities using indicators to direct the funds toward high-need districts. These funds will augment and support mandated Title I allocations for family engagement and other federal and state funds with similar goals. A phased-in approach would be used so that, in subsequent years, additional funds would be available to enhance this strategy by increasing the number of school districts and contributing to the healthy development of children.

Provide $3M to expand the availability of QUALITYstarsNY throughout the state by improving assessment tools and staff support; strengthening the existing system; improving coordination by leveraging all resources available for quality improvement; and expanding the number of programs and classrooms receiving support from QUALITYstarsNY. Currently, funding can only reach a small percentage of early care and education programs, yet the data shows those programs that participate in QUALITYstarsNY have better outcomes for children.

Budget Rationale: Currently, QUALITYstarsNY receives $5M as New York State’s Quality Rating and Improvement System. As of November 2017, QUALITYstarsNY served approximately 736

---

5 http://qualitystarsny.org/discover-landing.php
center-based programs, family-home providers, and public schools in targeted communities. At a cost of $300 per child, an additional $3M will enhance services for approximately 10,000 children and strengthen the existing system, which will improve coordination by leveraging all resources available for quality improvement to programs.

7. Provide $2.5M to adopt and implement a competency-based approach in pre-service teacher preparation programs and in-service professional development for new and existing educators and leaders, ensuring that all teachers are prepared to teach all students, especially as the student population continues to increase in diversity. This funding would be directed at professional development that requires all teachers to be culturally competent, culturally responsive, and linguistically capable.

**Budget Rationale:** In the first year, these funds would be directed to five Institutions of Higher Education (IHE), replicating a model called Quality Universally Inclusive Early Responsive Education. Applicants would receive scholarships to participate in the program aimed at addressing the teacher shortage in Bilingual Special Education and preparing participants to be dually certified Early Childhood and Early Childhood Special Educators. Participants in this program would be expected to teach in New York State for three years upon completion of the program. NYSED recommends a phase-in approach in which additional IHEs would be funded in subsequent years.

8. Provide $500,000 to fund the first step toward the creation of a unified HIPAA and FERPA-compliant data system to meet the needs of children and families by tracking all screening and assessment services to capture and share relevant and useful results with parents, educators, health care organizations and other agencies. The system should include a parent portal where parents can access information about their child’s learning needs and progress. Initial steps include aligning existing data systems where feasible.

**Budget Rationale:** In the first year, NYSED would convene the necessary State agency partners to plan and design a request for proposals to fund three communities to purchase the appropriate data system that captures screening and assessments, and enables referrals across systems. Funds would also be used for training appropriate staff in early care and education settings in the selected communities to use the data system as well information technology staff to assist with the technical components of the proposal.

9. Provide $700,000 as a first step toward the implementation of a comprehensive developmental screening process for all children ages zero to eight that includes vision, hearing, physical and dental health, speech and language skills, fine and gross motor skills, and social, emotional and cognitive development, according to the American Academy of Pediatrics Bright Futures Chart. This developmental screening would help inform whether a child is on track to be ready for Kindergarten. It would also inform teachers’ practice, better support each child’s learning and support child readiness across the State. Every effort will be made to ensure children are screened in the language spoken in the home.

**Budget Rationale:** In the first year, NYSED would convene the necessary state agency partners to identify the comprehensive developmental tool and to design a protocol to be followed by early care and education settings, pediatricians, home visiting programs and parents. Two communities would be selected to participate in a pilot to test the feasibility of implementing the comprehensive developmental screening process.
Next Steps

1. The Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup and Department staff will continue to work with representatives of the Blue Ribbon Committee to finalize a set of recommendations that specifically fall in the areas of education policy and legislative priorities.

2. A final report will be developed in the coming months to be shared with the Blue Ribbon Committee, Board of Regents, and Government Officials.
ATTACHMENT II

New York State Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup’s Blue Ribbon Committee

Recommendations with Fiscal Implications

Presenters:

• Sherry Cleary, Executive Director, NY Early Childhood Professional Development Institute, CUNY Office of Academic Affairs

• Zoila Morell, Ph.D., Associate Professor, Mercy College Educational Leadership Department
The overarching vision of the Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup is to transform the birth to age eight early care and education system in the state of New York.

We envision a New York where ALL CHILDREN thrive from birth, flourish in preschool, enter the school age program on a trajectory of success, and are academically proficient in third grade by growing up healthy and having opportunities for high-quality early learning experiences that are culturally, linguistically, and developmentally appropriate.
The Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup:

- Established the Blue Ribbon Committee, comprised of 65 national and State experts who examined, amended, and addressed education policy as it relates to early childhood education in New York State

- Charged the Committee to provide recommendations to the Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup in the areas of:
  - Budget investments for the 2018 Fiscal Year
  - Educational policy
  - Legislative initiatives

- While today’s focus is on fiscal recommendations, in the coming months, all of the Committee recommendations will be considered for a final set of recommendations that also fall in the areas of education policy and legislative priorities.
Meetings of the Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup’s Blue Ribbon Committee

• September 20, 2017
  o Teachers College, Columbia University, Manhattan, NY
  o Keynote speaker: Dr. Aisha Ray, Professor Emerita of Child Development, Erikson Institute
  o Presentation: “Serving Children from Diverse Cultural, Linguistic and Economic Backgrounds: The Role of Higher Education”

• October 24, 2017
  o Nazareth College, Rochester, NY
  o Keynote speaker: Jeff Kaczorowski, MD, Vice Chair, First 1000 Days on Medicaid Initiative; University of Rochester Medical Center, Department of Pediatrics
  o Presentation: “First 1000 Days on Medicaid”

• November 16, 2017
  o Mercy College, Dobbs Ferry, NY
  o Keynote speaker: Ms. Lorelei Vargas, Deputy Commissioner, Early Care and Education with New York City’s Administration for Children's Services
  o Presentation: “Trauma, Stress and the Brain: Integrating Research to Practice”
Why New York Must Invest in Early Childhood: What We know

Research substantiates that children who attend high-quality early care and education programs are better prepared for kindergarten, have stronger language skills in the first years of elementary school and are less likely to repeat a grade or drop out of school.

National Association for the Education of Young Children, Developmental Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood Programs Servicing Children from Birth through Age 8, 2009.
Why New York Must Invest in Early Childhood: What We know

High-quality early care / education offers one of the highest returns of any public investment—more than $7 for every dollar spent—by reducing future expenditures on special education, public assistance, and the criminal justice system.

Early Childhood Education. Strategy No. 5 in A Blueprint For Great Schools report from the Transition Advisory Team, California Department of Education August 9, 2011.
New York State Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup’s Blue Ribbon Committee

The Regents Early Childhood Workgroup’s Blue Ribbon Committee’s role was to provide input and make recommendations to the Board of Regents that will help advance a policy agenda for New York State specifically in the areas of Educational Policy, Legislative Policy and Budget.

Priority Areas:

1. Age Appropriate Standards, Curriculum, and Assessment
2. Comprehensive Family and Community Engagement
3. Comprehensive and Coordinated Support Srvcs That Support a Full Range of Developmental Pathways Among All Early Childhood Service Providers
4. Recruitment, Preparation and Professional Development of High Quality Teachers and Leaders Across All Programs
5. Sustained and Coordinated Funding Structure
6. Coherent and Comprehensive Early Childhood Policy
7. High Quality Instructional Programs and Services
8. Quality, Evaluation, and Accountability

Big Picture Thinking

Goals | Issues/Concerns | Solutions | Draft Recommendations

Final Recommendations

Budget Proposal | Education Policy | Legislative Proposal
Final Budget Recommendations

The following nine budget recommendations, which total $37 million for the 2018-19 State Fiscal Year, have been thoughtfully prepared and reflect the established priorities and the recently announced constraints of the current fiscal climate.

These budget proposals will strengthen the process of aligning and integrating our work to ensure that all New York State’s children experience improved outcomes through access to services that are developmentally appropriate and responsive to culture, race, ethnicity, language, citizenship status, and socioeconomic status.
1. Provide $20M in year one to expand the Prekindergarten Program to approximately 2,000 four-year-olds in 40 school districts, targeting areas of highest need first, and phasing-in additional funds over subsequent years until Prekindergarten is fully universal for four-year olds in New York State.

Recommended by groups P1, P3, and P5
Final Budget Recommendations

2. Provide $300,000 to conduct a cost study to validate the actual cost of a high-quality prekindergarten program for all four-year-old children, with appropriate weightings for areas of economic disadvantage, emergent multilingual learners, and students with disabilities, followed by a similar study for three-year-old children.

Recommended by P5
3. Provide $6M for pilot programs which will target funding to half-day and full-day 10-month and summer inclusion prekindergarten programs for three- and four-year-old children. Funds would be blended and layered with existing prekindergarten and preschool special education funding to support classrooms comprised of both preschool students with and without disabilities. Recommended by group P5
Final Budget Recommendations

4. Provide $2M to establish five Early Learning Regional Technical Assistance Centers (TAC) to provide support to early care and education settings in areas that include, but are not limited to, mental health consultation, training in the use of the Pyramid Model, and professional development on implementing high-quality early childhood education including: multilingual strategies, play-based learning, cultural relevance, language acquisition, anti-bias training, and trauma-informed care.

Recommended by group P1, P3, P5, and P7
Final Budget Recommendations

5. Provide $2M that is formula-driven (non-competitive) at the statewide, regional, local, and programmatic levels that gives targeted communities the opportunity to self-identify and meet their specific family and community engagement needs. The objective of the funding would be to create program models that weave family and community influence into all levels of the educational system, while reflecting values including, but not limited to, cultural responsiveness; family support and engagement; and attention to trauma and stress. One specific evidenced-based model that could be replicated using these funds involves assigning a family advocate to assist with care beginning at the prenatal stage and continuing with the child and family as necessary through age eight.

Recommended by group P2 and P3
6. Provide $3M to expand the availability of QUALITYstarsNY throughout the state by improving assessment tools and staff support, strengthening the existing system; improving coordination by leveraging all resources available for quality improvement; and expanding the number of programs and classrooms receiving support from QUALITYstarsNY. Currently, funding can only reach a small percentage of early care and education programs, yet the data shows those programs that participate in QUALITYstarsNY have better outcomes for children.

Recommended by group P8
7. Provide $2.5M to adopt and implement a competency-based approach in pre-service teacher preparation programs and in-service professional development for new and existing educators and leaders, ensuring that all teachers are prepared to teach all students, especially as the student population continues to increase in diversity. This funding would be directed at professional development that requires all teachers to be culturally competent, culturally responsive, and linguistically capable.

Recommended by groups P1 and P4
8. Provide $500,000 to fund the first step toward the creation of a unified HIPAA and FERPA-compliant data system to meet the needs of children and families by tracking all screening and assessment services to capture and share relevant and useful results with parents, educators, health care organizations and other agencies. The system should include a parent portal where parents can access information about their child’s learning needs and progress. Initial steps include aligning existing data systems where feasible.

Recommended by groups P3, P5, P6 and P8 and is supported by the First 1,000 Days on Medicaid Workgroup
9. Provide $700,000 as a first step toward the implementation of a comprehensive developmental screening process for all children ages zero to eight that includes vision, hearing, physical and dental health, speech and language skills, fine and gross motor skills, and social, emotional and cognitive development, according to the American Academy of Pediatrics Bright Futures Chart. This developmental screening would help inform whether a child is on track to be ready for Kindergarten. It would also inform teachers’ practice, better support each child’s learning and support child readiness across the State. Every effort will be made to ensure children are screened in the language spoken in the home.

Recommended by groups P3, P6, P7 and P8 and is supported by the First 1,000 Days on Medicaid Workgroup
## 2018 Budget Recommendation Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expand Prekindergarten</td>
<td>$20,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost Study</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion Pilot</td>
<td>$6,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Five Early Learning Technical Assistance Centers</td>
<td>$2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family and Community Engagement</td>
<td>$2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUALITYstarsNY</td>
<td>$3,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Preparation</td>
<td>$2,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Childhood Data System</td>
<td>$500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive Developmental Screening</td>
<td>$700,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>$37,000,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next Steps

1. The Department staff will continue to work with representatives of the Blue Ribbon Committee and the Board of Regents Early Childhood Workgroup to finalize the set of recommendations that specifically fall in the areas of education policy and legislative priorities.

2. A final report will be developed in the coming months to be shared with the Blue Ribbon Committee, Board of Regents, and Government Officials.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization/Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. LaRue Allen</td>
<td>New York University Steinhardt School of Culture, Education and Human Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Jeanne Alter</td>
<td>Kennedy Child Study Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Zakiyah Ansari</td>
<td>Alliance for Quality Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. W. Steven Barnett</td>
<td>National Institute for Early Education Research at Rutgers University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Carol Bumbolow</td>
<td>New York State Association of School Nurses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Eddy Bayardelle</td>
<td>Bronx Community College Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. April Bedford</td>
<td>Brooklyn College School of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Jamaal Bowman</td>
<td>NYC Department of Education Bronx District #11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Ellen Burns</td>
<td>Capital District/ North Country Early Childhood Direction Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Kelvin Chan</td>
<td>NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene Bureau of Childcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Sherry Cleary</td>
<td>CUNY Early Childhood Professional Development Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Pedro Cordero</td>
<td>Office of Head Start, Region II-Training and Technical Assistance Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Deborah Cunningham</td>
<td>New York State Association of School Business Officials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Charles Dedrick</td>
<td>New York State Council of School Superintendents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Felicia DeHaney</td>
<td>W.K. Kellogg Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Evelyn DeJesus</td>
<td>United Federation of Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Libby Doggett</td>
<td>United States Education Department, Office of Early Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Stephanie Dudley-Tillman</td>
<td>Kaleida Health: Women and Children's Hospital of Buffalo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Thelma Dye</td>
<td>Northside Center for Child Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Ronald Ferguson</td>
<td>Harvard Kennedy School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Helen Frazier</td>
<td>CUNY Early Childhood Professional Development Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Ola Friday</td>
<td>Massachusetts Department for Early Education and Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Cindy Gallagher</td>
<td>School Administrators Association of New York State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Denise Gomber</td>
<td>Ithaca City School District</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Blue Ribbon Committee Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title and Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Dianne Gounardes</td>
<td>NYC Department of Education Brooklyn District #20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Melvin J. Gravely</td>
<td>The Gravely Group - Head Start Training and Consulting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Thomas Hamel</td>
<td>Cerebral Palsy Associations of New York State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Dirk Hightower</td>
<td>The Children’s Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Betty Holcomb</td>
<td>Center for Children's Initiatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Sarah Hughes</td>
<td>Northeast Comprehensive Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Michael Hynes</td>
<td>Patchogue-Medford School District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff Kaczorowski, MD</td>
<td>New York State Department of Health Medicaid First 1000 Days Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Kristen Kerr</td>
<td>New York State Association for the Education of Young Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Timothy Kremer</td>
<td>New York State School Boards Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Marina Marcou-O'Malley</td>
<td>Alliance for Quality Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Maryann Marrapodi</td>
<td>Hispanic Information &amp; Telecommunications Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Eloise Massineo</td>
<td>Executive Leadership Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Janice Molnar</td>
<td>New York State Office of Children and Family Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Zolia Morell</td>
<td>Mercy College School of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Margo Nish</td>
<td>Syracuse City School District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Jenn O'Connor</td>
<td>Prevent Child Abuse New York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Andrew Palumbo</td>
<td>Jamesville-DeWitt Central School District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Patricia Persell</td>
<td>Council on Children and Families</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Dana Platin</td>
<td>New York State Parent Teacher Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Rita Prats-Rodriguez</td>
<td>East Harlem Bilingual Head Start</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Christabel Quigley</td>
<td>New York City Department of Education Brooklyn District #22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Courtney Rajwani</td>
<td>New York City Department of Education Division of Early Childhood Education and Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Aisha Ray</td>
<td>Erikson Institute</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Blue Ribbon Committee Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization/Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Jennifer Rojas</td>
<td>Child Care Council of Suffolk, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Jorge Saenz De Viteri</td>
<td>Region II Office of Head Start Training and Technical Assistance Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Susan Slade</td>
<td>New York State Department of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Jayne M. Smith</td>
<td>Jewish Community Center of Staten Island</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Mariana Souto-Manning</td>
<td>Teachers College, Columbia University Early Childhood Education Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Ellen Sullivan</td>
<td>New York State United Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Bianca Tanis</td>
<td>Ramapo Central School District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Christopher Treiber</td>
<td>Interagency Council of Developmental Disabilities Agencies, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Lorelei Vargas</td>
<td>New York City Administration for Children's Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Adriana Villavicencio</td>
<td>New York University Steinhardt - The Research Alliance for New York City Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Stephen Wadowski</td>
<td>State University of New York Downstate Medical Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Jitinder Walia</td>
<td>Bronx Community College Early Childhood Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Josh Wallack</td>
<td>New York City Department of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Albert Wat</td>
<td>Alliance for Early Success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Anne Williams-Isom</td>
<td>Harlem Children’s Zone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assemblymember Tremaine Wright</td>
<td>District 56, New York State Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Sheena Wright</td>
<td>United Way of New York City</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THANK YOU
Remarks from the State Aid Sub-Committee Co-Chairs to the Board of Regents Prior to Their Vote on the 2018–19 Regents State Aid Proposal

Beverly L. Ouderkirk, Co-Chair, State Aid Subcommittee:

Our Journey

Upon accepting our appointment as co-chairs of the Regents’ State Aid Subcommittee, Regent Nan Mead and I, determined that we shared a desire: that was to leave our mark on Education in NYS for its most valuable assets, its children.

We wished to carve a new path that recognizes the many needs of those students: mental health needs, issues of bullying, poverty, early childhood, English Language Learners, students with special needs, additional CTE opportunities and much more.

We chose to apply our diverse skills in reaching out to others, developing and nurturing relationships, listening intently, seeking input, and focusing on collaboration.

We recognized the importance of applying sensitivity to the growing needs of the diverse population of New York, its children and its communities as well as the immense and changing fiscal and still unknown challenges we are facing on both sides of Washington Avenue here in Albany.

From our many meetings with the leadership of numerous state level educational organizations to meetings with teachers and administrators across the state to exchanges with the Senate and Assembly Education Committee Chairs to our subcommittee colleagues and full BOR dialogue to the support and suggestions of our respected SED staff, our network and the richness of the collective brain grew and priorities clearly emerged.

Like the young girls, from the World of Inquiry School in Rochester in yesterday’s videos said, we could not have created this State Aid Budget Proposal and Legislative Priorities agenda without the valuable contributions of all of you. A sincere thank you! I/we look forward to the next steps in this process – hoping for continued collaboration and efforts to work together with the Governor and the Legislature.

Nan Eileen Mead , Co-Chair, State Aid Subcommittee:

Regent Ouderkirk and I spent many months meeting with our various partners, both internal and external, and we are grateful to all of them. Recognizing throughout that we are faced with a challenging fiscal environment both at the
federal level as well as at the state level, we are pleased to put forth what we think represents the best ideas and focuses on our highest priorities based on feedback from our stakeholders. We thank you for this opportunity.